BITSS

BERKELEY INITIATIVE FOR TRANSPARENCY IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES

Combined Regression Results
Causal Evidence

Garret Christensen[1]   Allan Dafoe[2]   Edward Miguel[3]

[1]Berkeley Institute for Data Science, UC Berkeley

[2]Department of Political Science, Yale University

[3]Department of Economics, UC Berkeley

April 2018

PRELIMINARY–Please do not cite.

Thanks to David Birke, Mu Yang Shin, Don Sun, Manana Hakobyan, Terri Cruz, Maxim Guzman, Baiyue Cao, Evey Huang, Rachel Kim, Ravina Pattni, Kevin Khuu, Neil Tagare, Simon Zhu, Jacqueline Wood, Kai Ong, Isabel Zhou

- Naive OLS results
- First stage
- 2SLS
- Exclusion Restriction

			Naive OLS Regression	
VARIABLES	(1) Cites	(2) Cites	(3) Cites	(4) Cites
Data and Code Available	9.987	51.543***	39.973***	48.411***
	(7.273)	(7.293)	(7.444)	(8.537)
AER		-120.460***	-116.065***	-131.593***
		(8.056)	(8.027)	(10.064)
AJPS		-111.339***	-111.823***	-112.600***
		(10.843)	(10.770)	(13.334)
APSR		-99.001***	-91.782***	-91.567***
		(11.390)	(11.374)	(15.078)
Months since Pub'd		1.076	1.076	1.881
		(1.331)	(1.322)	(1.698)
Months since Pub'd^2		-0.002	-0.002	-0.009
		(0.012)	(0.012)	(0.015)
Months since Pub'd^3		0.000	0.000	0.000
		(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
No Data in Article			-40.739***	
			(6.041)	
Constant	85.175***	53.439	63.913	23.307
	(3.050)	(47.793)	(47.493)	(60.656)
Observations	3,002	3,002	2,999	2,210
R-squared	0.001	0.147	0.159	0.161
Sample	All	All	All	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

Naive OLS Regression				
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
VARIABLES	Cites	Cites	Cites	Cites
Data and Code Available	9.987	51.543***	39.973***	48.411***
	(7.273)	(7.293)	(7.444)	(8.537)
AER		-120.460***	-116.065***	-131.593***
		(8.056)	(8.027)	(10.064)
AJPS		-111.339***	-111.823***	-112.600***
		(10.843)	(10.770)	(13.334)
APSR		-99.001***	-91.782***	-91.567***
		(11.390)	(11.374)	(15.078)
Months since Pub'd		1.076	1.076	1.881
		(1.331)	(1.322)	(1.698)
Months since Pub'd^2		-0.002	-0.002	-0.009
		(0.012)	(0.012)	(0.015)
Months since Pub'd^3		0.000	0.000	0.000
		(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
No Data in Article			-40.739***	
			(6.041)	
Constant	85.175***	53.439	63.913	23.307
	(3.050)	(47.793)	(47.493)	(60.656)
Observations	3,002	3,002	2,999	2,210
R-squared	0.001	0.147	0.159	0.161
Sample	All	All	All	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

			Naive OLS Regression	
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
VARIABLES	Cites	Cites	Cites	Cites
Data and Code Available	9.987	50.938***	39.506***	47.474***
	(7.273)	(7.314)	(7.466)	(8.577)
AER		-120.129***	-115.751***	-131.048***
		(8.066)	(8.038)	(10.092)
AJPS		-168.016***	-165.733***	-187.757***
		(17.630)	(17.517)	(22.034)
APSR		-156.125***	-146.573***	-167.978***
		(17.802)	(17.742)	(22.656)
2001b.year#0b.econ		0.000	0.000	0.000
		(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
2001b.year#1.econ		109.594***	110.134***	144.505***
		(13.142)	(13.054)	(17.472)
2002o.year#0b.econ		0.000	0.000	0.000
		(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
2002.year#1.econ		87.419***	87.735***	111.725***
		(12.840)	(12.754)	(17.004)
2003o.year#0b.econ		0.000	0.000	0.000
		(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
2003.year#1.econ		87.329***	83.181***	96.332***
		(12.754)	(12.683)	(16.198)
2004o.year#0b.econ		0.000	0.000	0.000
		(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
2004.year#1.econ		70.913***	69.310***	82.868***

