BITSS

BERKELEY INITIATIVE FOR TRANSPARENCY
IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES

Combined Regression Results
Causal Evidence

Garret Christensen[1]   Allan Dafoe[2]   Edward Miguel[3]

[1]Berkeley Institute for Data Science, UC Berkeley

[2]Department of Political Science, Yale University

[3]Department of Economics, UC Berkeley

April 2018

PRELIMINARY–Please do not cite.

Thanks to David Birke, Mu Yang Shin, Don Sun, Manana Hakobyan, Terri Cruz, Maxim Guzman, Baiyue Cao, Evey Huang, Rachel Kim, Ravina Pattni, Kevin Khuu, Neil Tagare, Simon Zhu, Jacqueline Wood, Kai Ong, Isabel Zhou

- Naive OLS results
- First stage
- 2SLS
- Exclusion Restriction

		Naive OLS Regression		
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
VARIABLES	Cites	Cites	Cites	Cites
Data and Code Available	10.879	51.580***	40.024***	48.326***
	(7.255)	(7.284)	(7.434)	(8.527)
AER		-120.302***	-116.061***	-132.086***
		(8.161)	(8.129)	(10.209)
AJPS		-111.581***	-112.226***	-113.505***
		(10.881)	(10.808)	(13.387)
APSR		-99.231***	-92.187***	-92.480***
		(11.427)	(11.406)	(15.115)
Months since Pub'd		1.067	1.071	1.854
		(1.328)	(1.319)	(1.694)
Months since Pub'd^2		-0.002	-0.002	-0.009
		(0.012)	(0.012)	(0.015)
Months since Pub'd^3		0.000	0.000	0.000
		(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
No Data in Article			-40.668***	
			(6.027)	
Constant	84.424***	53.668	64.169	24.786
	(3.044)	(47.725)	(47.423)	(60.581)
Observations	2,983	2,983	2,980	2,193
R-squared	0.001	0.145	0.157	0.159
Sample	All	All	All	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

	Naive OLS Regression			
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
VARIABLES	Cites	Cites	Cites	Cites
Data and Code Available	10.879	51.580***	40.024***	48.326***
	(7.255)	(7.284)	(7.434)	(8.527)
AER		-120.302***	-116.061***	-132.086***
		(8.161)	(8.129)	(10.209)
AJPS		-111.581***	-112.226***	-113.505***
		(10.881)	(10.808)	(13.387)
APSR		-99.231***	-92.187***	-92.480***
		(11.427)	(11.406)	(15.115)
Months since Pub'd		1.067	1.071	1.854
		(1.328)	(1.319)	(1.694)
No Data in Article			-40.668***	
			(6.027)	
Observations	2,983	2,983	2,980	2,193
R-squared	0.001	0.145	0.157	0.159
Sample	All	All	All	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

*** $p < 0.01$, ** $p < 0.05$, * $p < 0.1$

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
	Naive OLS Regression			
VARIABLES	Ln(Cites+1)	Ln(Cites+1)	Ln(Cites+1)	Ln(Cites+1)
Data and Code Available	0.267***	0.764***	0.573***	0.593***
	(0.063)	(0.061)	(0.061)	(0.059)
AER		-1.190***	-1.121***	-1.140***
		(0.068)	(0.066)	(0.070)
AJPS		-0.905***	-0.918***	-0.834***
		(0.091)	(0.088)	(0.092)
APSR		-0.726***	-0.601***	-0.446***
		(0.095)	(0.093)	(0.104)
Months since Pub'd		0.064***	0.064***	0.075***
		(0.011)	(0.011)	(0.012)
No Data in Article			-0.658***	
			(0.049)	
Observations	2,983	2,983	2,980	2,193
R-squared	0.006	0.215	0.259	0.253
Sample	All	All	All	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

VARIABLES	(1) First Stage	(2) First Stage	(3) First Stage
AER post-2005 Policy	0.047	0.080	0.112**
	(0.040)	(0.057)	(0.051)
AJPS post-2010 Policy	0.196***	0.250**	0.220***
	(0.058)	(0.118)	(0.077)
AJPS post-2012 Policy	0.266***	-0.311**	0.288***
	(0.065)	(0.148)	(0.083)
Observations	3,104	3,099	2,221
R-squared	0.175	0.246	0.195
Sample	All	IV=Data-Only	Data-Only
F Stat	27.62	14	20.46

