

Wayverb: A Graphical Tool for Hybrid Modelling Auralisation

**A thesis submitted to the University of Huddersfield in partial fulfilment of
the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts**

Matthew Reuben Thomas

January 2017

This is the abstract.

Contents

Acknowledgements	4
Introduction	5
1 Context	6
Acoustics Simulation Techniques	6
Overview	6
Characteristics of Simulation Methods	7
Existing Software	8
2 Image-source	9
3 Ray Tracer	10
4 Waveguide	11
5 Microphone Modelling	12
6 Boundary Modelling	13
7 Evaluation	14
8 The Future	15
References	16

Acknowledgements

This research was supported by the Creative Coding Lab at the University of Huddersfield.

I would like to thank my supervisor, Alexander Harker (PhD, Lecturer), for his invaluable input and patience.

Introduction

The aim of impulse response synthesis is to simulate the reverberant properties of a space without having to physically build anything. This is useful for a variety of applications: architects need to be able to evaluate the acoustics of a building before construction begins, sound editors for film sometimes need to mix in recordings which were not made on location, electronic musicians like to conjure imaginary or impossible spaces in their music, and virtual-reality experiences must use audio cues to convince the user that they have been transported to a new environment.

Unfortunately, software allowing accurate binaural impulse responses to be synthesised is not currently widely available. Often, software produced for research purposes is never made public. Such software that *is* available generally suffers from one or more of an array of issues.

Most software relies only on fast geometric methods, which are inaccurate, especially at low frequencies. Conversely, programs opting to use more accurate wave-modelling methods require long time periods, on the order of days, or significant computing power to run.

Licensing is also an problem. Most room-acoustics packages are the product of years of combined research by multiple contributors, which is only made viable by releasing the software commercially. However, this inhibits further research, as the code is not freely available. This model also limits users to those able to pay, restricting widespread adoption.

When software is made available freely, often the user experience suffers. Code requires manual compilation, or can only be run from a textual interface, or the project is outdated and unmaintained.

The Wayverb project provides a solution to these problems, by making available a graphical tool for impulse response synthesis. It combines several simulation techniques, providing an adjustable balance between speed and accuracy. It is also free to download, can be run immediately on commodity hardware, and the source code can be used and extended under the terms of the GNU GPL license.

This thesis will begin by examining common methods of room simulation and the software which implements these methods, explaining why particular techniques were chosen for Wayverb. Then, each of the chosen techniques will be explored in depth, along with a description of their implementation. The procedure for producing a single impulse response from the outputs of multiple modelling techniques will be detailed. Two extensions to the basic room acoustics model will be described, namely frequency-dependent reflections at boundaries, and microphone/head-related transfer function (HRTF) simulation. The project will be evaluated, and finally, avenues for future development will be examined.

1 Context

Acoustics Simulation Techniques

Overview

Room acoustics algorithms fall into two main categories: *geometric*, and *wave-based* (A. Southern, Siltanen, & Savioja, 2011). Wave-based methods aim to numerically solve the wave equation, simulating the actual behaviour of sound waves within an enclosure. Geometric methods instead make some simplifying assumptions about the behaviour of sound waves, which result in faster but less accurate simulations. These assumptions generally ignore all wave properties of sound, choosing to model sound as independent *rays*, *particles*, or *phonons*.

The modelling of waves as particles has found great success in the field of computer graphics, where *ray-tracing* is used to simulate the reflections of light in a scene. The technique works well here because of the relatively high frequencies of the modelled waves. The wavelengths of these waves - the wavelengths of the visible spectrum - will generally be many times smaller than any surface in the scene being rendered, so wave phenomena have little or no effect.

The assumption that rays and waves are interchangeable falls down somewhat when modelling sound. Here, the wavelengths range from 17m to 0.017m for the frequency range 20Hz to 20KHz, so while the simulation may be accurate at high frequencies, at low frequencies the wavelength is of the same order as the wall surfaces in the scene. Failure to take wave effects such as interference and diffraction into account at these frequencies therefore results in noticeable approximation error (Savioja & Svensson, 2015).

In many cases, some inaccuracy is an acceptable (or even necessary) trade-off. Wave-modelling is so computationally expensive that using it to simulate a large scene over a broad spectrum could take weeks on consumer hardware. This leaves geometric methods as the only viable alternative. Though wave-modelling been studied for some time (Smith, 1992), and even applied to small acoustic simulations in consumer devices (such as the Yamaha VL1 keyboard), it is only recently, as computers have become more powerful, that these techniques have been seriously considered for room acoustics simulation.

Given that wave-based methods are accurate, but become more expensive at higher frequencies, and that geometric methods are inexpensive, but become less accurate at lower frequencies, it is natural to combine the two models in a way that takes advantage of the desirable characteristics of each. That is, by using wave-modelling for low-frequency content, and geometric methods for high-frequency content, simulations may be produced which are accurate across the entire spectrum, without incurring massive computational costs.

