$$\Sigma' = \{R(z) \lor \exists x P(f(x)), \neg Q(x), \}$$

$$\Pi' = \{\forall y \, g(y) = y, \forall y \neg P(g(y)) \lor Q(y), \neg R(d)\}$$

$$\Sigma = \operatorname{sk}(\Sigma') = \{R(z) \lor P(f(c)), \neg Q(y), \}$$

$$\Pi = \operatorname{sk}(\Pi') = \{g(u) = u, \neg P(g(v)) \lor Q(v), \neg R(d)\}$$

$$L(\Sigma) = \{R, P, Q, f, z, x, c\}$$

$$L(\Pi) = \{R, P, Q, g, u, v, d\}$$
Refutation:

Interpolants:

$$\frac{\bot \quad \top}{(\neg R(d) \land \bot) \lor (R(d) \land \top) \equiv R(d)} \theta_0 \quad \frac{\top \quad \bot}{(\neg Q(y) \land \top) \lor (Q(y) \land \top) \equiv \neg Q(y)} \theta_1 \quad \top}{(\neg Q(u) \land g(u) = u) \lor (\top \land g(u) \neq u)} \theta_2 \quad (\neg P(f(c)) \land R(d)) \quad \lor \quad (P(f(c)) \land ((\neg Q(f(c)) \land g(f(c)) = f(c)) \quad \lor \quad g(f(c)) \neq f(c)))} \theta_3$$

Relative interpolant properties:

θ_0 :	$\Sigma \vdash R(d) \lor P(f(c))$	$\Pi \vdash \neg R(d) \lor P(f(c))$
θ_1 :	$\Sigma \vdash \neg Q(y) \lor \neg P(g(y))$	$\Pi \vdash Q(y) \vee \neg P(g(y))$
θ_2 :	$\Sigma \vdash (\neg Q(u) \land g(u) = u) \lor g(u) \neq u \lor \neg P(u)$	$\Pi \vdash \neg((\neg Q(u) \land g(u) = u) \lor g(u) \neq u) \lor \neg P(u)$
		$\Pi \vdash ((Q(u) \lor g(u) \neq u) \land g(u) = u) \lor \neg P(u)$
θ_3 :	$\Sigma \vdash \theta_3$	$\Pi \vdash \neg \theta_3$
	Proof: Either $\neg P(f(c))$, then $R(d)$.	Proof:
	Otw. either $g(f(c)) \neq f(c)$.	$\neg (\neg P(fc) \land R(d)) \lor (P(fc) \land (\neg Q(fc) \land g(fc) = fc) \lor g(fc) \neq fc)$
	Otw. also $\neg Q(f(c))$.	$\equiv (P(fc) \vee \neg R(d)) \wedge (\neg P(fc) \vee (Q(fc) \vee g(fc) \neq fc) \wedge g(fc) = fc)$
	(J (1))	Have $g(fc) = fc$ and $\neg R(d)$, so remaining: $\neg P(fc) \lor Q(fc)$. Get by
		axiom and unification with $g(u) = u$.

$$\Sigma = \{R(z) \lor P(f(c)), \neg Q(y), \}$$

$$\Pi = \{g(u) = u, \neg P(g(v)) \lor Q(v), \neg R(d)\}$$

Propositional refutation tree (no non-trivial unifiers):

Lifting:

terms: g(f(c)), f(c), d

max Π-terms: $\{g(f(c)), d\} \sim \{x_1, x_2\}$

max Σ-terms: $\{f(c)\} \sim \{x_3\}$

$$\overline{(\neg P(f(c)) \land R(d))} \lor \overline{(P(f(c)) \land ((\neg Q(f(c)) \land g(f(c)) = f(c))} \lor \overline{g(f(c)) \neq f(c))})(x_1, x_2)$$

$$\Leftrightarrow \neg P(f(c)) \land R(x_2) \lor \overline{(P(f(c)) \land ((\neg Q(f(c)) \land x_1 = f(c))} \lor \overline{x_1 \neq f(c))})$$

