



Sep 10, 2020

Scoping review protocol on the use of telephone in the implementation of citizen participation in the processes of developing health system strengthening reforms/policies in Sub-Saharan Africa (participation in decision-making)

Wendkouni Adelphe Sabine OUEDRAOGO¹, Sandrine Biau-Lalanne², Emmanuel Bonnet³, Valery Ridde⁴

¹UMI résiliences, Institute for Research on Sustainable Development, IRD, Paris, France;

²University of Montreal International Health Unit / University of Montreal Hospital Center (USI), Montreal, Quebec, Canada, AfricaSy s Company, Morangis, France AND Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso;

³UMI Resiliences, Institute for Research on Sustainable Development, IRD, Paris, France, Institute of Social Sciences, National Center for Scientific and Technological Research, Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso;

⁴CEPED, Institute for Research on Sustainable Development, IRD-Université de Paris, ERL INSERM SAGESUD, Paris, France.

1 Works for me dx.doi.org/10.17504/protocols.io.bky7kxzn

Wendkouni Adelphe Sabine OUEDRAOGO

DOI

dx.doi.org/10.17504/protocols.io.bky7kxzn

PROTOCOL CITATION

Wendkouni Adelphe Sabine OUEDRAOGO, Sandrine Biau-Lalanne, Emmanuel Bonnet, Valery Ridde 2020. Scoping review protocol on the use of telephone in the implementation of citizen participation in the processes of developing health system strengthening reforms/policies in Sub-Saharan Africa (participation in decision-making). **protocols.io**
<https://dx.doi.org/10.17504/protocols.io.bky7kxzn>

LICENSE

This is an open access protocol distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited

CREATED

Sep 07, 2020

LAST MODIFIED

Sep 10, 2020

PROTOCOL INTEGER ID

41727

JUSTIFICATION

1 Rationale

Accountability and empowerment of populations are two notions that are increasingly important in sustainable development policies implemented in sub-Saharan Africa. Faced with the strong social inequalities in health, the idea that the implementation of health democracy through citizen participation in the making of health reforms constitutes a sustainable way of strengthening health systems^[1] has gained ground in recent years. Indeed, in the field of health, issues of citizen participation were developed early in the corpus of the Alma Ata declaration on primary health care of 1978 and the Ottawa Charter for Health Promotion of 1986.

Citizen participation in health be "a *condition* for the *effective* exercise of *democratic* citizenship by everyone and in this

case citizenship sanitaire "[2]. Campagné and al define it as " a political process of putting the power of actors in the field of *public* health *under* pressure from a perspective of democracy and social justice "[3]. Citizen participation can be a means, here we speak of participation-action[4] or an end in itself[5] here we speak of participation-empowerment[6]. Although citizen participation, as a means or an end, can contribute to reducing social inequalities in health, the question of mobilising people around the issue can be complex. In order to overcome this complexity of mobilising citizens in the implementation of their " capacitation " and empowerment in health matters, increasing use of information and communication technologies has been experimented with and is now seen as a reliable way of implementing citizen e-participation, particularly in sub-Saharan Africa. Information and communication technologies (ICTs), especially telephony in general, are strongly rooted in these countries and are strongly supported by the population[7].

2 Review objective

The objective of this scoping review is to explore the scientific literature relating to the use of the fixed and mobile telephone for the implementation of citizen participation in the decision-making processes of reforms / policies to strengthen health systems[1] in sub-Saharan Africa.

3 Search strategy

3.1 Data selection

We will focus our data search on scientific articles, exploratory and systematic reviews, books, and research reports on citizen participation in decision-making in health systems strengthening reform/policy development processes in sub-Saharan Africa. We will collect data on five electronic databases: Web of Science, Medline, PubMed, 1findr and Scopus. These bibliographic databases have been selected based on their areas of specialisation and their inclusion of studies focusing on public health/health law issues (i.e. specialised and generalist databases) and their accessibility and ease of use.

The research equations considering each database's specific requirements will be replayed every day and we will export (until mid-August) the data to Zotero. The keywords that will be used to construct the search equations are as follows:

Concept	ICT	Telephone	Citizen participation	Health Policy Making	Health system	Sub-Saharan Africa
---------	-----	-----------	-----------------------	----------------------	---------------	--------------------

Keywords	NICT Information and communication technology New Technology MeSH Terms: information technologies	Mobile phone Cellular phone Fixed-line telephone	Community participation Social participation Citizen engagement e-participation MeSH terms: community participation	Health Regulation Health legislation Making MeSH Terms: Health care reform	Health care system Health facility Health services MeSH terms: health care delivery	Angola OR Benin OR Botswana OR "Burkina Faso" OR Burundi OR "Cabo Verde" OR Cameroon OR "Central African Republic" OR Chad OR Comoros OR "democratic republic of the Congo" OR "ivory coast" OR "Equatorial Guinea" OR Eritrea OR Swaziland OR Ethiopia OR Gabon OR Gambia OR Ghana OR Guinea OR "Guinea-Bissau" OR Kenya OR Lesotho OR Liberia OR Madagascar OR Malawi OR Mali OR Mauritania OR Mauritius OR Mozambique OR Namibia OR Niger OR Nigeria OR Rwanda OR "Sao Tome" OR Senegal OR Seychelles OR "Sierra Leone" OR Somalia OR "South Africa" OR Sudan OR Tanzania OR Togo OR Uganda OR Zambia OR Zimbabwe
----------	---	---	---	---	--	---

The data collected on the five databases will be supplemented by gray literature, by data from sites specializing in the issue of citizen participation in sub-Saharan Africa and by data from the bibliography of studies that will be selected for inclusion.

