

Exercise 3.2.1 Prove $R^d_{abc} = 0$ is a necessary and sufficient condition for being able to interchange the order of covariant differentiation of fields

(a) For a contravariant vector field λ^a , show $\lambda^a_{;bc} - \lambda^a_{;cb} = -R^a_{dbc} \lambda^d$

$\lambda^a_{;b} \stackrel{(2.55)}{=} \partial_b \lambda^a + \Gamma^a_{eb} \lambda^e$. Set $\tau^a_b \equiv \lambda^a_{;b}$. Then

$$\begin{aligned} \lambda^a_{;bc} &= \tau^a_{b;c} \stackrel{(2.59)}{=} \partial_c \tau^a_b + \Gamma^a_{ec} \tau^e_b - \Gamma^e_{bc} \tau^a_e = \partial_c \lambda^a_{;b} + \Gamma^a_{ec} \lambda^e_{;b} - \Gamma^e_{bc} \lambda^a_{;e} \\ &= \partial_c \partial_b \lambda^a + (\partial_c \Gamma^a_{db}) \lambda^d + \Gamma^a_{db} \partial_c \lambda^d \\ &\quad + \Gamma^a_{ec} [\partial_b \lambda^e + \Gamma^e_{db} \lambda^d] - \Gamma^e_{bc} [\partial_e \lambda^a + \Gamma^e_{de} \lambda^d] \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \lambda^a_{;cb} &= \partial_b \partial_c \lambda^a + (\partial_b \Gamma^a_{dc}) \lambda^d + \Gamma^a_{dc} \partial_b \lambda^d \\ &\quad + \Gamma^a_{eb} [\partial_c \lambda^e + \Gamma^e_{dc} \lambda^d] - \Gamma^e_{cb} [\partial_e \lambda^a + \Gamma^e_{de} \lambda^d] \end{aligned}$$

The colored items subtract out, leaving

$$\lambda^a_{;bc} - \lambda^a_{;cb} = (\partial_c \Gamma^a_{db} - \partial_b \Gamma^a_{dc} + \Gamma^a_{ec} \Gamma^e_{db} - \Gamma^a_{eb} \Gamma^e_{dc}) \lambda^d$$

Swapping a and d in equation (3.13) yields

$$R^a_{dbc} \equiv \partial_b \Gamma^a_{dc} - \partial_c \Gamma^a_{db} + \Gamma^e_{dc} \Gamma^a_{eb} - \Gamma^e_{db} \Gamma^a_{ec}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \Rightarrow -R^a_{dbc} \lambda^d &\stackrel{(3.13)}{=} -(\partial_b \Gamma^a_{dc} - \partial_c \Gamma^a_{db} + \Gamma^e_{dc} \Gamma^a_{eb} - \Gamma^e_{db} \Gamma^a_{ec}) \lambda^d \\ &= \lambda^a_{;bc} - \lambda^a_{;cb} \quad \checkmark \end{aligned}$$

(b) For a type (2,0) tensor field τ^{ab} , show $\tau^{ab}_{;cd} - \tau^{ab}_{;dc} = -R^a_{ecd} \tau^{eb} - R^b_{ecd} \tau^{ae}$

$$R^a_{ecd} \tau^{eb} = (\partial_c \Gamma^a_{ed} - \partial_d \Gamma^a_{ec} + \Gamma^f_{ed} \Gamma^a_{fc} - \Gamma^f_{ec} \Gamma^a_{fd}) \tau^{eb}$$

$$R^b_{ecd} \tau^{ae} = (\partial_c \Gamma^b_{ed} - \partial_d \Gamma^b_{ec} + \Gamma^f_{ed} \Gamma^b_{fc} - \Gamma^f_{ec} \Gamma^b_{fd}) \tau^{ae}$$

$$\tau^{ab}_{;c} \stackrel{(2.57)}{=} \partial_c \tau^{ab} + \Gamma^a_{ec} \tau^{eb} + \Gamma^b_{ec} \tau^{ae}$$