Characteristics of Simulation Methods

A short review of simulation methods will be given here. For a detailed survey of methods used in room acoustics, see P. Svensson & Kristiansen (2002).

TODO a diagram giving a nice overview.

Geometric

Geometric methods can largely be grouped into two categories: *stochastic* and *deterministic*.

Stochastic methods are generally based on statistical approximation via some kind of Monte Carlo algorithm. They may be based directly on reflection paths, using *ray tracing* or *beam tracing*, in which rays or beams are considered to transport acoustic energy around the scene. Alternatively, they may use a surface-based technique, such as *acoustic radiance transfer*, in which surfaces are used as intermediate stores of acoustic energy.

These techniques are inherently approximate. They aim to randomly probe the problem space repeatedly, combining the results from several samples so that they converge upon the impulse response for a scene. They can be tuned easily, as quality can be traded-off against speed simply by adjusting the number of samples taken. Surface-based methods, especially, are suited to real-time, as the calculation occurs in several passes, only the last of which involves the receiver object. This means that early passes can be computed and cached, and only the final pass must be recomputed if the receiver position changes.

The main deterministic method is the *image source* method, which is designed to calculate the exact reflection paths between a source and a receiver. For shoebox-shaped rooms, and perfectly rigid surfaces, it is able to produce an exact solution to the wave equation. However, by its nature, it can only model specular (perfect) reflections, ignoring diffuse and diffracted components. For this reason, it is inexact for arbitrary enclosures, and unsuitable for calculating reverb tails, which are predominantly diffuse. The technique also becomes very expensive beyond low orders of reflection. The naive implementation reflects the sound source against all surfaces in the scene, resulting in a set of *image sources*. Then, each of these image sources is itself reflected against all surfaces. For high orders of reflection, the required number of calculations quickly becomes impractical. For these reasons, the image source method is only suitable for early reflections, and is generally combined with a stochastic method to find the late part of an impulse response.

For a thorough exploration of geometric methods please refer to Savioja & Svensson (2015).

Wave-based

Wave-based methods may be derived from the *Finite Element Method* (FEM), *Boundary Element Method* (BEM) or *Finite-Difference Time-Domain* (FDTD) method. Of these, the FEM and BEM operate in the frequency domain, while the FDTD operates directly in the time domain, as its name suggests.

Existing Software

Room acoustics simulation is not a new topic of research. The first documented method for estimating a room impulse response was put forward in (Krokstad, Strom, & Sørsdal, 1968), which describes a geometric method based on ray tracing.

TODO Since then...

Searching online uncovers a handful of programs for acoustic simulation:

Name	Type	Availability
Odeon (“Odeon,” 2016)	Geometric	Commercial
CATT-Acoustic (“CATT-Acoustic,” 2016)	Geometric	Commercial
Olive Tree Lab (“OTL,” 2016)	Geometric	Commercial
EASE (“EASE,” 2016)	Geometric	Commercial
Auratorium (“Audioborn – Auratorium,” 2016)	Geometric	Commercial
RAVEN (Schröder & Vorländer, 2011)	Geometric	None
RoomWeaver (M. J. Beeson & Murphy, 2004)	Waveguide	None
EAR (“Ear,” 2016)	Geometric	Free
PachydermAcoustic (“Pachyderm Acoustic,” 2016)	Geometric	Free
Parallel FDTD (“ParallelFDTD,” 2016)	Waveguide	Free
i-Simpa (“I-Simpa,” 2016)	Geometric, extensible	Free

2 Image-source

Coming soon.

3 Ray Tracer

Coming soon.

4 Waveguide

Coming soon.

5 Microphone Modelling

Coming soon.

6 Boundary Modelling

Coming soon.

7 Evaluation

Coming soon.

8 The Future

Coming soon.

References

This list contains all items cited in the text. It also contains some items not directly mentioned, but which nonetheless guided the development of the project, or might shape its future.

