

---

MODULE *LNContracts*

---

This spec captures the behaviour of commitment transactions on the two sides of a Lightning channel.

We model the various kinds of outputs a commitment transactions will have over its lifetime.

The state of the commitment transaction changes in response to the various actions like supersede, publish, etc are taken by parties.

We also do not deal with the communication protocol between nodes for creating and updating commitment transactions. This spec will only focus on the various commitment transaction and their lifecycle in response to interaction between parties and the blockchain.

We ignore the details of how transactions are signed and just mark transactions as signed. This lets us focus on the specifying the behaviour of the commitment transactions without dealing with lower level complexities.

The model defines the initial balance from *alice* to bob. TLA+ will handle situations where channels are balanced and when all the balance is on the other side.

*TODO*: Add actions for closing channels. Currently we only have support for breach *tx* and the corresponding breach remedy txs.

*TODO*: Add *HTLCs*.

EXTENDS *Integers*,  
*TLC*,  
*Sequences*,  
*FiniteSets*

CONSTANTS

<i>CSV</i> ,	The <i>csv</i> value to use in contracts
<i>InitialBalance</i>	Initial balances for <i>alice</i> and bob

---

$SeqToSet(s) \triangleq \{s[i] : i \in \text{DOMAIN } s\}$

---

Current channel contracts only ever have two parties

$Party \triangleq \{\text{"alice"}, \text{"bob"}\}$

For the first revocation we only need two keys per party

$NumKey \triangleq 2$

Set of all keys

$Key \triangleq \{\langle p, k \rangle : p \in Party, k \in 0 \dots NumKey\}$

Value to capture missing *CSV* in output

$NoCSV \triangleq \text{CHOOSE } c : c \notin 0 \dots CSV$

Abstract out all outputs as meant to be spent by a party, is it signed by party and other party.

$Output \triangleq [party : Party,$   
 $type : \{ "multisig", "p2wkh" \},$   
 $csv : \{ CSV \} \cup \{ NoCSV \},$   
 $amount : 0 \dots InitialBalance * 2]$  All the balance can be on one side

Multisig with no *csv* encumbrance

$CreateMultisigOutput(party, amount) \triangleq$   
 $[type \mapsto "multisig",$   
 $party \mapsto party,$   
 $csv \mapsto NoCSV,$   
 $amount \mapsto amount]$

$CreateRSMCOutput(party, amount) \triangleq$   
 $[type \mapsto "multisig",$   
 $party \mapsto party,$   
 $csv \mapsto CSV,$   
 $amount \mapsto amount]$

$CreatePKOutput(party, amount) \triangleq$   
 $[type \mapsto "p2wkh",$   
 $party \mapsto party,$   
 $csv \mapsto NoCSV,$   
 $amount \mapsto amount]$

$NoSpendHeight \triangleq -1$

In contrast to txids, we simply use the party, index tuple to find the *tx* and the *vout* to get the output pointed to by the input

$Input \triangleq [party : Party, index : Int, vout : Int]$

Transaction record.

$Tx \triangleq [party : Party,$   
 $index : Int,$   
 $height : Int,$   
 $inputs : Seq(Input),$   
 $outputs : Seq(Output),$   
 $party\_signed : BOOLEAN,$   
 $other\_party\_signed : BOOLEAN]$

VARIABLES

<i>cts</i> ,	Commitment <i>tx</i> for all parties
<i>brs</i> ,	Breach remedy transactions for all parties
<i>mempool</i> ,	The <i>CT</i> txs that have been broadcasted.
<i>published</i> ,	The <i>CT</i> that has been included in a block and confirmed.
<i>index</i> ,	

*chain\_height*

$vars \triangleq \langle cts, brs, mempool, published, chain\_height, index \rangle$

Helper function to get other party

$OtherParty(party) \triangleq \text{CHOOSE } p \in Party : p \neq party$

The channel funding transaction. All commitment txs spend from the output of this *tx*.

$FundingTx \triangleq$   
 $[party \mapsto \text{"alice"}, \quad \text{Only } alice \text{ is funding}]$   
 $index \mapsto 1,$   
 $height \mapsto 1,$   
 $inputs \mapsto \langle \rangle, \quad \text{FT inputs do not matter}$   
 $outputs \mapsto \langle CreateMultisigOutput(\text{"alice"}, InitialBalance) \rangle,$   
 $party\_signed \mapsto \text{TRUE},$   
 $other\_party\_signed \mapsto \text{TRUE}$   
 $]$

Create a commitment transaction given the party, index and key to use.

Other party hands this *CT* to this party, therefore it is signed by other party.