		Naive OLS Regression		
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
VARIABLES	Cites	Cites	Cites	Cites
avail_data	32.981***	66.702***	56.310***	64.644***
	(6.415)	(6.403)	(6.646)	(7.610)
AER		-118.736***	-115.393***	-130.622***
		(7.980)	(7.967)	(9.968)
AJPS		-109.664***	-110.354***	-109.964***
		(10.737)	(10.693)	(13.220)
APSR		-92.202***	-87.006***	-84.833***
		(11.314)	(11.314)	(14.979)
Months since Pub'd		1.219	1.223	2.096
		(1.316)	(1.310)	(1.679)
Months since Pub'd^2		-0.003	-0.003	-0.010
		(0.012)	(0.012)	(0.015)
Months since Pub'd^3		0.000	0.000	0.000
		(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
No Data in Article			-33.643***	
			(6.085)	
Constant	77.779***	33.591	43.462	-2.050
	(3.086)	(47.191)	(47.020)	(59.868)
Observations	3,069	3,002	2,999	2,210
R-squared	0.009	0.163	0.171	0.176
Sample	All	All	All	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
	Cites	Cites	Cites	Cites
VARIABLES	Cites	Cites	Cites	Cites
avail_data	32.981***	66.169***	55.931***	63.714***
	(6.415)	(6.414)	(6.659)	(7.632)
AER		-118.431***	-115.107***	-130.045***
		(7.990)	(7.979)	(9.998)
AJPS		-169.543***	-168.117***	-189.825***
		(17.320)	(17.249)	(21.606)
APSR		-152.555***	-145.631***	-165.964***
		(17.561)	(17.534)	(22.313)
2001b.year#0b.econ		0.000	0.000	0.000
		(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
2001b.year#1.econ		116.199***	115.917***	152.731***
		(13.041)	(12.985)	(17.358)
2002o.year#0b.econ		0.000	0.000	0.000
		(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
2002.year#1.econ		93.256***	92.883***	118.860***
		(12.736)	(12.681)	(16.883)
2003o.year#0b.econ		0.000	0.000	0.000
		(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
2003.year#1.econ		92.430***	88.477***	103.135***
		(12.645)	(12.611)	(16.082)
2004o.year#0b.econ		0.000	0.000	0.000
		(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
2004.year#1.econ		73.409***	71.916***	86.294***

Naive OLS Regression

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
VARIABLES	Cites	Cites	Cites	Cites
Data and Code Available	9.987	51.543***	39.973***	48.411***
	(7.273)	(7.293)	(7.444)	(8.537)
AER		-120.460***	-116.065***	-131.593***
		(8.056)	(8.027)	(10.064)
AJPS		-111.339***	-111.823***	-112.600***
		(10.843)	(10.770)	(13.334)
APSR		-99.001***	-91.782***	-91.567***
		(11.390)	(11.374)	(15.078)
No Data in Article			-40.739***	
			(6.041)	
Observations	3,002	3,002	2,999	2,210
R-squared	0.001	0.147	0.159	0.161
Sample	All	All	All	Data-Only

Naive OLS Regression

Standard errors in parentheses

*** p$<$0.01, ** p$<$0.05, * p$<$0.1

Regressions include constant, squared and cubed months since publication.

	Naive OLS Regression			
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
VARIABLES	Cites	Cites	Cites	Cites
Data and Code Available	9.987	50.938***	39.506***	47.474***
	(7.273)	(7.314)	(7.466)	(8.577)
AER		-120.129***	-115.751***	-131.048***
		(8.066)	(8.038)	(10.092)
AJPS		-168.016***	-165.733***	-187.757***
		(17.630)	(17.517)	(22.034)
APSR		-156.125***	-146.573***	-167.978***
		(17.802)	(17.742)	(22.656)
2009o.year#1o.econ		0.000	0.000	0.000
		(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
2014o.year#0b.econ		0.000	0.000	0.000
		(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
No Data in Article			-40.474***	
			(6.090)	
Observations	3,002	3,002	2,999	2,210
R-squared	0.001	0.149	0.161	0.163
Sample	All	All	All	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

*** $p<0.01$, ** $p<0.05$, * $p<0.1$

Regressions include constant, squared and cubed months since publication.