-
- Allard, J.-F., & Champoux, Y. (1992). New empirical equations for sound propagation in rigid frame fibrous materials. *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 91(6), 3346–3353. Retrieved from <http://scitation.aip.org/content/asa/journal/jasa/91/6/10.1121/1.402824>
- Allen, J. B., & Berkley, D. A. (1979). Image method for efficiently simulating small-room acoustics. *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 65(4), 943–950. Retrieved from <http://scitation.aip.org/content/asa/journal/jasa/65/4/10.1121/1.382599>
- Alpkocak, A., & Sis, M. (2010). Computing impulse response of room acoustics using the ray-tracing method in time domain. *Archives of Acoustics*, 35(4), 505–519. Retrieved from <http://www.degruyter.com/view/j/aoa.2010.35.issue-4/v10168-010-0039-8/v10168-010-0039-8.xml>
- Amanatides, J., Woo, A., & others. (1987). A fast voxel traversal algorithm for ray tracing. In *Eurographics* (Vol. 87, pp. 3–10). Retrieved from <http://www.cse.chalmers.se/edu/year/2015/course/TDA361/grid.pdf>
- Antoni, J. (2010). Orthogonal-like fractional-octave-band filters. *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 127(2), 884–895. Retrieved from <http://scitation.aip.org/content/asa/journal/jasa/127/2/10.1121/1.3273888>
- Aretz, M., Nöthen, R., Vorländer, M., & Schröder, D. (2009). Combined broadband impulse responses using FEM and hybrid ray-based methods. In *EAA Symposium on Auralization*. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Dirk_Schroeder/publication/258098666_Combined_Broadband_Impulse_Responses_Using_FEM_and_Hybrid_Ray-Based_Methods/links/54fd4d800cf2c3f52424436f.pdf
- Audioborn. (2016). Retrieved from <http://www.audioborn.com>
- Bass, H. E., Bauer, H.-J., & Evans, L. B. (1972). Atmospheric absorption of sound: Analytical expressions. *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 52(3B), 821–825. Retrieved from <http://scitation.aip.org/content/asa/journal/jasa/52/3B/>

- Beeson, M. J., & Murphy, D. T. (2004). RoomWeaver: A digital waveguide mesh based room acoustics research tool. In *Proc. COST G6 Conf. Digital Audio Effects (Naples, Italy, October 2004)* (pp. 268–73). Retrieved from http://www.mirlab.org/conference_papers/International_Conference/DAFx%202004/Proc/P_268.pdf
- Bertram, M., Deines, E., Mohring, J., Jegorovs, J., & Hagen, H. (2005). Phonon tracing for auralization and visualization of sound. In *VIS 05. IEEE Visualization, 2005.* (pp. 151–158). IEEE. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=1532790
- Bilbao, S. (2009). Grid Functions and Finite Difference Operators in 2D. In *Numerical Sound Synthesis* (pp. 287–304). John Wiley & Sons, Ltd. Retrieved from <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/9780470749012.ch10/summary>
- Bilbao, S. (2013). Modeling of complex geometries and boundary conditions in finite difference/finite volume time domain room acoustics simulation. *IEEE Transactions on Audio, Speech, and Language Processing*, 21(7), 1524–1533. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=6494263
- Borish, J. (1984). Extension of the image model to arbitrary polyhedra. *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 75(6), 1827–1836. Retrieved from <http://scitation.aip.org/content/asa/journal/jasa/75/6/10.1121/1.390983>
- Campos, G. R., & Howard, D. M. (2005). On the computational efficiency of different waveguide mesh topologies for room acoustic simulation. *IEEE Transactions on Speech and Audio Processing*, 13(5), 1063–1072. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=1495487
- Campos, G., & Howard, D. (2000). A parallel 3D digital waveguide mesh model with tetrahedral topology for room acoustic simulation. In *Proceedings of the COST G-6 Conference on Digital Audio Effects (DAFx), (Verona, Italy)* (pp. 73–78). Retrieved from ftp://nic.funet.fi/pub/sci/audio/dafx/2000/profs.sci.univr.it/%257Edafx/Final-Papers/pdf/Campos_g_DAFx.pdf
- CATT-Acoustic. (2016). Retrieved from <http://www.catt.se/>
- Christensen, C. L., & Rindel, J. H. (2005). A new scattering method that combines roughness and diffraction effects. In *Forum Acousticum, Budapest, Hungary.* Retrieved from http://www.cs.yorku.ca/course_archive/2005-06/W/6335/feb20/CLC%20fa2005.pdf
- Deines, E., Bertram, M., Mohring, J., Jegorovs, J., Michel, F., Hagen, H., & Nielson, G. M. (2006). Comparative visualization for wave-based and geometric acoustics. *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics*, 12(5), 1173–1180.

Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=4015479

- Delany, M. E., & Bazley, E. N. (1970). Acoustical properties of fibrous absorbent materials. *Applied Acoustics*, 3(2), 105–116. Retrieved from <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/0003682X70900319>
- Dimitrijevic, B., Nikolic, B., Aleksic, S., & Raicevic, N. (2015). Optimization of Excitation in FDTD Method and Corresponding Source Modeling. *RADIOENGINEERING*, 24(1), 11. Retrieved from https://dspace.vutbr.cz/bitstream/handle/11012/38723/15_01_0010_0016.pdf?sequence=1
- Durany, J., Mateos, T., & Garriga, A. (2015). Analytical Computation of Acoustic Bidirectional Reflectance Distribution Functions. *Open Journal of Acoustics*, 5(04), 207. Retrieved from <http://www.scirp.org/journal/PaperInformation.aspx?paperID=62211>
- Ear. (2016). *GitHub*. Retrieved from <https://github.com/aothms/ear>
- EASE. (2016). Retrieved from <http://ease.afmg.eu/index.php/features.html>
- Escolano-Carrasco, J., & Jacobsen, F. (2006). A physical interpretation of frequency dependent boundary conditions in a digital waveguide mesh. In *Proceedings of Thirteenth International Congress on Sound and Vibration*. Retrieved from <http://www.forskningsdatabasen.dk/en/catalog/108083221>
- Fontana, F., & Rocchesso, D. (2001). Signal-theoretic characterization of waveguide mesh geometries for models of two-dimensional wave propagation in elastic media. *IEEE Transactions on Speech and Audio Processing*, 9(2), 152–161. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=902281
- Foteinou, A., Van Mourik, J., Oxnard, S., & Murphy, D. (2014). Hybrid Acoustic Modelling of Historic Spaces Using Blender. In *Forum Acusticum*. Retrieved from <http://wlv.openrepository.com/wlv/handle/2436/605729>
- Fu, Z.-h., & Li, J.-w. (2016). GPU-based image method for room impulse response calculation. *Multimedia Tools and Applications*, 1–17. Retrieved from <http://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11042-015-2943-4>
- Funkhouser, T., Carlbom, I., Elko, G., Pingali, G., Sondhi, M., & West, J. (1998). A beam tracing approach to acoustic modeling for interactive virtual environments. In *Proceedings of the 25th annual conference on Computer graphics and interactive techniques* (pp. 21–32). ACM. Retrieved from <http://dl.acm.org/citation.cfm?id=280818>
- Furse, C. M., Roper, D. H., Buechler, D. N., Christensen, D. A., & Durney, C. H. (2000). The problem and treatment of DC offsets in FDTD simulations. *IEEE Transactions on Antennas and Propagation*, 48(8), 1198–1201. Retrieved from

http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=884487

- Gedney, S. D. (2011). Introduction to the finite-difference time-domain (FDTD) method for electromagnetics. *Synthesis Lectures on Computational Electromagnetics*, 6(1), 1–250. Retrieved from <http://www.morganclaypool.com/doi/abs/10.2200/S00316ED1V01Y201012CEM027>
- Gorzel, M., Kearney, G., Boland, F., & Rice, H. (2010). Virtual acoustic recording: An interactive approach. In *Proc. of the 13th international conference on Digital Audio Effects (DAFX)*. Graz, Austria. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Marcin_Gorzel/publication/228998533_Virtual_acoustic_recording_an_interactive_approach/links/09e4150742ba370bbf000000.pdf
- Hacihabiboglu, H., Gunel, B., & Kondo, A. M. (2008). On the accuracy of first-order numerical derivatives in multidimensional digital waveguide mesh topologies. *IEEE Signal Processing Letters*, 15, 9–12. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=4418392
- Hacihabiboglu, H., Gunel, B., & Kondo, A. M. (2008). Time-domain simulation of directive sources in 3-D digital waveguide mesh-based acoustical models. *IEEE Transactions on Audio, Speech, and Language Processing*, 16(5), 934–946. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=4494749
- Hacihabiboglu, H., Günel, B., & Cvetkovic, Z. (2010). Simulation of directional microphones in digital waveguide mesh-based models of room acoustics. *IEEE Trans. on Audio, Speech and Language Process*, 18(2), 213–223. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Huseyin_Hacihabiboglu/publication/224504323_Simulation_of_Directional_Microphones_in_Digital_Waveguide_Mesh-Based_Models_of_Room_Acoustics/links/0c960519e803aee931000000.pdf
- Hadi, M. F., & Almutairi, N. B. (2010). Discrete finite-difference time domain impulse response filters for transparent field source implementations. *IET Microwaves, Antennas & Propagation*, 4(3), 381–389. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=5430362
- Hamilton, B. (2013). Sampling and Reconstruction on a Diamond Grid and the Tetrahedral Digital Waveguide Mesh. *IEEE Signal Processing Letters*, 10(20), 925–928. Retrieved from <https://www.infona.pl/resource/bwmeta1.element.ieee-art-000006558503>
- Heinz, R. (1993). Binaural room simulation based on an image source model with addition of statistical methods to include the diffuse sound scattering of walls and to predict the reverberant tail. *Applied Acoustics*, 38(2), 145–159. Retrieved from <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/0003682X9390048B>
- Howarth, M. J. (1998). *The application of advanced computer models to the prediction of sound in enclosed spaces* (PhD thesis). University of Salford. Retrieved from

