

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 17, 2016  
333 WEST OCEAN BLVD., 7TH FLOOR  
CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ROOM, 8:00 AM**

Rick McGilton-McGlamery, President  
Phyllis Arias, Vice President



Charles Hicks Jr., Commissioner  
Robin Perry, Commissioner  
Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Commissioner

Kandice Taylor-Sherwood,  
Executive Director

---

**FINISHED AGENDA & DRAFT MINUTES**

**ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners** Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Phyllis  
**Present:** Arias and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

Kandice Taylor-Sherwood, Executive Director & Secretary  
Crystal Slaten, Recruitment & Selection Officer  
Robert Pfingsthorn, Administrative Officer  
Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant  
Gary Anderson, Principal Deputy City Attorney  
Lourdes Ferrer, Administrative Analyst  
Debbie McCluster, Personnel Analyst  
Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst  
Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst  
David Espinoza, Assistant Administrative Analyst  
Cynthia Stafford, Deputy Director, Human Resources

**FLAG SALUTE**

- 1. 16-141CS      Recommendation to approve minutes:  
                         Regular Meeting of August 3, 2016**

**A motion was made by Vice President Arias, seconded by  
Commissioner Hicks, to approve as recommendation as  
amended. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Phyllis  
Arias and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

**CONSENT CALENDAR (2-6):**

Passed the Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by  
Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve Consent Calendar Items  
with the exceptions of the Fire Recruit examination results under  
Examination Results and the Permit Center Supervisor Bulletin  
under Bulletins. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Phyllis  
Arias and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

**2. 16-142CS**

**Recommendation to approve examination results:**

*Automatic Sprinkler Control Technician (Established 8/12/16) -*

*13 Applied, 10 Qualified*

*Capital Projects Coordinator (Established 8/9/16) - 41 Applied,  
7 Qualified*

***Fire Recruit (Established 8/12/16) - 2721 Applied, 1661  
Qualified***

*Registered Nurse (Established 7/29/16) - 28 Applied, 6 Qualified*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent  
Calendar.**

**A motion was made by Commissioner Perry, seconded by  
Commissioner Smith Watts, to pull the Fire Recruit Examination  
Results for discussion. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Phyllis  
Arias and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

Commissioner Perry informed the Commission that he was contacted by a Fire Recruit candidate with concerns about his test score for Fire Recruit. The individual indicated that he received a communication from Civil Service that he did not receive a qualifying score to be placed on the eligible list for Fire Recruit. This individual stated that he received a reading score of 76, which he assumed was a passing score since in a previous communication he received from Civil Service stated that in order to qualify you needed a reading score of 70. This caused him to be concerned about the accuracy of his results due to the discrepancy in the two scores. He indicated that he had contacted the analyst in charge of the Fire Recruit examination, who expressed to him that the reading score had been moved to a higher number, but was not told what the number was.

Commissioner Perry stated that he advised the individual that he would share the information with the Civil Service Commission.

Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst, addressed the Commission regarding these concerns, providing the Commission an explanation on how the scores were calculated.

The Secretary advised the Commission that staff will be following-up regarding the complaint, and will contact the individual with the results.

Commissioner Arias suggested that examinations with a large applicant pool, staff provide a breakdown of the examination steps to the Commission. Also, she requested that in the future, examinations with large applicant pools be placed on the agenda as an agenda item, rather than a Consent item.

16-142CS

**Recommendation to approve examination results:**

*Automatic Sprinkler Control Technician (Established 8/12/16) -  
13 Applied, 10 Qualified*

*Capital Projects Coordinator (Established 8/9/16) - 41 Applied,  
7 Qualified*

*Fire Recruit (Established 8/12/16) - 2721 Applied, 1661  
Qualified*

*Registered Nurse (Established 7/29/16) - 28 Applied, 6 Qualified*

**A motion was made by Commissioner Perry to table the Fire Recruit examination results until the next Commission meeting. The motion failed for lack of a second.**

**A motion was made by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve the Fire Recruit examination results. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Phyllis Arias and Rick McGilton-McGlamery**

Commission Arias recommended that if there was an error, the list be adjusted and reviewed to make sure no other applicants were affected.

3. 16-143CS

**Recommendation to receive and file bulletins:**

*Permit Center Supervisor*

*Police Recruit*

*Principal Building Inspector*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**A motion was made by Commissioner Perry, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to pull the Permit Center Supervisor Bulletin for discussion. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Phyllis Arias and Rick McGilton-McGlamery**

Commissioner Perry requested clarification regarding the necessity to have desirable qualifications regarding bilingual skills in two separate places on the Permit Center Supervisor's bulletin. He indicated the statement is stated under "Desired Qualifications" and at the end of the bulletin in reference to the City Language Access Policy.

The Secretary informed the Commission that in this instance, it is a desirable qualification because some positions will require bilingual speaking individuals, which is different from the standard language on bulletins as defined by the City's Language Access Policy.

Cynthia Stafford, Deputy Director of Human Resources informed the Commission that this language was included in the City's Language Access Policy as adopted by City Council.