By Lemma 12, $\Sigma \models \overline{\theta_3}$ (proof from above still goes through).

$$\hat{\theta}(x_3) = (\neg P(x_3) \land R(x_2)) \lor (P(x_3) \land ((\neg Q(x_3) \land x_1 = x_3) \lor x_1 \neq x_3))$$

quantifiers according to order: |d| < |f(c)| < |g(f(c))|

$$\theta = \forall x_2 \exists x_3 \forall x_1 (\neg P(x_3) \land R(x_2)) \quad \lor \quad (P(x_3) \land (\neg Q(x_3) \lor x_1 \neq x_3))$$

$$\neg \theta = \exists x_2 \forall x_3 \exists x_1 (P(x_3) \lor \neg R(x_2)) \land (\neg P(x_3) \lor (Q(x_3) \land x_1 = x_3))$$

$$\Rightarrow \Sigma \vdash \theta; \Pi \vdash \neg \theta$$

Example 2:

$$\Sigma = \{ P(c), \neg P(d) \}$$

$$\Pi = \{P(d) \lor g(u) = u, \neg P(g(x))\}$$

Refutation:

$$\frac{P(d) \lor g(u) = u \qquad \neg P(d)}{g(u) = u} \qquad \frac{\Pi}{\neg P(g(x))} \qquad u \mapsto x \qquad \frac{\Sigma}{P(c)} \qquad x \mapsto c$$

Relative interpolants:

$$\frac{ \begin{array}{c} \top & \bot \\ \hline (\neg P(d) \land \top) \lor (P(d) \land \bot) \equiv \neg P(d) \\ \hline (g(x) = x \land \top) \lor (g(x) \neq x \land \neg P(d)) \\ \hline (\neg P(c) \land \bot) \lor (P(c) \land (g(c) = c \lor (g(c) \neq c \land \neg P(d)))) \end{array}} x \mapsto c$$

$$\theta = P(c) \land (g(c) = c \lor \neg P(d))$$

$$\neg \theta = \neg P(c) \lor (g(c) \neq c \land P(d))$$

terms: g(c), c, d

max Π-terms: g(c)

max Σ-terms: c

ordered by length ASCENDING: $\{c, g(c)\}$

$$\overline{\theta}(x_2) = P(c) \land (x_2 = c \lor \neg P(d))$$

$$\hat{\theta}(x_1) = P(x_1) \land (x_2 = x_1 \lor \neg P(d))$$

$$\Sigma \vdash \exists x_1 \forall x_2 P(x_1) \land (x_2 = x_1 \lor \neg P(d))$$

$$\Pi \vdash \neg \exists x_1 \forall x_2 P(x_1) \land (x_2 = x_1 \lor \neg P(d))$$

$$\Pi \vdash \forall x_1 \exists x_2 \neg P(x_1) \lor (x_2 \neq x_1 \land P(d))$$

A possible interpolant: $\neg P(d) \land \exists x P(x)$

Example 2 (Craig translation):

$$\begin{split} \Sigma &= \{P(c), \neg P(d)\} \\ \Pi &= \{P(d) \lor g(u) = u, \neg P(g(x))\} \\ T(\Sigma) &= \{\forall x \ x = x\} \cup \{\forall x \forall y \ x = y \supset P(x) \supset P(y)\} \cup \Sigma \end{split}$$

$$T(\Pi) = \{ \forall x \ x = x \} \cup$$

$$\{ \forall x \forall y \ x = y \supset P(x) \supset P(y), \forall x_1 \forall x_2 \forall y_1 \forall y_2 \ x_1 = y_1 \supset x_2 = y_2 \supset x_1 = x_2 \supset y_1 = y_2, \forall x_1 \forall x_2 \forall y_1 \forall y_2 \ x_1 = y_1 \supset x_2 = y_2 \supset G(x_1, x_2) \supset G(y_1, y_2) \} \cup$$