<http://usir.salford.ac.uk/id/eprint/14677>

- Huopaniemi, J., Savioja, L., & Karjalainen, M. (1997). Modeling of reflections and air absorption in acoustical spaces: A digital filter design approach. In *IEEE Workshop on Applications of Signal Processing to Audio and Acoustics* (pp. 19–22). Citeseer. Retrieved from <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.41.3912&rep=rep1&type=pdf>
- I-Simpa. (2016). *I-Simpa*. Retrieved from <http://i-simpa.ifsttar.fr/>
- Jeong, H., & Lam, Y. W. (2012). Source implementation to eliminate low-frequency artifacts in finite difference time domain room acoustic simulation. *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 131(1), 258–268. Retrieved from <http://scitation.aip.org/content/asa/journal/jasa/131/1/10.1121/1.3652886>
- Karjalainen, M., & Erkut, C. (2004). Digital waveguides versus finite difference structures: Equivalence and mixed modeling. *EURASIP Journal on Applied Signal Processing*, 2004, 978–989. Retrieved from <http://dl.acm.org/citation.cfm?id=1289420>
- Kelloniemi, A. (2006). Frequency-dependent boundary condition for the 3-D digital waveguide mesh. In *Proc. Int. Conf. Digital Audio Effects (DAFx'06)* (pp. 161–164). Citeseer. Retrieved from <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.440.3197&rep=rep1&type=pdf#page=171>
- Kim, M., & Scavone, G. P. (2009). Domain decomposition method for the digital waveguide mesh. In *2009 IEEE Workshop on Applications of Signal Processing to Audio and Acoustics* (pp. 21–24). IEEE. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=5346457
- Koutsouris, G. I., Brunskog, J., Jeong, C.-H., & Jacobsen, F. (2013). Combination of acoustical radiosity and the image source method. *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 133(6), 3963–3974. Retrieved from <http://scitation.aip.org/content/asa/journal/jasa/133/6/10.1121/1.4802897>
- Kowalczyk, K., & Walstijn, M. van. (2008a). Modeling frequency-dependent boundaries as digital impedance filters in FDTD and K-DWM room acoustics simulations. *Journal of the Audio Engineering Society*, 56(7/8), 569–583. Retrieved from <http://www.aes.org/e-lib/browse.cfm?elib=14401>
- Kowalczyk, K., & Walstijn, M. van. (2008b). Modelling Frequency-Dependent Boundaries as Digital Impedance Filters in FDTD Room Acoustic Simulations. In *Audio Engineering Society Convention 124*. Audio Engineering Society. Retrieved from <http://www.aes.org/e-lib/browse.cfm?conv=124&papernum=7430>
- Kowalczyk, K., & Walstijn, M. van. (2011). Room acoustics simulation using 3-D compact explicit FDTD schemes. *IEEE Transactions on Audio, Speech, and Language Processing*, 19(1), 34–46. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all

jsp?arnumber=5440917

- Krokstad, A., Strom, S., & Sørsdal, S. (1968). Calculating the acoustical room response by the use of a ray tracing technique. *Journal of Sound and Vibration*, 8(1), 118–125. Retrieved from <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/0022460X68901983>
- Kuttruff, H. (2009). *Room Acoustics, Fifth Edition*. CRC Press.
- Lafortune, E. P., Foo, S.-C., Torrance, K. E., & Greenberg, D. P. (1997). Non-linear approximation of reflectance functions. In *Proceedings of the 24th annual conference on Computer graphics and interactive techniques* (pp. 117–126). ACM Press/Addison-Wesley Publishing Co. Retrieved from <http://dl.acm.org/citation.cfm?id=258801>
- Lehmann, E. A., & Johansson, A. M. (2008). Prediction of energy decay in room impulse responses simulated with an image-source model. *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 124(1), 269–277. Retrieved from <http://scitation.aip.org/content/asa/journal/jasa/124/1/10.1121/1.2936367>
- Levy, E. C. (1959). Complex-curve fitting. *IRE Transactions on Automatic Control*, (1), 37–43. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=6429401
- Marbjerg, G., Brunskog, J., Jeong, C.-H., & Nilsson, E. (2015). Development and validation of a combined phased acoustical radiosity and image source model for predicting sound fields in rooms. *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 138(3), 1457–1468. Retrieved from <http://scitation.aip.org/content/asa/journal/jasa/138/3/10.1121/1.4928297>
- McGovern, S. (2011). The image-source reverberation model in an N-dimensional space. In *Proc. 14th Int. Conf. Digital Audio Effects, Paris, France* (pp. 11–18). Retrieved from http://recherche.ircam.fr/pub/dafx11/Papers/17_e.pdf
- Miklavcic, S. J., & Ericsson, J. (2004). *Practical implementation of the 3D tetrahedral TLM method and visualization of room acoustics*. Department of Science; Technology (ITN), Campus Norrköping, Linköping University [Institutionen för teknik och naturvetenskap (ITN), Campus Norrköping, Linköpings universitet]. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Stanley_Miklavcic/publication/268338847_PRACTICAL_IMPLEMENTATION_OF_THE_3D_TETRAHEDRAL_TLM_METHOD_AND_VISUALIZATION_OF_ROOM_ACOUSTICS/links/547411fe0cf245eb436dbd7e.pdf
- Mouchtaris, A., Narayanan, S. S., & Kyriakakis, C. (2002). Efficient multichannel audio resynthesis by subband-based spectral conversion. In *Signal Processing Conference, 2002 11th European* (pp. 1–4). IEEE. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=7072210
- Murphy, D. T., & Beeson, M. (2007). The KW-boundary hybrid digital waveguide mesh for room acoustics applications. *IEEE Transactions on Audio, Speech, and Language*

