
MODULE *Contracts*

This spec captures the behaviour of commitment transactions on the two sides of a Lightning channel.

We model the various kinds of outputs a commitment transactions will have over its lifetime.

The state of the commitment transaction changes in response to the various actions like supersede, publish, etc are taken by parties.

We also do not deal with the communication protocol between nodes for creating and updating commitment transactions. This spec will only focus on the various commitment transaction and their lifecycle in response to interaction between parties and the blockchain.

We ignore the details of how transactions are signed and just mark transactions as signed. This lets us focus on the specifying the behaviour of the commitment transactions without dealing with lower level complexities.

The model defines the initial balance from *alice* to bob. TLA+ will handle situations where channels are balanced and when all the balance is on the other side.

TODO: Add actions for closing channels. Currently we only have support for breach *tx* and the corresponding breach remedy txs.

TODO: Add *HTLCs*.

EXTENDS *Integers*,
TLC,
Sequences,
FiniteSets

CONSTANTS

<i>CSV</i> ,	The <i>csv</i> value to use in contracts
<i>InitialBalance</i>	Initial balances for <i>alice</i> and bob

$SeqToSet(s) \triangleq \{s[i] : i \in \text{DOMAIN } s\}$

Current channel contracts only ever have two parties

$Party \triangleq \{\text{"alice"}, \text{"bob"}\}$

For the first revocation we only need two keys per party

$NumKey \triangleq 2$

Set of all keys

$Key \triangleq \{\langle p, k \rangle : p \in Party, k \in 0 \dots NumKey\}$

Value to capture missing *CSV* in output

$NoCSV \triangleq \text{CHOOSE } c : c \notin 0 \dots CSV$

Abstract out all outputs as meant to be spent by a party, is it signed by party and other party.

$Output \triangleq [party : Party,$
 $type : \{ "multisig", "p2wkh" \},$
 $csv : \{ CSV \} \cup \{ NoCSV \},$
 $amount : 0 \dots InitialBalance * 2]$ All the balance can be on one side

Multisig with no *csv* encumbrance

$CreateMultisigOutput(party, amount) \triangleq$
 $[type \mapsto "multisig",$
 $party \mapsto party,$
 $csv \mapsto NoCSV,$
 $amount \mapsto amount]$

$CreateRSMCOutput(party, amount) \triangleq$
 $[type \mapsto "multisig",$
 $party \mapsto party,$
 $csv \mapsto CSV,$
 $amount \mapsto amount]$

$CreatePKOutput(party, amount) \triangleq$
 $[type \mapsto "p2wkh",$
 $party \mapsto party,$
 $csv \mapsto NoCSV,$
 $amount \mapsto amount]$

$NoSpendHeight \triangleq -1$

In contrast to txids, we simply use the party, index tuple to find the *tx* and the *vout* to get the output pointed to by the input

$Input \triangleq [party : Party, index : Int, vout : Int]$

Transaction record.

$Tx \triangleq [party : Party,$
 $index : Int,$
 $height : Int,$
 $inputs : Seq(Input),$
 $outputs : Seq(Output),$
 $party_signed : BOOLEAN,$
 $other_party_signed : BOOLEAN]$

VARIABLES

<i>alice_cts</i> ,	Commitment <i>tx</i> for <i>alice</i>
<i>bob_cts</i> ,	Commitment <i>tx</i> for bob
<i>alice_brs</i> ,	Breach remedy transactions for <i>alice</i>
<i>bob_brs</i> ,	Breach remedy transactions for bob
<i>mempool</i> ,	The <i>CT</i> txs that have been broadcasted.

published, The *CT* that has been included in a block and confirmed.
index,
chain_height

$\text{vars} \triangleq \langle \text{alice_cts}, \text{bob_cts}, \text{alice_brs}, \text{bob_brs}, \text{mempool}, \text{published}, \text{chain_height}, \text{index} \rangle$

Helper function to get other party

$\text{OtherParty}(\text{party}) \triangleq \text{CHOOSE } p \in \text{Party} : p \neq \text{party}$

The channel funding transaction. All commitment txs spend from the output of this *tx*.

$\text{FundingTx} \triangleq$
 $[\text{party} \mapsto \text{"alice"}, \quad \text{Only } \text{alice} \text{ is funding}$
 $\text{index} \mapsto 1,$
 $\text{height} \mapsto 1,$
 $\text{inputs} \mapsto \langle \rangle, \quad \text{FT inputs do not matter}$
 $\text{outputs} \mapsto \langle \text{CreateMultisigOutput}(\text{"alice"}, \text{InitialBalance}) \rangle,$
 $\text{party_signed} \mapsto \text{TRUE},$
 $\text{other_party_signed} \mapsto \text{TRUE}$
 $]$

Create a commitment transaction given the party, index and key to use.

Other party hands this *CT* to this party, therefore it is signed by other party.