Standard errors in parentheses

*** $p<0.01$, ** $p<0.05$, * $p<0.1$

Controls cut for space

		2SLS Regression	
	(1)	(2)	(3)
VARIABLES	2SLS	2SLS	2SLS
Data and Code Available	16.699	17.925	93.193*
	(44.555)	(37.611)	(51.571)
AER	-119.688***	-117.015***	-133.498***
	(8.180)	(8.187)	(10.457)
AJPS	-112.031***	-110.082***	-119.097***
	(31.671)	(31.296)	(38.594)
APSR	-106.325***	-95.188***	-90.157**
	(31.984)	(31.489)	(39.745)
Post-Mar 2005	-31.890**	29.775*	-30.777*
	(12.684)	(16.957)	(16.410)
Post-2005 with Data		-72.479***	
		(15.826)	
Post-Oct 2010	-2.814	17.427	-0.747
	(16.495)	(28.602)	(20.702)
Post-2010 with Data		-26.229	
		(29.392)	
Post-July 2012	0.487	6.309	-5.270
	(22.552)	(31.858)	(27.325)
Post-2012 with Data		-4.954	
		(27.201)	
Months since Pub'd	1.300	1.679	3.335
	(2.451)	(2.400)	(3.146)
No Data in Article		-119.884***	
		(20.107)	
Observations	2,983	2,980	2,193
R-squared	0.140	0.165	0.150
Sample	All	IV=Data-Only	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

*** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

	(1)	(2)	(3)
2SLS Regression			
VARIABLES	2SLS	2SLS	2SLS
Data and Code Available	16.699	17.925	93.193*
	(44.555)	(37.611)	(51.571)
AER	-119.688***	-117.015***	-133.498***
	(8.180)	(8.187)	(10.457)
AJPS	-112.031***	-110.082***	-119.097***
	(31.671)	(31.296)	(38.594)
APSR	-106.325***	-95.188***	-90.157**
	(31.984)	(31.489)	(39.745)
Months since Pub'd	1.300	1.679	3.335
	(2.451)	(2.400)	(3.146)
No Data in Article		-119.884***	
		(20.107)	
Observations	2,983	2,980	2,193
R-squared	0.140	0.165	0.150
Sample	All	IV=Data-Only	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses
*** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

◀ □ ▶ ◀ 圖 ▶ ◀ 돌 ▶ ◀ 돌 ▶ 　 돌 　 ⋄ 익 ⋄

2SLS Regression of ln(citations+1)			
VARIABLES	(1) 2SLS-Log	(2) 2SLS-Log	(3) 2SLS-Log
Data and Code Available	-0.141	0.206	0.396
	(0.384)	(0.309)	(0.354)
AER	-1.181***	-1.122***	-1.130***
	(0.071)	(0.067)	(0.072)
AJPS	-0.727***	-0.689***	-0.880***
	(0.273)	(0.257)	(0.265)
APSR	-0.732***	-0.382	-0.526*
	(0.276)	(0.258)	(0.273)
Post-Mar 2005	-0.204*	-0.012	-0.153
	(0.109)	(0.139)	(0.113)
Post-Oct 2010	0.091	0.448*	-0.067
	(0.142)	(0.235)	(0.142)
Post-July 2012	0.063	0.179	0.014
	(0.194)	(0.262)	(0.188)
Post-2005 with Data		-0.123	
		(0.130)	
Post-2010 with Data		-0.412*	
		(0.241)	
Post-2012 with Data		-0.103	
		(0.223)	
Months since Pub'd	0.062***	0.072***	0.073***
	(0.021)	(0.020)	(0.022)
No Data in Article		-1.237***	
		(0.165)	
Observations	2,983	2,980	2,193
R-squared	0.158	0.254	0.250
Sample	All	IV=Data-Only	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

*** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

2SLS Regression of ln(citations+1)			
	(1)	(2)	(3)
VARIABLES	2SLS-Log	2SLS-Log	2SLS-Log
Data and Code Available	-0.141	0.206	0.396
	(0.384)	(0.309)	(0.354)
AER	-1.181***	-1.122***	-1.130***
	(0.071)	(0.067)	(0.072)
AJPS	-0.727***	-0.689***	-0.880***
	(0.273)	(0.257)	(0.265)
APSR	-0.732***	-0.382	-0.526*
	(0.276)	(0.258)	(0.273)
Months since Pub'd	0.062***	0.072***	0.073***
	(0.021)	(0.020)	(0.022)
No Data in Article		-1.237***	
		(0.165)	
Observations	2,983	2,980	2,193
R-squared	0.158	0.254	0.250
Sample	All	IV=Data-Only	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

*** $p<0.01$, ** $p<0.05$, * $p<0.1$

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
VARIABLES	Experimental	Observational	Top 10	Top 20	Top 50
AER post-2005 Policy	0.064	-0.083*	-0.120***	-0.081*	-0.013
	(0.043)	(0.047)	(0.042)	(0.047)	(0.049)
AJPS post-2010 Policy	0.098	-0.096	0.070	0.086	0.067
	(0.065)	(0.070)	(0.064)	(0.072)	(0.074)
AJPS post-2012 Policy	-0.102	0.089	0.012	0.005	0.065
	(0.070)	(0.076)	(0.069)	(0.078)	(0.080)
Observations	2,221	2,221	2,214	2,214	2,214
R-squared	0.015	0.012	0.017	0.008	0.076
Sample	Data-Only	Data-Only	Data-Only	Data-Only	Data-Only

Standard errors in parentheses

*** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Controls dropped for space