Gmail

Maia Sosa Kapur <maiarkapur@gmail.com>

FISH 588 Project comments

1 message

Andre E Punt <aepunt@uw.edu> Fri, Dec 13, 2019 at 6:28 PM
To: Maia Kapur <kapurm@uw.edu>

This project involved using a spatio-temporal model based on the "Calibration by Proximity" approach to create region-wide indices of abundance for sablefish. This is an application of a previously developed method to a new species. The analyses integrated over multiple surveys (with limited spatial overlap). The analysis proceeded by stepwise addition of surveys to enable the impact of adding surveys (and changing the reference survey) to be evaluated.

I wasn't entirely sure what "time blocks" meant in this method – is this a change in q in an area? Also, did the q change in as expected? A key assumption of this approach (for me) is whether selectivity is the same for all surveys (which may be semi-correct if they are all trawl surveys). I found Figure 2 pretty hard to follow as it contained a lot of information. Figure 3 could have been expressed scaled to a constant across each series to help with interpretation. Table 3 could have been useful but you didn't provide much help to the reader on what was being plotted.

In relation to the presentation, the introduction was clear and you made it clear what the objective was. The methods were well specified and the results easy to follow. The next steps were also clear and easy to follow.

--
Andre E Punt
Director: School of Aquatic and Fishery Sciences
College of the Environment
University of Washington
206-221-6319 (O)
aepunt@uw.edu
http://fish.washington.edu/people/punt/
http://puntlab.washington.edu/