- Processing*, 15(2), 552–564. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=4067045
- Murphy, D. T., & Howard, D. M. (2000). *Digital waveguide mesh topologies in room acoustics modelling* (PhD thesis). Citeseer. Retrieved from <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.723.1750&rep=rep1&type=pdf>
- Murphy, D. T., & Mullen, J. (2002). Digital waveguide mesh modelling of room acoustics: Improved anechoic boundaries. In *Proc. DAFX* (Vol. 2, pp. 163–168). Retrieved from http://ant-s4.unibw-hamburg.de/dafx/papers/DAFX02_Murphy_Mullen_waveguide_mesh_modeling.pdf
- Murphy, D. T., Southern, A., & Savioja, L. (2014). Source excitation strategies for obtaining impulse responses in finite difference time domain room acoustics simulation. *Applied Acoustics*, 82, 6–14. Retrieved from <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0003682X14000401>
- Murphy, D., Beeson, M., Shelley, S., Moore, A., & Southern, A. (2008). Hybrid room impulse response synthesis in digital waveguide mesh based room acoustics simulation. In *Proceedings of the 11th International Conference on Digital Audio Effects (DAFx-08)* (pp. 129–136). Retrieved from <http://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/21721150.pdf>
- Nelson, G., Pfeifer, L., & Wood, R. (1972). High-speed octave band digital filtering. *IEEE Transactions on Audio and Electroacoustics*, 20(1), 58–65. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=1162338
- O’Rourke, J. (1985). Finding minimal enclosing boxes. *International Journal of Computer & Information Sciences*, 14(3), 183–199. Retrieved from <http://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/BF00991005>
- Odeon. (2016). Retrieved from <http://www.odeon.dk/>
- OTL. (2016). Retrieved from <http://www.olivetreelab.com/Room>
- Oxnard, S., O’Brien, D., Mourik, J. van, & Murphy, D. (2015). Frequency-Dependent Absorbing Boundary Implementations in 3D Finite Difference Time Domain Room Acoustics Simulations. Retrieved from http://www.conforg.fr/euronoise2015/output_directory/data/articles/000112.pdf
- Pachyderm Acoustic. (2016). *GitHub*. Retrieved from <https://github.com/PachydermAcoustic>
- ParallelFDTD. (2016). *GitHub*. Retrieved from <https://github.com/juuli/ParallelFDTD>
- Revelles, J., Urena, C., & Lastra, M. (2000). An efficient parametric algorithm for octree traversal. Retrieved from <https://otik.uk.zcu.cz/handle/11025/15821>
- Rindel, J. H. (1993). Modelling the angle-dependent pressure reflection factor. *Applied*

Acoustics, 38(2), 223–234. Retrieved from <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/0003682X93900539>

Rindel, J. H. (2000). The use of computer modeling in room acoustics. *Journal of Vibroengineering*, 3(4), 41–72. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Jens_Rindel/publication/2461601_The_Use_of_Computer_Modeling_in_Room_Acoustics/links/542027af0cf241a65a1b0999.pdf

Savioja, L., & Lokki, T. (2001). Digital waveguide mesh for room acoustic modeling. *CAMP-FIRE*, 6(3), 13. Retrieved from <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.398.8067&rep=rep1&type=pdf#page=23>

Savioja, L., & Svensson, U. P. (2015). Overview of geometrical room acoustic modeling techniques. *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 138(2), 708–730. Retrieved from <http://scitation.aip.org/content/asa/journal/jasa/138/2/10.1121/1.4926438>

Savioja, L., & Valimäki, V. (1999). Reduction of the dispersion error in the interpolated digital waveguide mesh using frequency warping. In *Acoustics, Speech, and Signal Processing, 1999. Proceedings., 1999 IEEE International Conference on* (Vol. 2, pp. 973–976). IEEE. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=759858

Savioja, L., & Valimäki, V. (2001). Interpolated 3-D digital waveguide mesh with frequency warping. In *Acoustics, Speech, and Signal Processing, 2001. Proceedings.(ICASSP'01). 2001 IEEE International Conference on* (Vol. 5, pp. 3345–3348). IEEE. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=940375