The selection of the data thus collected will be made considering the inclusion and exclusion criteria defined below:

3.2 Inclusion and exclusion criteria

The documents collected will be included if:

- They are dealing with the use of telephony for the implementation of citizen participation in the decision-making process of health reform/health systems strengthening
- They are focused on sub-Saharan Africa
- They are in French or English
- They are accessible and available in full PDF version

Documents will be excluded if:

- They are relating to the use of m-health/health for improving health coverage
- They do not involve the use of telephony for the implementation of citizen participation in the decision-making process of health reform/system strengthening
- They are not in English or French
- They are not accessible or available in full PDF version

Main results

- 3.3 - Scope of scientific analyses on the use of fixed or mobile telephone in the implementation of citizen participation in the processes of developing reforms/policies for strengthening health systems in sub-Saharan Africa: number of studies and their distribution according to sub-Saharan sub-regional areas (South, Central, East, West Africa)
- The type of citizen participation implemented by the selected documents: citizen participation as a means (participation-action) or as an end (participation-empowerment)
 - The consideration in the scientific literature of the contribution of citizen participation to the empowerment and the accountability of health system users and health service providers in the decision-making processes of health system reform/strengthening in sub-Saharan Africa.

4 Data Extraction

Data collected on Web of Science, PubMed, 1findr, Medline and Scopus and exported to Zotero will be imported into the Covidence systematic review application. The Covidence tool will automatically remove duplicates before two reviewers independently select the imported data on title and summary. Once the title and summary selection of included studies has been made, the reviewers will still independently make a selection after full reading. Irrelevant documents will be excluded.

Data extraction will be done on the final documents included in the exploratory review. The MMAT grid will be used to describe the methodology of the included studies.

The extracted data will include :

- Characteristics of the study: title, author(s), year of publication, country of publication
- The area covered by the study: West, Central, East or Southern Africa
- Type of study: qualitative, quantitative, randomised trials, non-randomised trials, mixed studies
- The main results of the study according to the type of citizen participation implemented (means or end in itself)
- The theoretical and conceptual approaches used
- Methodological limitations according to the authors
- Operational recommendations

5 Risk of Bias in the evaluation

The quality of the selected studies will be described using the Mixed Methods Appraisal Tool (MMAT).

6 Strategy for data synthesis

The synthesis of the extracted data will be done under the guidance of the PRISMA ScR method. The criteria for data synthesis will be based on the number of studies that reported results relevant to the scoping review subject, i.e. the use of fixed or mobile telephone in the implementation of citizen participation in the processes of developing health system strengthening reforms/policies in sub-Saharan Africa. The results will be presented in a descriptive manner and will also be the subject of a thematic analysis.

Bibliographie

7

- [1] Robert E, Rajan D, Koch K, et al. Policy dialogue as a collaborative tool for multistakeholder health governance: a scoping study. *BMJ Global Health* 2020;4:e002161.
- [2] Romero-Portier C. Les approches participatives. Mémoire de fin de cycle, EHESP 2019.
- [3] Campagné, et al. Enjeu démocratique de la participation en promotion de la santé. In E. Breton, F. Jabot, J. Pommier & W. Serlaw (Eds), la promotion de la santé. Comprendre pour agir dans le monde francophone (pp.331-362). 2017, Rennes : Presses de l'EHESP
- [4] According to the utilitarian view, here citizen participation constituting a simple tool in order to achieve results or ends distinct from a participation objective.
- [5] Participation-empowerment implies a sharing of power and control of decision-making power.
- [6] Scheen B. Promotion de la santé et démarches participatives : Décryptage et points d'attention. Woluwe-Saint-Lambert : RESO, 2018
- [7] "The number of smartphone connections in the sub-Saharan region reached 302 million in 2018. It will reach nearly

700 million by 2025, with an adoption rate of 66%" Tchemedie. « Selon la GSMA, il y aura près de 700 millions de connexions 3G en Afrique subsaharienne d'ici 2025 », Aout 2019.

[8]Carman KL, Dardess P, Maurer M, *et al*. Patient and family engagement: a framework for understanding the elements and developing interventions and policies. *Health Affairs* 2013;**32**:223–231.

[9]Tricco AC, Lillie E, Zarin W, *et al*. PRISMA Extension for Scoping Reviews (PRISMA-ScR): Checklist and Explanation. *Ann Intern Med* 2018;**169**:467. doi:10.7326/M18-0850

[10]Pluye P. Mixed kinds of evidence: synthesis designs and critical appraisal for systematic mixed studies reviews including qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods studies. *Evid Based Med* 2015;**20**:79–79. doi:10.1136/ebmed-2014-110158

[11]Traverson L, Mathevet I, Paes A, *et al*. Lessons learned from the resilience of public health systems, hospitals and their personnel to the COVID-19 pandemic: a scoping review protocol. Published Online First: 22 July 2020. doi:10.17504/protocols.io.birtkd6n