$\text{CreateCT}(\text{party}, i, \text{key_num}, \text{amount}, \text{other_amount}) \triangleq$
 $[\text{party} \mapsto \text{party},$
 $\text{index} \mapsto i,$
 $\text{height} \mapsto \text{NoSpendHeight},$
 $\quad \text{Input for } \text{CT} \text{ is the } \text{FT multisig} \text{ output } (1, 1)$
 $\text{inputs} \mapsto \langle [\text{party} \mapsto \text{"alice"}, \text{index} \mapsto 1, \text{vout} \mapsto 1] \rangle,$
 $\text{outputs} \mapsto \langle \text{CreateRSMCOutput}(\text{party}, \text{amount}),$
 $\quad \text{CreatePKOutput}(\text{OtherParty}(\text{party}), \text{other_amount}) \rangle,$
 $\text{party_signed} \mapsto \text{FALSE},$
 $\text{other_party_signed} \mapsto \text{TRUE}]$

Breach remedy transactions are handled as presigned transactions instead of by passing private keys around. This is different from the Poon-Dryja *LN* paper.

The party creates this *tx*, signs it and sends it to the other party.

$\text{CreateBR}(\text{party}, i, \text{amount}) \triangleq$
 $[\text{party} \mapsto \text{party},$
 $\text{index} \mapsto i,$
 $\text{height} \mapsto \text{NoSpendHeight},$
 $\quad \text{BR spend the RSMC output from the corresponding index CT.}$
 $\text{inputs} \mapsto \langle [\text{party} \mapsto \text{OtherParty}(\text{party}), \text{index} \mapsto i, \text{vout} \mapsto 1] \rangle,$
 $\quad \text{Spending BR output will give the balance to party}$

$outputs \mapsto \langle CreatePKOutput(party, amount) \rangle,$
 $party_signed \mapsto TRUE,$
 [The other party presigns the *BR* so that this party can spend it
 TODO: switch to exchanging private keys for the *BR* instead
 $other_party_signed \mapsto TRUE]$

$Init \triangleq$

[Balanced channel to start with
 $\wedge alice_cts = \{ CreateCT("alice", 2, 0, InitialBalance, 0) \}$
 $\wedge bob_cts = \{ CreateCT("bob", 2, 0, 0, InitialBalance) \}$
 $\wedge alice_brs = \{ CreateBR("bob", 2, InitialBalance) \}$
 $\wedge bob_brs = \{ CreateBR("alice", 2, 0) \}$ [Bob did not add funds]
 $\wedge mempool = \{ \}$
 $\wedge published = \{ FundingTx \}$
 $\wedge index = 3$
 $\wedge chain_height = 1$ [The genesis block is the *FT*]

$TypeInvariant \triangleq$

$\wedge index \in Int$
 $\wedge alice_cts \in SUBSET Tx$
 $\wedge bob_cts \in SUBSET Tx$
 $\wedge alice_brs \in SUBSET Tx$
 $\wedge bob_brs \in SUBSET Tx$
 $\wedge mempool \in SUBSET Tx$
 $\wedge published \in SUBSET Tx$

$LastCT(part_cts) \triangleq$

$CHOOSE ct \in part_cts : \forall y \in part_cts : ct.index \geq y.index$

$MaxIndex(part_cts) \triangleq$

$(LastCT(part_cts)).index$

$AnyCT \triangleq (CHOOSE ct \in alice_cts \cup bob_cts : TRUE)$

Create commitment transaction as well as the corresponding breach remedy txs.

Breach remedy transactions are pre-signed transactions instead of they private key being sent over to the other party.

delta is the balance going from *alice* to bob. We allow negative balances to enable payments in other other direction.

Parties are free to keep creating *CT* even if *FT* is spent. They will not be usable, but the protocol does not disallow this.

$SupersedeCommitmentTx(delta) \triangleq$

\wedge

LET

$key_index \triangleq 1$ [TODO: manage key numbers]

$$\begin{aligned}
& last_alice_ct \triangleq LastCT(alice_cts) \\
& last_bob_ct \triangleq LastCT(bob_cts) \\
\text{IN} & \\
& \text{Create CTs till channel is not closed} \\
& \wedge published = \{FundingTx\} \\
& \wedge last_alice_ct.outputs[1].amount - delta > 0 \\
& \wedge last_alice_ct.outputs[2].amount + delta \leq InitialBalance \\
& \wedge alice_cts' = alice_cts \cup \\
& \quad \{CreateCT("alice", index, key_index, \\
& \quad \quad last_alice_ct.outputs[1].amount - delta, \\
& \quad \quad last_alice_ct.outputs[2].amount + delta)\} \\
& \wedge bob_cts' = bob_cts \cup \\
& \quad \{CreateCT("bob", index, key_index, \\
& \quad \quad last_bob_ct.outputs[1].amount + delta, \\
& \quad \quad last_bob_ct.outputs[2].amount - delta)\} \\
& \text{Alice's gets a BR it can immediately spend when corresponding} \\
& \text{CT is spen, and vice versa} \\
& \wedge alice_brs' = alice_brs \cup \\
& \quad \{CreateBR("bob", index, last_alice_ct.outputs[1].amount)\} \\
& \wedge bob_brs' = bob_brs \cup \\
& \quad \{CreateBR("alice", index, last_bob_ct.outputs[1].amount)\} \\
& \wedge index' = index + 1 \\
& \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle mempool, published, chain_height \rangle
\end{aligned}$$

Broadcast a commitment transaction to the blockchain. The commitment is first signed. The protocol allows all commitments to be broadcast, what happens next depends on the status of the commitment transaction.