$$\{ P(d) \lor (\exists z G(u, z) \land (\forall y G(u, y) \supset z = y) \land z = u), \neg P(g(x)) \}$$

to continue seems to be not work the effort

Example 3 Bonacina/Johannson:

$$\Sigma = \{A \lor B, \neg C\}$$
$$\Pi = \{\neg A \lor C, \neg B\}$$

$$\begin{array}{c|cccc}
 & \Sigma & \Pi & & \Sigma & & \\
 & A \lor B & \neg A \lor C & & \Sigma & & \\
\hline
 & B \lor C & & \neg C & \Pi & \\
\hline
 & B & & \neg B & \\
\hline
 & & & & &
\end{array}$$

Bon/Joh:

Huang:

$$\frac{\bot}{(\neg A \land \bot) \lor (A \land \top) \equiv A} \quad \bot$$

$$\frac{(\neg C \land A) \lor (C \land \bot) \equiv \neg C \land A}{(\neg B \land (\neg C \land A)) \lor (B \land \top)}$$

-> logically equivalent

Example 3B Bonacina/Johannson:

$$\Sigma = \{A \lor B, \neg C, \neg D\}$$

$$\Pi = \{\neg A \lor C, \neg B \lor D\}$$

$$\begin{array}{c|cccc} A & \Sigma & \Pi & & \Sigma & \Sigma & \Pi \\ \hline A & B & \neg A & \nabla C & & \Sigma & & \Pi \\ \hline B & & \neg C & & \neg D & & \neg B & \nabla D \\ \hline B & & & & & \neg B \end{array}$$

Bon/Joh:

Huang:

$$\frac{\bot \qquad \top}{(\neg A \land \bot) \lor (A \land \top) \equiv A} \qquad \bot \qquad \bot \qquad \top \\
\underline{(\neg C \land A) \lor (C \land \bot) \equiv \neg C \land A} \qquad (\neg D \land \top) \lor (D \land \bot) \equiv \neg D} \\
\underline{(\neg B \land \neg C \land A) \lor (B \land \neg D)}$$

-> not logically equivalent

Example 4: Paramodulation special case in Huang failed, see next page

$$\frac{P(x)\vee \neg Q(x)}{P(h(r))} \frac{\Pi}{Q(h(r))} = \frac{\Pi}{S = t} r \mapsto s = \frac{\Pi}{\neg P(h(s))} = \frac{\frac{\bot}{\neg Q(h(s))}}{\Box}$$

$$\frac{\frac{\bot}{\neg Q(h(r))} - \bot}{(s = t \wedge \neg Q(h(t))) \vee (s \neq t) \vee (s = t \wedge h(s) \neq h(t))} = \frac{\frac{\bot}{\neg Q(h(r))} - \bot}{(\neg P(h(s)) \wedge (s = t \wedge \neg Q(h(t))) \vee (s \neq t) \vee (s = t \wedge h(s) \neq h(t)))} = \frac{\bot}{(\neg P(h(s)) \wedge (s = t \wedge \neg Q(h(t))) \vee (s \neq t) \vee (s = t \wedge h(s) \neq h(t))) \vee P(h(s))}$$

$$\Sigma = \{P(x) \vee \neg Q(x)\}$$

$$\Pi = \{\neg P(h(s)), Q(h(r)), s = t\}$$

$$((s = t \wedge \neg Q(h(t))) \vee (s \neq t) \vee (s = t \wedge h(s) \neq h(t)) \vee P(h(s))$$

$$\theta = \neg Q(h(t)) \vee (s \neq t) \vee (s = t \wedge h(s) \neq h(t)) \vee P(h(s))$$

$$\neg \theta = Q(h(t)) \wedge (s = t) \wedge (s \neq t \vee h(s) = h(t)) \wedge \neg P(h(s))$$