Naive OLS Regression

VARIABLES	(1) Cites	(2) Cites	(3) Cites	(4) Cites
avail_data	32.981***	66.702***	56.310***	64.644***
	(6.415)	(6.403)	(6.646)	(7.610)
AER		-118.736***	-115.393***	-130.622***
		(7.980)	(7.967)	(9.968)
AJPS		-109.664***	-110.354***	-109.964***
		(10.737)	(10.693)	(13.220)
APSR		-92.202***	-87.006***	-84.833***
		(11.314)	(11.314)	(14.979)
No Data in Article			-33.643***	
			(6.085)	
Observations	3,069	3,002	2,999	2,210
R-squared	0.009	0.163	0.171	0.176
Sample	All	All	All	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

*** $p<0.01$, ** $p<0.05$, * $p<0.1$

Regressions include constant, squared and cubed months since publication.

Naive OLS Regression				
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
VARIABLES	Cites	Cites	Cites	Cites
avail_data	32.981***	66.169***	55.931***	63.714***
	(6.415)	(6.414)	(6.659)	(7.632)
AER		-118.431***	-115.107***	-130.045***
		(7.990)	(7.979)	(9.998)
AJPS		-169.543***	-168.117***	-189.825***
		(17.320)	(17.249)	(21.606)
APSR		-152.555***	-145.631***	-165.964***
		(17.561)	(17.534)	(22.313)
2009o.year#1o.econ		0.000	0.000	0.000
		(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
2014o.year#0b.econ		0.000	0.000	0.000
		(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
No Data in Article			-33.315***	
			(6.135)	
Observations	3,069	3,002	2,999	2,210
R-squared	0.009	0.165	0.173	0.177
Sample	All	All	All	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

*** $p<0.01$, ** $p<0.05$, * $p<0.1$

Regressions include constant, squared and cubed months since publication.

	Naive OLS Regression			
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
VARIABLES	Ln(Cites+1)	Ln(Cites+1)	Ln(Cites+1)	Ln(Cites+1)
Data and Code Available	0.261***	0.764***	0.574***	0.595***
	(0.063)	(0.061)	(0.060)	(0.059)
AER		-1.191***	-1.120***	-1.134***
		(0.067)	(0.065)	(0.069)
AJPS		-0.906***	-0.916***	-0.829***
		(0.090)	(0.087)	(0.091)
APSR		-0.726***	-0.600***	-0.440***
		(0.095)	(0.092)	(0.103)
Months since Pub'd		0.064***	0.064***	0.076***
		(0.011)	(0.011)	(0.012)
No Data in Article			-0.655***	
			(0.049)	
Observations	3,002	3,002	2,999	2,210
R-squared	0.006	0.218	0.262	0.255
Sample	All	All	All	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

VARIABLES	(1) First Stage	(2) First Stage	(3) First Stage
AER post-2005 Policy	0.047	0.074	0.112**
	(0.039)	(0.056)	(0.050)
AJPS post-2010 Policy	0.196***	0.250**	0.220***
	(0.058)	(0.118)	(0.077)
AJPS post-2012 Policy	0.266***	-0.314**	0.288***
	(0.065)	(0.148)	(0.083)
Observations	3,123	3,118	2,238
R-squared	0.174	0.246	0.195
Sample	All	IV=Data-Only	Data-Only
F Stat	27.67	13.97	20.54