$CreateCT(party, i, key\_num, amount, other\_amount) \triangleq$   
 $[party \mapsto party,$   
 $index \mapsto i,$   
 $height \mapsto NoSpendHeight,$   
 $\quad \text{Input for } CT \text{ is the } FT \text{ multisig output } (1, 1)$   
 $inputs \mapsto \langle [party \mapsto \text{"alice"}, index \mapsto 1, vout \mapsto 1] \rangle,$   
 $outputs \mapsto \langle CreateRSMCOutput(party, amount),$   
 $\quad CreatePKOutput(OtherParty(party), other\_amount) \rangle,$   
 $party\_signed \mapsto \text{FALSE},$   
 $other\_party\_signed \mapsto \text{TRUE}]$

Breach remedy transactions are handled as presigned transactions instead of by passing private keys around. This is different from the Poon-Dryja *LN* paper.

The party creates this *tx*, signs it and sends it to the other party.

$CreateBR(party, i, amount) \triangleq$   
 $[party \mapsto party,$   
 $index \mapsto i,$   
 $height \mapsto NoSpendHeight,$   
 $\quad BR \text{ spend the } RSMC \text{ output from the corresponding index } CT.$   
 $inputs \mapsto \langle [party \mapsto OtherParty(party), index \mapsto i, vout \mapsto 1] \rangle,$   
 $\quad \text{Spending } BR \text{ output will give the balance to party}$   
 $outputs \mapsto \langle CreatePKOutput(party, amount) \rangle,$   
 $party\_signed \mapsto \text{TRUE},$   
 $\quad \text{The other party presigns the } BR \text{ so that this party can spend it}$

*TODO*: switch to exchanging private keys for the *BR* instead  
 $other\_party\_signed \mapsto \text{TRUE}$ ]

*Init*  $\triangleq$   
 Balanced channel to start with  
 $\wedge cts = \{CreateCT("alice", 2, 0, InitialBalance, 0),$   
 $\quad CreateCT("bob", 2, 0, 0, InitialBalance)\}$   
 $\wedge brs = \{CreateBR("bob", 2, InitialBalance),$   
 $\quad CreateBR("alice", 2, 0)\}$  Bob did not add funds  
 $\wedge mempool = \{\}$   
 $\wedge published = \{FundingTx\}$   
 $\wedge index = 3$   
 $\wedge chain\_height = 1$  The genesis block is the *FT*

*TypeInvariant*  $\triangleq$   
 $\wedge index \in Int$   
 $\wedge cts \in \text{SUBSET } Tx$   
 $\wedge brs \in \text{SUBSET } Tx$   
 $\wedge mempool \in \text{SUBSET } Tx$   
 $\wedge published \in \text{SUBSET } Tx$

---

*LastCT*(*party*)  $\triangleq$   
 CHOOSE  $ct \in cts : \forall y \in cts :$   
 $ct.party = party \wedge ct.index \geq y.index$

*MaxIndex*(*party\_cts*)  $\triangleq$   
 $(LastCT(party\_cts)).index$

*AnyCT*  $\triangleq (\text{CHOOSE } ct \in cts : \text{TRUE})$

Create commitment transaction as well as the corresponding beach remedy txs.  
 Breach remedy transactions are pre-signed transactions instead of they private key being sent over to the other party.  
 delta is the balance going from *alice* to bob. We allow negative balances to enable payments in other other direction.  
 Parties are free to keep creating *CT* even if *FT* is spent. They will not be usable, but the protocol does not disallow this.

*SupersedeCommitmentTx*(*delta*)  $\triangleq$   
 $\wedge$   
 LET  
 $key\_index \triangleq 1$  *TODO*: manage key numbers  
 $last\_alice\_ct \triangleq LastCT("alice")$   
 $last\_bob\_ct \triangleq LastCT("bob")$   
 IN  
 Create *CTs* till channel is not closed

$$\begin{aligned}
& \wedge \text{published} = \{\text{FundingTx}\} \\
& \wedge \text{last\_alice\_ct.outputs}[1].\text{amount} - \text{delta} > 0 \\
& \wedge \text{last\_alice\_ct.outputs}[2].\text{amount} + \text{delta} \leq \text{InitialBalance} \\
& \wedge \text{cts}' = \text{cts} \cup \\
& \quad \{ \text{CreateCT}(\text{"alice"}, \text{index}, \text{key\_index}, \\
& \quad \quad \text{last\_alice\_ct.outputs}[1].\text{amount} - \text{delta}, \\
& \quad \quad \text{last\_alice\_ct.outputs}[2].\text{amount} + \text{delta}), \\
& \quad \text{CreateCT}(\text{"bob"}, \text{index}, \text{key\_index}, \\
& \quad \quad \text{last\_bob\_ct.outputs}[1].\text{amount} + \text{delta}, \\
& \quad \quad \text{last\_bob\_ct.outputs}[2].\text{amount} - \text{delta}) \} \\
& \text{Alice's gets a BR it can immediately spend when corresponding} \\
& \text{CT is spen, and vice versa} \\
& \wedge \text{brs}' = \text{brs} \cup \\
& \quad \{ \text{CreateBR}(\text{"bob"}, \text{index}, \text{last\_alice\_ct.outputs}[1].\text{amount}), \\
& \quad \quad \text{CreateBR}(\text{"alice"}, \text{index}, \text{last\_bob\_ct.outputs}[1].\text{amount}) \} \\
& \wedge \text{index}' = \text{index} + 1 \\
& \wedge \text{UNCHANGED} \langle \text{mempool}, \text{published}, \text{chain\_height} \rangle
\end{aligned}$$