$$\theta^* = \forall x_1 \forall x_2 \forall x_3 \forall x_4 \neg Q(x_2) \vee (x_3 \neq x_4) \vee (x_3 = x_4 \wedge x_1 \neq x_2) \vee P(x_1)$$

$$\neg \theta^* = \exists x_1 \exists x_2 \exists x_3 \exists x_4 Q(x_2) \wedge (x_3 = x_4) \wedge (x_3 \neq x_4 \vee x_1 = x_2) \wedge \neg P(x_1)$$

$$\Rightarrow \text{ special case not needed here}$$

Example 4b: Paramodulation special case in Huang

$$\Sigma = \{P(x) \vee \neg Q(x), \neg P(x) \vee Q(x), s = t\} \quad // \ P(x) \leftrightarrow Q(x) \qquad \qquad \Pi = \{\neg Q(h(s)), Q(h(t))\}$$

$$\frac{\frac{\bot}{\neg Q(h(t))}}{\frac{\bot}{((s=t) \land \neg Q(h(t))) \lor (s=t \land h(s) \neq h(t))}} \frac{\bot}{Q(h(s))}$$
$$\frac{\bot}{(((s=t) \land \neg Q(h(t))) \lor (s=t \land h(s) \neq h(t))) \lor Q(h(s))}$$

$$\frac{\Sigma \models \bot \mid P(x) \lor \neg Q(x) \qquad \Sigma \models \top \mid Q(x_2)}{\sum \models \neg Q(x_2) \mid P(x_2) \qquad \Sigma \models \bot \mid s = t} \frac{\sum \vdash \neg Q(x_2) \mid P(x_2) \qquad \Sigma \models \bot \mid s = t}{\sum \vdash ((s = t) \land \neg Q(x_2)) \lor (s = t \land x_1 \neq x_2) \mid P(x_1)} \frac{// \neg P(x) \lor Q(x) \qquad // \neg Q(h(s))}{// \neg P(h(s))}$$

$$\theta = (((s = t) \land \neg Q(h(t))) \lor (s = t \land h(s) \neq h(t))) \lor Q(h(s))$$

$$\neg \theta = (((s \neq t) \lor Q(h(t))) \land (s \neq t \lor h(s) = h(t))) \land \neg Q(h(s))$$

$$\theta^* = \forall x_1 \forall x_2 (((s = t) \land \neg Q(x_2)) \lor (s = t \land x_1 \neq x_2)) \lor Q(x_1)$$

$$\neg \theta^* = \exists x_1 \exists x_2 (((s \neq t) \lor Q(x_2)) \land (s \neq t \lor x_1 = x_2)) \land \neg Q(x_1)$$

special case relevant for Σ as it does not know about the relation of x_1 and x_2

$$\Sigma \models \forall x_1 \forall x_2 (((s=t) \land \neg Q(x_2)) \lor (s=t \land x_1 \neq x_2)) \lor Q(x_1)$$

$$\Sigma \models \forall x_1 \forall x_2 ((s=t) \land (\neg Q(x_2) \lor x_1 \neq x_2)) \lor Q(x_1)$$

$$\Sigma \models ((s = t) \land (\neg Q(b) \lor a \neq b)) \lor Q(a)$$

Intuition:

Get s = t for free, but else not relevant

$$\Sigma \models \neg Q(b) \lor a \neq b \lor Q(a)$$

$$\Sigma \models Q(b) \supset a = b \supset Q(a)$$

 \Rightarrow special case IS needed

Example 4c: Paramodulation special case in Huang, term contained in both Γ - and Δ -term

$$\Sigma = \{ P(x) \lor \neg Q(x), \neg P(y) \lor Q(y), s = t, \neg R_1(g(t)), \neg R_2(g(s)) \} \quad // \ P(x) \leftrightarrow Q(x) \qquad \Pi = \{ R_2(x_3) \lor \neg Q(h(x_3)), R_1(x_2) \lor Q(h(x_2)) \}$$