If the tx is the latest commitment transaction it can be spent later.

If not, it gives the other party a chance to spend the breach remedy tx .

TODO: We only spec *CSV* (self) commitment transaction. We need to handle the non-*CSV* output being published and co-op closes.

$$\begin{aligned}
& BroadcastCommitment(party) \triangleq \\
& \quad \wedge alice_cts \neq \{\} \\
& \quad \wedge bob_cts \neq \{\} \\
& \quad \wedge \\
& \quad \text{LET} \\
& \quad \quad key_index \triangleq 1 \quad \text{TODO, manage key numbers} \\
& \quad \quad cts \triangleq \text{IF } party = "alice" \text{ THEN } alice_cts \text{ ELSE } bob_cts \\
& \quad \quad ct \triangleq \text{CHOOSE } ct \in cts : \text{TRUE} \\
& \quad \text{IN} \\
& \quad \quad \text{The commitment is not already in mempool} \\
& \quad \quad \wedge ct \notin mempool \\
& \quad \quad \text{No commitment has already been confirmed} \\
& \quad \quad \wedge published = \{FundingTx\}
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \wedge \text{mempool}' = \text{mempool} \cup \{[ct \text{ EXCEPT } !.party_signed = \text{TRUE}]\} \\ & \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{alice_cts}, \text{bob_cts}, \text{alice_brs}, \text{bob_brs}, \\ & \quad \text{published}, \text{index}, \text{chain_height} \rangle \end{aligned}$$

Confirm any transaction from *mempool*— this indeed is sparta. Any *mempool* *tx* can be confirmed. So we model just that.

The only requirement is to make sure the *CSV* has expired.

$$\begin{aligned} \text{ConfirmMempoolTx} & \triangleq \\ & \exists tx \in \text{mempool} : \\ & \quad \wedge \exists o \in \text{SeqToSet}(tx.outputs) : \\ & \quad \quad \vee o.type = \text{"multisig"} \wedge o.csv < \text{chain_height} \quad \text{CSV expired} \\ & \quad \quad \vee o.type = \text{"p2wkh"} \wedge o.csv = \text{NoCSV} \quad \text{Without a CSV} \\ & \quad \wedge tx \notin \text{published} \quad \text{Tx is not already confirmed} \\ & \quad \wedge \text{mempool}' = \text{mempool} \setminus \{tx\} \\ & \quad \wedge \text{chain_height}' = \text{chain_height} + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge \text{published}' = \text{published} \cup \{[tx \text{ EXCEPT } !.height = \text{chain_height}']\} \\ & \quad \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{alice_cts}, \text{bob_cts}, \text{alice_brs}, \text{bob_brs}, \\ & \quad \quad \text{index} \rangle \end{aligned}$$

Broadcast a breach remedy transaction in response to a commitment transaction.

party is broadcasting the *tx*

$$\begin{aligned} \text{BroadcastBR} & \triangleq \\ & \wedge \exists \langle m, b \rangle \in \text{mempool} \times (\text{alice_brs} \cup \text{bob_brs}) : \\ & \quad \wedge \text{published} = \{\text{FundingTx}\} \quad \text{Channel is not closed yet} \\ & \quad \wedge m.outputs[1].type = \text{"multisig"} \\ & \quad \quad \text{Offending tx in mempool} \\ & \quad \wedge \text{chain_height} - 1 < m.outputs[1].csv \\ & \quad \wedge m.party = b.party \\ & \quad \wedge \text{mempool}' = \text{mempool} \cup \{m\} \\ & \quad \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{alice_cts}, \text{bob_cts}, \text{alice_brs}, \text{bob_brs}, \\ & \quad \quad \text{index}, \text{published}, \text{chain_height} \rangle \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Next} & \triangleq \\ & \vee \exists d \in 1 \dots 2 : \text{SupersedeCommitmentTx}(d) \\ & \vee \exists p \in \text{Party} : \text{BroadcastCommitment}(p) \\ & \vee \text{BroadcastBR} \\ & \vee \text{ConfirmMempoolTx} \end{aligned}$$

$$\text{Spec} \triangleq \text{Init} \wedge \Box[\text{Next}]_{\langle \text{vars} \rangle}$$

$$\text{Liveness} \triangleq \text{WF}_{\text{vars}}(\text{BroadcastBR})$$

$$\text{FairSpec} \triangleq \text{Spec} \wedge \text{Liveness}$$

TODO – Add *BalanceInvariant*: Sum of all amounts on all *txs* = *InitialBalance*