16-143CS      **Recommendation to receive and file bulletins:**  
*Permit Center Supervisor*  
*Police Recruit*  
*Principal Building Inspector*

**A motion was made by Vice President Arias, seconded by Commissioner Hicks, to approve the Permit Center Supervisor's bulletin. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Phyllis Arias and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

**No:** 1 - Robin Perry

4. 16-144CS      **Recommendation to receive and file retirements:**  
*Pai Wang/Senior Traffic Engineer/Harbor (15 yrs., 5 mos.)*  
*Hanzil Samad/Maintenance Assistant III/Public Works*  
*(20 yrs., 4 mos.)*  
*Charles Maluenda/Business Systems Specialist IV/Technology & Innovation (34 yrs., 11 mos.)*  
*Michael Decker/Special Services Officer IV/Police (26 yrs., 2 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

5. 16-145CS      **Recommendation to receive and file resignations:**  
*Lawrence Meriwether/School Guard/Police (6 yrs., 2 mos.)*  
*Rene Bojorquez/Parking Control Checker I/Public Works*  
*(1 yr., 9 mos.)*  
*Carolyn Kellock/Customer Service Representative III/Financial*  
*Management (8 yrs., 6 mos.)*  
*Jeffrey Martin/Clerk Typist II/Development Services (1 yr., 3 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

6. 16-146CS      **Recommendation to approve transfer:**  
*Daniel Badajos/Public Safety Dispatcher II/Police to Public Safety*  
*Dispatcher III/Fire*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

#### **REGULAR AGENDA**

7. 16-147CS      **RECOMMENDATION FOR PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT -**  
*Virginia Alejandrez, Safety Specialist*  
*Communication from Cynthia Stafford, Deputy Director - Human*  
*Resources*

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request.

Cynthia Stafford, Deputy Director, Human Resources, was present to answer Commission questions.

Commissioner Arias requested that requesting department address all items on the request forms submitted for Commission approval.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Perry, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 -** Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Phyllis Arias and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

**8. 16-148CS**

**RECOMMENDATION TO REAPPOINT RESIGNED EMPLOYEE -**

Salvador Villa, Police Officer

*Communication from Robert G. Luna, Chief of Police*

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request.

Deputy Chief Mike Beckman, Long Beach Police Department, was present to answer Commission questions.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Perry, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 -** Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Phyllis Arias and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

**9. 16-149CS**

**RECOMMENDATION FOR TRANSFER AND PERMANENT**

**ASSIGNMENT TO FORMER CLASSIFICATION -** Mony Chhey,

Accountant, Financial Management to Assistant Administrative Analyst, Airport

*Communication from Dale Worsham, Administrative Officer, Airport*

The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request.

Dale Worsham, Administrative Officer, Airport, was present to answer Commission questions.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Perry, seconded by Vice President Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 5 -** Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Robin Perry, Phyllis Arias and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

**10. 16-150CS      RECOMMENDATION TO CHANGE EXAMINATION PLAN - Clerk  
Supervisor  
Staff report prepared by Deborah McCluster, Personnel Analyst**

The Secretary briefed the Commissioner regarding this request.

Commissioner Hicks address his concerns about the test being conducted by the department without a representative from Civil Service participating or observing to ensure the interviews are fair and unbiased. He stated that is the responsibility of the Commission to ensure the process is fair and equitable. He recommended that Civil Service staff be part of the Police Department interview process, or sit in as an observer of the panel.

Ms. Slaten informed the Commission that this change is recommended due to the number of vacancies, will allow the Police Department the opportunity to interview more candidates, and will eliminate a duplicate process, by having both the Civil Service and the Police Departments conduct interviews.

Commissioner Hicks stated that he is in favor of transferring the process on the condition that a representative from the Civil Service Department can be present during the interviews. In the spirit of collaboration, he recommends the Civil Service and Police Departments work together to make sure the interview process is fair and unbiased.

Cynthia Stafford, Deputy Director, Human Resources, advised the Commission that to make sure their concerns are being met, on behalf of the Police Department, they will work with Civil Service staff in order to make sure the Commission's needs are being met in the interview process.

Commissioner Aries questioned if all candidates will be apprised of the change in the process.

Deborah McCluster, Personnel Analyst, assured the Commission that all candidates would be made aware of the changes.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**



**Yes:** 4 - Charles Hicks, Carolyn M. Smith Watts, Phyllis Arias and Rick McGilton-McGlamery

**No:** 1 - Robin Perry

## **NEW BUSINESS**

Commissioner Perry stated that Gary Anderson, Principal Deputy City Attorney, will be participating as a judge for the Moot Court Project, at CSLB on Saturday, August 20, 2016, and invited the Civil Service, Police and Fire Departments to attend. He stated that the topic the students will be arguing is the Second Amendment Right to Bear Arms.

## **MANAGERS' REPORT**

**Recruitment & Selection**

**Special Projects**

**Administration Support Services**

**Executive Director**

Ms. Slaten acknowledged Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst for the excellent work she did on the Fire Recruit examination. She stated that with the passage of Measure A, Civil Service is expecting more job openings, and staff is scheduled to attend several recruitment events.

On behalf of Ms. McDonald and Civil Service, Ms. Slaten acknowledged Ahmed Osman and Danielle Gallandt, Summer Interns, for the excellent work they provided to the Civil Service Department, and wished them well in their future endeavors.

The Commission also thanked them for the outstanding work they provided to the Civil Service department, and wished them well.

Mr. Pfigsthorn informed the Commission that he and Crystal attended the Budget Hearing at City Council on Tuesday, and that Financial Management has asked that Civil Service do a budget presentation on September 6, 2016.

The Secretary informed the Commission that she has sent a formal follow-up letter, on behalf of Commissioner Hicks, regarding the status of the Special Services Officer.

**COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission’s jurisdiction.**

Deputy Chief Chris Rowe, Fire, acknowledged Civil Service staff for the excellent service they provide and thanked them for conducting the Fire Recruit examination. He stated that they expect to hire about 48 people from the list.

Commander Alex Avila, also acknowledged Civil Service staff for the excellent service they provide to the Police Department, even when there is an immediate need.

**ADJOURNMENT**

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ: នឹងកំណត់យោគឲ្យ  
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ  
ការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង  
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។