

Intellectual Merit Criterion

Overall Assessment of Intellectual Merit

Very Good

Explanation to Applicant

The candidate has a very strong background in research and an impressive record of scholarly achievement. The research plan, to dissociate (and then join) intelligence from conscientiousness, is ambitious and potentially ground-breaking. The candidate's personal statement is one of the most interesting and compelling that I have ever read.

Broader Impacts Criterion

Overall Assessment of Broader Impacts

Very Good

Explanation to Applicant

The potential broader impacts associated with this application are strong, but overall not as impressive as some of the most competitive proposals. Still, there can be no question that disentangling intelligence and conscientiousness will lead to powerful tools for the betterment of society.

Summary Comments

Overall this is a very good proposal by a highly qualified applicant.

Intellectual Merit Criterion

Overall Assessment of Intellectual Merit

Fair

Explanation to Applicant

This is a well-written application from a highly-motivated, confident, and successful applicant.

The applicant's knowledge of and experience with advanced statistics is impressive.

The bulk of the application appears geared toward ongoing research with the applicant's undergraduate mentor. As such, it is difficult to judge the merit of a graduate fellowship.

There is some disconnect between the applicant's and the mentor's description of the work that will be conducted together in the graduate lab. Again, this is odd given the focus of the award on graduate training.

The integration of economics and psychological concepts is quite impressive and speaks to the applicant's ability to participate in interdisciplinary research.

Broader Impacts Criterion

Overall Assessment of Broader Impacts

Fair

Explanation to Applicant

The applicant appears committed to mentorship as a part of the broader impacts, which is certainly commendable.

There is little discussion of the broader impacts of this work for society.

Summary Comments

This is a well-written, integrative application from a highly motivated and statistically skilled young scientist. The work that is proposed seems well-reasoned. The main problem with this work, in my opinion, is that it appears to be less geared toward taking advantage of maximizing graduate training opportunities than it is aimed at extending an ongoing collaboration with undergraduate mentors.

Intellectual Merit Criterion

Overall Assessment of Intellectual Merit

Explanation to Applicant

Broader Impacts Criterion

Overall Assessment of Broader Impacts

Explanation to Applicant

Summary Comments