$$\frac{\neg R_1(g(t)) \qquad R_1(x_2) \vee Q(h(x_2)}{\neg R_1(g(t)) \mid Q(h(g(t)))} x_2 \mapsto g(t) \qquad \sum_{P(x) \vee \neg Q(x)} \\ \frac{\neg R_1(g(t)) \mid Q(h(g(t)))}{\neg R_1(g(t)) \wedge \neg Q(h(g(t)))} \mid P(h(g(t))) \qquad x \mapsto h(g(t)) \qquad \sum_{s = t} \\ \nu \mid P(h(g(s)))$$

$$\frac{\neg R_2(g(s)) \qquad R_2(x_3) \vee \neg Q(h(x_3))}{\neg R_2(g(s)) \mid \neg Q(h(g(s)))} x_3 \mapsto g(s) \qquad \stackrel{\Sigma}{\neg P(y) \vee Q(y)} y \mapsto h(g(s))$$

$$\frac{\neg R_1(g(s)) \wedge Q(h(g(s))) \mid \neg P(h(g(s)))}{\beta} \qquad y \mapsto h(g(s))$$

$$\frac{\neg P(y) \vee Q(y)}{\beta} \qquad y \mapsto h(g(s))$$

$$\frac{\neg P(y) \vee Q(y)}{\beta} \qquad y \mapsto h(g(s))$$

$$\nu_0 = \Big((s = t \land \alpha) \lor (s \neq t \land \bot) \Big) \sigma \quad \equiv \quad (s = t \land \alpha) \sigma \quad \equiv \quad s = t \land \neg R_1(g(t)) \land \neg Q(h(g(t)))$$

1.
$$\nu = \nu_0 \lor (s = t \land h(g(s)) \neq h(g(t)))\sigma$$

$$\Sigma \models \left(s = t \land \neg R_1(g(t)) \land \neg Q(h(g(t)))\right) \lor (s = t \land h(g(s)) \neq h(g(t))) \lor$$

$$P(h(g(s)))$$

$$\Sigma \models \exists y_1 \forall x_2 \forall x_3 (\left(s = t \land \neg R_1(y_1) \land \neg Q(x_2)\right) \lor (s = t \land x_1 \neq x_2) \lor P(x_1))$$

$$\checkmark$$

Example 5: cases for one pass overbinding algo

want to have step in between where only one of the "critical" terms appears in the interpolant and a decision on the order is forced

$$\frac{P(y_1, y_2)}{P(y_1, y_2)} = \frac{Q(\alpha) - Q(z) \vee P(z, \beta)}{-P(\alpha, \beta)} z \mapsto \alpha$$

$$\frac{\bot T}{Q(\alpha)^{\circ}} z \mapsto \alpha$$

$$\frac{\bot P(\alpha, \beta) \wedge Q(\alpha)}{P(\alpha, \beta) \wedge Q(\alpha)}$$

 \Rightarrow need to overbind α first, no matter which order would be assigned later

NOTE: b might be f(a), i.e. we don't know a priori at which level it is and how many smaller or larger terms will be added.

Let
$$\alpha = b$$
, $\beta = g(z)$.
 $\theta^* = \exists x_1 \forall x_2 P(x_1, x_2) \land Q(x_1)$
 $\neg \theta^* = \forall x_1 \exists x_2 \neg P(x_1, x_2) \lor \neg Q(x_1)$
 $\theta^{\circ *} = \exists x_1 Q(x_1)$
Let $\alpha = g(x)$, $\beta = b$.
 $\theta^* = \exists x_1 \forall x_2 P(x_1, x_2) \land Q(x_1)$
 $\neg \theta^* = \forall x_1 \exists x_2 \neg P(x_1, x_2) \lor \neg Q(x_1)$
 $\theta^{\circ *} = \exists x_1 Q(x_1)$