Broadcast a commitment transaction to the blockchain. The commitment is first signed. The protocol allows all commitments to be broadcast, what happens next depends on the status of the commitment transaction.

If the  $tx$  is the latest commitment transaction it can be spent later.

If not, it gives the other party a chance to spend the breach remedy  $tx$ .

*TODO:* We only spec *CSV* (self) commitment transaction. We need to handle the non-*CSV* output being published and co-op closes.

$$\begin{aligned}
& \text{BroadcastCommitment}(\text{party}) \triangleq \\
& \quad \wedge \text{cts} \neq \{\} \\
& \quad \wedge \\
& \quad \text{LET} \\
& \quad \quad \text{key\_index} \triangleq 1 \quad \text{TODO, manage key numbers} \\
& \quad \quad \text{ct} \triangleq \text{CHOOSE } ct \in \text{cts} : \text{TRUE} \\
& \quad \text{IN} \\
& \quad \quad \text{The commitment is not already in mempool} \\
& \quad \quad \wedge ct \notin \text{mempool} \\
& \quad \quad \text{No commitment has already been confirmed} \\
& \quad \quad \wedge \text{published} = \{\text{FundingTx}\} \\
& \quad \quad \wedge \text{mempool}' = \text{mempool} \cup \{[ct \text{ EXCEPT } !.\text{party\_signed} = \text{TRUE}]\} \\
& \quad \wedge \text{UNCHANGED} \langle \text{cts}, \text{brs}, \text{published}, \text{index}, \text{chain\_height} \rangle
\end{aligned}$$

Confirm any transaction from *mempool* – this indeed is sparta. Any *mempool*  $tx$  can be confirmed. So we model just that.

The only requirement is to make sure the *CSV* has expired.

$$\begin{aligned}
& \text{ConfirmMempoolTx} \triangleq \\
& \quad \exists tx \in \text{mempool} :
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \wedge \exists o \in SeqToSet(tx.outputs) : \\
& \quad \vee o.type = \text{"multisig"} \wedge o.csv < chain\_height \quad \text{CSV expired} \\
& \quad \vee o.type = \text{"p2wkh"} \wedge o.csv = NoCSV \quad \text{Without a CSV} \\
& \wedge tx \notin published \quad \text{Tx is not already confirmed} \\
& \wedge mempool' = mempool \setminus \{tx\} \\
& \wedge chain\_height' = chain\_height + 1 \\
& \wedge published' = published \cup \{[tx \text{ EXCEPT } !.height = chain\_height']\} \\
& \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle cts, brs, index \rangle
\end{aligned}$$

Broadcast a breach remedy transaction in response to a commitment transaction.

party is broadcasting the  $tx$

$$\begin{aligned}
BroadcastBR & \triangleq \\
& \wedge \exists \langle m, b \rangle \in mempool \times brs : \\
& \quad \wedge published = \{FundingTx\} \quad \text{Channel is not closed yet} \\
& \quad \wedge m.outputs[1].type = \text{"multisig"} \\
& \quad \text{Offending } tx \text{ in } mempool \\
& \quad \wedge chain\_height - 1 < m.outputs[1].csv \\
& \quad \wedge m.party = b.party \\
& \quad \wedge mempool' = mempool \cup \{m\} \\
& \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle cts, brs, index, published, chain\_height \rangle
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
Next & \triangleq \\
& \vee \exists d \in 1..2 : SupersedeCommitmentTx(d) \\
& \vee \exists p \in Party : BroadcastCommitment(p) \\
& \vee BroadcastBR \\
& \vee ConfirmMempoolTx
\end{aligned}$$

$$Spec \triangleq Init \wedge \Box[Next]_{\langle vars \rangle}$$

$$Liveness \triangleq WF_{vars}(BroadcastBR)$$

$$FairSpec \triangleq Spec \wedge Liveness$$

*TODO* – Add *BalanceInvariant*: Sum of all amounts on all  $txs = InitialBalance$