Savioja, L., Karjalainen, M., & Takala, T. (1996). DSP formulation of a finite difference method for room acoustics simulation. In *Proceedings of NORSIG'96 IEEE Nordic Signal Processing Symposium* (pp. 455–458). Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Tapio_Takala/publication/239443426_DSP_Formulation_of_a_Finite_Difference_Method_for_Room_Acoustics_Simulation/links/004635371a9f6b175f000000.pdf

Savioja, L., Lokki, T., & Välimäki, V. (2014). The interpolated 3-D digital waveguide mesh method for room acoustic simulation and auralization. *Ultragarsas“ Ultrasound”*, 48(3), 48–52. Retrieved from http://www.academia.edu/download/30718688/savioja_nam02.pdf

Schneider, J. B., Wagner, C. L., & Broschat, S. L. (1998). Implementation of transparent sources embedded in acoustic finite-difference time-domain grids. *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 103(1), 136–142. Retrieved from <http://scitation.aip.org/content/asa/journal/jasa/103/1/10.1121/1.421084>

Schröder, D. (2011). *Physically based real-time auralization of interactive virtual environments* (Vol. 11). Logos Verlag Berlin GmbH. Retrieved from

https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=HtDxSt0jcRkC&oi=fnd&pg=PR17&dq=+Dirk+Schro+%CC%88der+Physically+Based+Real-Time+Auralization+of+Interactive+Virtual+Environments&ots=CCbCVBNlmm&sig=CAIxZysU-fxjnSkG_X1_dffQ72o

- Schröder, D., & Vorländer, M. (2011). RAVEN: A real-time framework for the auralization of interactive virtual environments. In *Forum Acusticum*. Retrieved from https://www2.ak.tu-berlin.de/~akgroup/ak_pub/seacen/2011/Schroeder_2011b_P2_RAVEN_A_Real_Time_Framework.pdf
- Schroeder, M. R. (1965). New Method of Measuring Reverberation Time. *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 37(3), 409–412. doi:10.1121/1.1909343
- Sheaffer, J. (2013). *From source to brain: Modelling sound propagation and localisation in rooms* (PhD thesis). Citeseer. Retrieved from <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.662.9774&rep=rep1&type=pdf>
- Sheaffer, J., & Fazenda, B. M. (2010). FDTD/K-DWM simulation of 3D room acoustics on general purpose graphics hardware using compute unified device architecture (CUDA). *Proc. Institute of Acoustics*, 32(5). Retrieved from http://usir.salford.ac.uk/11568/?utm_source=twitterfeed&utm_medium=twitter
- Sheaffer, J., Van Walstijn, M., Rafaely, B., & Kowalczyk, K. (2015). Binaural reproduction of finite difference simulations using spherical array processing. *IEEE/ACM Transactions on Audio, Speech, and Language Processing*, 23(12), 2125–2135. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=7194789
- Sheaffer, J., Walstijn, M. van, & Fazenda, B. (2014). Physical and numerical constraints in source modeling for finite difference simulation of room acoustics. *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 135(1), 251–261. Retrieved from <http://scitation.aip.org/content/asa/journal/jasa/135/1/10.1121/1.4836355>
- Sheaffer, J., Webb, C., & Fazenda, B. M. (2013). Modelling binaural receivers in finite difference simulation of room acoustics. In *Proceedings of Meetings on Acoustics* (Vol. 19, p. 015098). Acoustical Society of America. Retrieved from <http://scitation.aip.org/content/asa/journal/poma/19/1/10.1121/1.4800195>
- Shelley, S. B. (2007). *Diffuse boundary modelling in the digital waveguide mesh*. University of York. Retrieved from http://www-users.york.ac.uk/~dtm3/Download/SBS_Thesis.pdf
- Shelley, S., & Murphy, D. T. (2005). Diffusion modelling at the boundary of a digital waveguide mesh. In *Signal Processing Conference, 2005 13th European* (pp. 1–4). IEEE. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=7078130
- Siltanen, S., Lokki, T., & Savioja, L. (2010). Rays or waves? Understanding the strengths and weaknesses of computational room acoustics modeling techniques.