Standard errors in parentheses

*** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Controls cut for space

2SLS Regression			
	(1)	(2)	(3)
VARIABLES	2SLS	2SLS	2SLS
Data and Code Available	18.362	20.128	94.212*
	(44.688)	(37.725)	(51.734)
AER	-119.611***	-116.700***	-133.213***
	(8.083)	(8.109)	(10.379)
AJPS	-112.786***	-110.504***	-119.329***
	(31.758)	(31.383)	(38.715)
APSR	-106.728***	-95.255***	-90.197**
	(32.073)	(31.577)	(39.872)
Post-Mar 2005	-31.531**	30.927*	-30.192*
	(12.663)	(16.945)	(16.399)
Post-2005 with Data		-73.513***	
		(15.879)	
Post-Oct 2010	-3.162	17.291	-1.049
	(16.553)	(28.710)	(20.791)
Post-2010 with Data		-26.449	
		(29.504)	
Post-July 2012	-0.259	5.808	-6.046
	(22.629)	(31.977)	(27.430)
Post-2012 with Data		-5.256	
		(27.305)	
No Data in Article		-120.641***	
		(20.167)	

◀ □ ▶ ◀ 🗗 ▶ ◀ 🗏 ▶ ◀ 🗏 ▶   🗏   ✐ 𝒬 𝒸

2SLS Regression			
	(1)	(2)	(3)
VARIABLES	2SLS	2SLS	2SLS
Data and Code Available	14.011	16.675	90.180*
	(44.578)	(38.394)	(52.857)
AER	-119.193***	-116.182***	-132.455***
	(8.090)	(8.122)	(10.381)
AJPS	-151.221***	-154.523***	-211.069***
	(26.611)	(24.068)	(36.106)
APSR	-145.983***	-140.066***	-182.668***
	(20.965)	(20.525)	(29.729)
Post-Mar 2005	-43.278*	21.212	-41.589
	(25.621)	(28.237)	(31.019)
Post-2005 with Data		-72.401***	
		(15.934)	
Post-Oct 2010	-14.620	5.779	-33.848
	(45.928)	(50.075)	(59.706)
Post-2010 with Data		-27.022	
		(30.243)	
Post-July 2012	-7.090	-3.431	-12.575
	(28.136)	(37.089)	(33.849)
Post-2012 with Data		-4.955	
		(27.530)	
2009o.year#1o.econ	0.000	0.000	0.000
	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
2014o.year#0b.econ	0.000	0.000	0.000

| | 2SLS Regression | | |
VARIABLES	(1) 2SLS	(2) 2SLS	(3) 2SLS
avail_data	32.686	29.679	108.204**
	(41.539)	(36.022)	(45.246)
AER	-118.867***	-116.456***	-131.005***
	(8.028)	(7.962)	(10.061)
AJPS	-114.162***	-111.425***	-122.446***
	(31.550)	(31.228)	(38.433)
APSR	-104.172***	-94.241***	-88.575**
	(31.835)	(31.338)	(39.253)
Post-Mar 2005	-30.324**	33.883*	-26.875*
	(12.584)	(17.478)	(16.133)
Post-2005 with Data		-76.446***	
		(16.112)	
Post-Oct 2010	-5.367	17.543	-11.406
	(16.514)	(28.438)	(20.421)
Post-2010 with Data		-29.361	
		(29.684)	
Post-July 2012	-0.204	5.399	-4.113
	(22.369)	(31.771)	(27.092)
Post-2012 with Data		-4.591	
		(26.966)	
No Data in Article		-120.700***	
		(19.822)	

| 2SLS Regression | | | |
VARIABLES	(1) 2SLS	(2) 2SLS	(3) 2SLS
avail_data	26.184	25.169	99.822**
	(41.070)	(36.314)	(45.343)
AER	-118.655***	-116.039***	-130.388***
	(8.036)	(7.979)	(10.049)
AJPS	-154.656***	-156.115***	-205.842***
	(23.056)	(21.360)	(29.313)
APSR	-146.167***	-139.979***	-173.852***
	(18.536)	(18.633)	(24.874)
Post-Mar 2005	-38.004	27.863	-24.314
	(26.856)	(30.564)	(31.673)
Post-2005 with Data		-75.011***	
		(16.173)	
Post-Oct 2010	-16.412	6.460	-33.747
	(45.424)	(49.724)	(58.582)
Post-2010 with Data		-29.350	
		(30.380)	
Post-July 2012	-6.311	-3.244	-8.831
	(27.919)	(36.890)	(33.427)
Post-2012 with Data		-4.452	
		(27.281)	
2009o.year#1o.econ	0.000	0.000	0.000
	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
2014o.year#0b.econ	0.000	0.000	0.000

