$$\frac{\forall x_a \exists y_{f(a)} Q(x_a, y_{f(a)}) \mid A \qquad \forall x_a (S(x_a)) \mid \neg A}{\forall x_a (S(x_a)) \land \forall x_a \exists y_{f(a)} Q(x_a, y_{f(a)}) \mid \Box}$$

no first order operation in this last inference ⇒ nothing to prove

## 502 – example with multiple, independent a's

derivation:

$$\frac{P(f(x),x) \vee Q(z) \vee R(z) \qquad \stackrel{\Pi}{\neg R(a)}}{R(a) \mid P(f(x),x) \vee Q(a) \qquad \stackrel{\Pi}{\neg Q(u)} \qquad \stackrel{\Pi}{\neg P(z,a)}}$$

$$\frac{Q(a) \vee R(a) \mid P(f(x),x) \qquad \qquad \neg P(z,a)}{P(f(a),a) \vee Q(a) \vee R(a) \mid \Box}$$

invariant:  $\ell_{\Delta}[LI(C)] \mid \ell_{\Delta}[C]$ 

Detailed derivation:

$$\begin{split} \Gamma &\vDash \forall x_a (Q(x_a) \vee R(x_a)) \mid P(f(x), x) \\ \Gamma &\vDash P(z, x_a) \\ \text{hence} \\ \Gamma &\vDash \forall x_a \Big( \forall x_a (Q(x_a) \vee R(x_a)) \mid P(f(x_a), x_a) \Big) \\ \Gamma &\vDash \forall x_a P(f(x_a), x_a) \\ \text{hence} \\ \Gamma &\vDash \forall x_a \Big( \forall x_a (Q(x_a) \vee R(x_a)) \mid P(f(x_a), x_a) \Big) \quad \land \quad \forall x_a P(f(x_a), x_a) \\ \text{hence} \\ \Gamma &\vDash \forall x_a \Big( \forall x_a (Q(x_a) \vee R(x_a)) \mid P(f(x_a), x_a) \quad \land \quad P(f(x_a), x_a) \Big) \\ \text{simplified} \\ \Gamma &\vDash \forall x_a \Big( \forall x_a (Q(x_a) \vee R(x_a)) \mid P(f(x_a), x_a) \Big) \\ \end{split}$$

lifting:  $LI(C) \mid C$ 

$$\frac{P(f(x),x) \vee Q(z) \vee R(z) \qquad \stackrel{\Pi}{\neg R(a)}}{R(a) \mid P(f(x),x) \vee Q(a) \qquad \stackrel{\Pi}{\neg Q(u)}}$$

$$\frac{Q(a) \vee R(a) \mid P(f(x),x) \qquad \qquad \Pi}{Q(a) \vee R(a) \mid P(f(x),x) \qquad \qquad \neg P(z,a)}$$

$$\frac{\forall x_a (Q(x_a) \vee R(x_a)) \mid P(f(x),x) \qquad \neg P(z,a)}{P(f(a),a) \vee \forall x_a (Q(x_a) \vee R(x_a)) \mid \Box}$$

$$\forall x_a \exists y_{f(a)} \Big( P(y_{f(a)},x_a) \vee \forall x_a (Q(x_a) \vee R(x_a)) \Big) \mid \Box$$