$$\text{Define } \sigma^{ab}_c \equiv \tau^{ab}_{;c}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \tau^{ab}_{;cd} &= \sigma^{ab}_{c;d} \stackrel{(2.59a)}{=} \partial_d \sigma^{ab}_c + \Gamma^a_{ed} \sigma^{eb}_c + \Gamma^b_{ed} \sigma^{ea}_c - \Gamma^e_{cd} \sigma^{ab}_e \\ &= \partial_d \tau^{ab}_{;c} + \Gamma^a_{ed} \tau^{eb}_{;c} + \Gamma^b_{ed} \tau^{ea}_{;c} - \Gamma^e_{cd} \tau^{ab}_{;e} \\ &= \partial_d (\partial_c \tau^{ab} + \Gamma^a_{ec} \tau^{eb} + \Gamma^b_{ec} \tau^{ae}) + \Gamma^a_{ed} \tau^{eb}_{;c} + \Gamma^b_{ed} \tau^{ea}_{;c} - \Gamma^e_{cd} \tau^{ab}_{;e} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \tau^{ab}_{;cd} &= \partial_d \partial_c \tau^{ab} + (\partial_d \Gamma^a_{ec}) \tau^{eb} + \Gamma^a_{ec} \partial_d \tau^{eb} + (\partial_d \Gamma^b_{ec}) \tau^{ae} + \Gamma^b_{ec} \partial_d \tau^{ae} \\ &\quad + \Gamma^a_{ed} [\partial_c \tau^{eb} + \Gamma^e_{fc} \tau^{fb} + \Gamma^b_{fc} \tau^{ef}] + \Gamma^b_{ed} [\partial_c \tau^{ea} + \Gamma^e_{fc} \tau^{fa} + \Gamma^a_{fc} \tau^{ef}] \\ &\quad - \Gamma^e_{cd} [\partial_e \tau^{ab} + \Gamma^a_{fe} \tau^{fb} + \Gamma^b_{fe} \tau^{af}] \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \tau^{ab}_{;dc} &= \partial_c \partial_d \tau^{ab} + (\partial_c \Gamma^a_{ed}) \tau^{eb} + \Gamma^a_{ed} \partial_c \tau^{eb} + (\partial_c \Gamma^b_{ed}) \tau^{ae} + \Gamma^b_{ed} \partial_c \tau^{ae} \\ &\quad + \Gamma^a_{ec} [\partial_d \tau^{eb} + \Gamma^e_{fd} \tau^{fb} + \Gamma^b_{fd} \tau^{ef}] + \Gamma^b_{ec} [\partial_d \tau^{ea} + \Gamma^e_{fd} \tau^{fa} + \Gamma^a_{fd} \tau^{ef}] \\ &\quad - \Gamma^e_{dc} [\partial_e \tau^{ab} + \Gamma^a_{fe} \tau^{fb} + \Gamma^b_{fe} \tau^{af}] \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \tau^{ab}_{;cd} - \tau^{ab}_{;dc} &= (\partial_d \Gamma^a_{ec} - \partial_c \Gamma^a_{ed}) \tau^{eb} + (\Gamma^a_{ed} \Gamma^e_{fc} - \Gamma^a_{ec} \Gamma^e_{fd}) \tau^{fb} \\ &\quad + (\partial_d \Gamma^b_{ec} - \partial_c \Gamma^b_{ed}) \tau^{ae} + (\Gamma^b_{ed} \Gamma^e_{fc} - \Gamma^b_{ec} \Gamma^e_{fd}) \tau^{fa} \\ &= [\partial_d \Gamma^a_{ec} - \partial_c \Gamma^a_{ed} + \Gamma^a_{fd} \Gamma^f_{ec} - \Gamma^a_{fc} \Gamma^f_{ed}] \tau^{eb} \\ &\quad + [\partial_d \Gamma^b_{ec} - \partial_c \Gamma^b_{ed} + \Gamma^b_{fd} \Gamma^f_{ec} - \Gamma^b_{fc} \Gamma^f_{ed}] \tau^{ae} \\ &= -R^a_{ecd} \tau^{eb} - R^b_{ecd} \tau^{ae} \quad \checkmark \end{aligned}$$

(c) Guess the form of $\tau^{ab}_{c;de} - \tau^{ab}_{c;ed}$

First, it is clear that $\tau^{abc}_{;de} - \tau^{abc}_{;ed} = -R^a_{fde} \tau^{fbc} - R^b_{fde} \tau^{afc} - R^c_{fde} \tau^{abf}$.

Next, the mnemonic "co-below and minus" suggests that $\lambda_{a;bc} - \lambda_{a;cb} = R^d_{abc} \lambda_d$.

So a guess is that $\tau^{ab}_{c;de} - \tau^{ab}_{c;ed} = -R^a_{fde} \tau^{fb}_c - R^b_{fde} \tau^{af}_c + R^f_{cde} \tau^{ab}_f$.

(d) Guess the form of $\tau^{a_1 \dots a_r}_{b_1 \dots b_s;cd} - \tau^{a_1 \dots a_r}_{b_1 \dots b_s;dc}$

From (c), the general form is clear:

$$\begin{aligned} \tau^{a_1 \dots a_r}_{b_1 \dots b_s;cd} - \tau^{a_1 \dots a_r}_{b_1 \dots b_s;dc} = & - \sum_{k=1}^r R^{a_k}_{ecd} \tau^{a_1 \dots a_{k-1} e a_{k+1} \dots a_r}_{b_1 \dots b_s} \\ & + \sum_{k=1}^s R^e_{b_k cd} \tau^{a_1 \dots a_r}_{b_1 \dots b_{k-1} e b_{k+1} \dots b_s} \end{aligned} \quad (a)$$

(e) Prove the claim that $R^d_{abc} = 0$ is a necessary and sufficient condition for being able to interchange the order of covariant differentiation of fields

If $R^d_{abc} = 0$ then (a) shows that the order of differentiation can be reversed, and if the order can be reversed, then (a) shows that

$$R^d_{abc} = -R^d_{acb} \Leftrightarrow R^d_{abc} = 0.$$

This proves the claim.