	(1)	(2)	(3)
	2SLS Regression		
VARIABLES	2SLS	2SLS	2SLS
Data and Code Available	18.362	20.128	94.212*
	(44.688)	(37.725)	(51.734)
AER	-119.611***	-116.700***	-133.213***
	(8.083)	(8.109)	(10.379)
AJPS	-112.786***	-110.504***	-119.329***
	(31.758)	(31.383)	(38.715)
APSR	-106.728***	-95.255***	-90.197**
	(32.073)	(31.577)	(39.872)
Months since Pub'd	1.275	1.665	3.297
	(2.459)	(2.409)	(3.158)
No Data in Article		-120.641***	
		(20.167)	
Observations	3,002	2,999	2,210
R-squared	0.143	0.167	0.152
Sample	All	IV=Data-Only	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

*** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Christensen, Dafoe, Miguel   Data Sharing and Citations

2SLS Regression of ln(citations+1)			
	(1)	(2)	(3)
VARIABLES	2SLS-Log	2SLS-Log	2SLS-Log
Data and Code Available	-0.139	0.213	0.389
	(0.383)	(0.308)	(0.353)
AER	-1.177***	-1.118***	-1.121***
	(0.069)	(0.066)	(0.071)
AJPS	-0.729***	-0.689***	-0.877***
	(0.272)	(0.256)	(0.264)
APSR	-0.733***	-0.381	-0.524*
	(0.275)	(0.258)	(0.272)
Post-Mar 2005	-0.197*	-0.007	-0.144
	(0.109)	(0.138)	(0.112)
Post-Oct 2010	0.089	0.448*	-0.069
	(0.142)	(0.234)	(0.142)
Post-July 2012	0.061	0.178	0.012
	(0.194)	(0.261)	(0.187)
Post-2005 with Data		-0.121	
		(0.130)	
Post-2010 with Data		-0.412*	
		(0.241)	
Post-2012 with Data		-0.104	
		(0.223)	
Months since Pub'd	0.062***	0.072***	0.073***
	(0.021)	(0.020)	(0.022)
No Data in Article		-1.234***	
		(0.165)	
Observations	3,002	2,999	2,210
R-squared	0.161	0.257	0.252
Sample	All	IV=Data-Only	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

*** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Christensen, Dafoe, Miguel   Data Sharing and Citations

2SLS Regression of ln(citations+1)			
	(1)	(2)	(3)
VARIABLES	2SLS-Log	2SLS-Log	2SLS-Log
Data and Code Available	-0.139	0.213	0.389
	(0.383)	(0.308)	(0.353)
AER	-1.177***	-1.118***	-1.121***
	(0.069)	(0.066)	(0.071)
AJPS	-0.729***	-0.689***	-0.877***
	(0.272)	(0.256)	(0.264)
APSR	-0.733***	-0.381	-0.524*
	(0.275)	(0.258)	(0.272)
Months since Pub'd	0.062***	0.072***	0.073***
	(0.021)	(0.020)	(0.022)
No Data in Article		-1.234***	
		(0.165)	
Observations	3,002	2,999	2,210
R-squared	0.161	0.257	0.252
Sample	All	IV=Data-Only	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

*** $p<0.01$, ** $p<0.05$, * $p<0.1$

VARIABLES	(1) Experimental	(2) Observational	(3) Top 10	(4) Top 20	(5) Top 50
AER post-2005 Policy	0.060	-0.076*	-0.127***	-0.084*	-0.001
	(0.042)	(0.046)	(0.041)	(0.046)	(0.048)
AJPS post-2010 Policy	0.098	-0.096	0.070	0.086	0.067
	(0.065)	(0.070)	(0.064)	(0.071)	(0.074)
AJPS post-2012 Policy	-0.102	0.089	0.012	0.005	0.065
	(0.070)	(0.076)	(0.069)	(0.077)	(0.080)
Observations	2,238	2,238	2,231	2,231	2,231
R-squared	0.015	0.011	0.017	0.009	0.075
Sample	Data-Only	Data-Only	Data-Only	Data-Only	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

*** $p < 0.01$, ** $p < 0.05$, * $p < 0.1$

Controls dropped for space