⇒ works (need not change quantifier order like this, but here, no predicate has parameters which depend on each other)

Example 5b: no equality, but quantifier order still matters

Prop Interpolant: P(a, g(a))Interpolant: $\forall x_1 \exists x_2 P(x_1, x_2)$

Example 5b': order matters, construction in multiple steps:

$$\frac{P(u,v,f(u,v)) \vee Q(u) \qquad \neg Q(a)}{P(a,v,f(a,v))} \quad u \mapsto a \qquad \prod_{\neg P(x,b,y)} x \mapsto a, v \mapsto b, y \mapsto f(a,b)$$

$$\frac{\bot}{Q(a)} \quad \neg P(x,b,y) \quad x \mapsto a, v \mapsto b, y \mapsto f(a,b)$$

$$\frac{\bot}{P(a,b,f(a,b)) \vee (\neg P(a,b,f(a,b)) \wedge Q(a))} \quad x \mapsto a, v \mapsto b, y \mapsto f(a,b)$$

Non-trivial interpolants:

$$\forall x_1 Q(x_1)$$

$$\forall x_1 \forall x_2 \exists x_3 P(x_1, x_2, x_3) \lor Q(x_1)$$

Example 5b": 5b' with different resolution order

$$\frac{P(u,v,f(u,v)) \vee Q(u) \qquad \neg P(x,b,y)}{Q(u)} \xrightarrow{P(x,b,y)} x \mapsto u,v \mapsto b,y \mapsto f(u,b) \qquad \stackrel{\Pi}{\neg Q(a)} u \mapsto a$$

$$\frac{\bot \qquad \top}{P(u,b,f(u,b))} \xrightarrow{x \mapsto u,v \mapsto b,y \mapsto f(u,b)} \qquad \top \qquad u \mapsto a$$

$$P(a,b,f(a,b)) \vee Q(a)$$

Non-trivial interpolants:

$$\forall x_2 \exists x_3 P(u, x_2, x_3)$$

$$\forall x_1 \forall x_2 \exists x_3 (P(x_1, x_2, x_3) \lor Q(x_1))$$

Example 5c: example with $\exists \forall$ necessarily in interpolant

 \Rightarrow as shown in Huang, swap Σ and Π from 5b'

$$\frac{P(u,v,f(u,v)) \vee Q(u) \qquad \neg Q(a)}{P(a,v,f(a,v))} \quad u \mapsto a \qquad \sum_{\neg P(x,b,y)} x \mapsto a, v \mapsto b, y \mapsto f(a,b)$$

$$\frac{\frac{\top}{\neg Q(a)} \quad u \mapsto a}{\neg P(a,b,f(a,b)) \land \neg Q(a)} \quad x \mapsto a, v \mapsto b, y \mapsto f(a,b)$$

Non-trivial interpolants:

$$\exists x_1 Q(x_1)$$

$$\exists x_1 \exists x_2 \forall x_3 (\neg P(x_1, x_2, x_3) \land \neg Q(x_1))$$

 \Rightarrow similar for 5b"

$$\frac{P(u,v,f(u,v)) \vee Q(u) \qquad \neg P(x,b,y)}{Q(u)} \xrightarrow{P(x,b,y)} x \mapsto u,v \mapsto b,y \mapsto f(u,b) \qquad \xrightarrow{\Sigma} \neg Q(a) \qquad u \mapsto a$$

$$\frac{\frac{\top}{\neg P(u,b,f(u,b))} x \mapsto u,v \mapsto b,y \mapsto f(u,b)}{\neg Q(a) \land \neg P(a,b,f(a,b))} \xrightarrow{\bot} u \mapsto a$$

Non-trival interpolants:

$$\exists x_2 \forall x_3 \neg (P(u, x_2, x_3))$$

$$\exists x_1 \exists x_2 \forall x_3 (\neg Q(x_1) \land \neg (P(x_2, x_3)))$$