- In *Proceedings of the International Symposium on Room Acoustics*. Melbourne, Australia. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Tapio_Lokki/publication/236169416_Rays_or_Waves_Understanding_the_Strengths_and_Weaknesses_of_Computational_Room_Acoustics_Modeling_Techniques/links/00463538f7bd84469a000000.pdf
- Siltanen, S., Lokki, T., Kiminki, S., & Savioja, L. (2007). The room acoustic rendering equation. *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 122(3), 1624–1635. Retrieved from <http://scitation.aip.org/content/asa/journal/jasa/122/3/10.1121/1.2766781>
- Siltanen, S., Lokki, T., Tervo, S., & Savioja, L. (2012). Modeling incoherent reflections from rough room surfaces with image sources. *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 131(6), 4606–4614. Retrieved from <http://scitation.aip.org/content/asa/journal/jasa/131/6/10.1121/1.4711013>
- Siltanen, S., Southern, A., & Savioja, L. (2013). Finite-difference time domain method source calibration for hybrid acoustics modeling. In *2013 IEEE International Conference on Acoustics, Speech and Signal Processing* (pp. 166–170). IEEE. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=6637630
- Smith, J. O. (1992). Physical modeling using digital waveguides. *Computer Music Journal*, 16(4), 74–91. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3680470>
- Southern, A., & Murphy, D. (2007a). Methods for 2 nd Order Spherical Harmonic Spatial Encoding in Digital Waveguide Mesh Virtual Acoustic Simulations. In *2007 IEEE Workshop on Applications of Signal Processing to Audio and Acoustics* (pp. 203–206). IEEE. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=4392993
- Southern, A., & Murphy, D. T. (2007b). 2nd order spherical harmonic spatial encoding of digital waveguide mesh room acoustic models. In *Proceedings of the 10th International Conference on Digital Audio Effects (DAFx07), Bordeaux, France* (pp. 101–108). Citeseer. Retrieved from <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.384.295&rep=rep1&type=pdf>
- Southern, A., & Siltanen, S. (2013). A hybrid acoustic model for room impulse response synthesis. In *Proceedings of Meetings on Acoustics* (Vol. 19, p. 015113). Acoustical Society of America. Retrieved from <http://scitation.aip.org/content/asa/journal/poma/19/1/10.1121/1.4800212>
- Southern, A., Siltanen, S., & Savioja, L. (2011). Spatial room impulse responses with a hybrid modeling method. In *Audio Engineering Society Convention 130*. Audio Engineering Society. Retrieved from <http://www.aes.org/e-lib/browse.cfm?elib=15852>
- Southern, A., Siltanen, S., Murphy, D. T., & Savioja, L. (2013). Room impulse response synthesis and validation using a hybrid acoustic model. *IEEE Transactions on*

- Audio, Speech, and Language Processing*, 21(9), 1940–1952. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=6516012
- Summers, J. E., Takahashi, K., Shimizu, Y., & Yamakawa, T. (2004). Assessing the accuracy of auralizations computed using a hybrid geometrical-acoustics and wave-acoustics method. *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 115(5), 2514–2515. Retrieved from <http://scitation.aip.org/content/asa/journal/jasa/115/5/10.1121/1.4809339>
- Svensson, P., & Kristiansen, U. R. (2002). Computational modelling and simulation of acoutic spaces. In *Audio Engineering Society Conference: 22nd International Conference: Virtual, Synthetic, and Entertainment Audio*. Audio Engineering Society. Retrieved from <http://www.aes.org/e-lib/browse.cfm?elib=11119>
- Valimaki, V., Parker, J. D., Savioja, L., Smith, J. O., & Abel, J. S. (2012). Fifty years of artificial reverberation. *IEEE Transactions on Audio, Speech, and Language Processing*, 20(5), 1421–1448. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=6161610
- Van Duyne, S. A., & Smith III, J. O. (1996). The 3D tetrahedral digital waveguide mesh with musical applications. In *Proceedings of the 1996 International Computer Music Conference* (pp. 9–16). The International Computer Music Association. Retrieved from <https://dialnet.unirioja.es/servlet/articulo?codigo=569975>
- Van Duyne, S. A., & Smith, J. O. (1995). The tetrahedral digital waveguide mesh. In *Applications of Signal Processing to Audio and Acoustics, 1995., IEEE ASSP Workshop on* (pp. 234–237). IEEE. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=482998
- Vorlander, M. (2009). Simulation and auralization of broadband room impulse responses. In *Tecniacústica 2009*. Retrieved from <https://dialnet.unirioja.es/servlet/articulo?codigo=4680242>
- Vorländer, M. (2007). *Auralization: Fundamentals of acoustics, modelling, simulation, algorithms and acoustic virtual reality*. Springer Science & Business Media. Retrieved from <https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=CuXF3JkTuhAC&oi=fnd&pg=PA1&dq=auralization+vorlander&ots=EXlinTIK9W&sig=d2t3k2YLLPA1FWvfH15gw1QSi7M>
- Warren, G. S., & Scott, W. R. (1998). Numerical dispersion in the finite-element method using three-dimensional edge elements. *Microwave and Optical Technology Letters*, 18(6), 423–429. Retrieved from http://users.ece.gatech.edu/~wrscott/Papers/1998-8_MOTL_Numerical_Dispersion_3D.pdf
- Zhang, C., & Chen, T. (2001). Efficient feature extraction for 2D/3D objects in mesh representation. In *Image Processing, 2001. Proceedings. 2001 International Conference on* (Vol. 3, pp. 935–938). IEEE. Retrieved from http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpls/abs_all.jsp?arnumber=958278