



# CITY OF LONG BEACH

DEPARTMENT OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

333 West Ocean Boulevard, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor • Long Beach, CA 90801 • (562) 570-6194 • Fax (562) 570-6068

November 14, 2016

## CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSIONERS

City of Long Beach  
California

### RECOMMENDATION:

Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for construction of façade alterations including reconstruction of the front porch, roof alterations, and other exterior alterations to the house and garage. The building is located at 318 Carroll Park West and is a non-contributing structure within the Carroll Park Historic District. (District 2)

APPLICANT: Steve and Laurie Phenix  
318 Carroll Park West  
Long Beach, CA 90804  
(Application No. HP16-464)

### REQUEST

The project consists of building façade alterations including reconstruction and widening of the front porch, reconstruction of a portion of the roof, and other exterior alterations to the house and garage. The alterations include replacement of non-period windows, removal of non-period exterior materials, and adding new wood siding. The one-story building is a non-contributing structure within the Carroll Park Historic District.

### BACKGROUND

The subject site, 318 Carroll Park West, is located between Carroll Park East and Junipero Avenue (Exhibit A – Location Map) and has a zoning designation of R-1-N (Single-Family Residential District on Normal Lots). The triangular shaped parcel is currently developed with an approximately 1,450 square-foot single-story residence and 216 square-foot detached one-car garage located at the rear of the property. The subject house and garage were both constructed in 1918.

The existing single-family residence has been substantially altered over time with two significant alterations according to City building permit records. In 1955, a kitchen was added to the side of the building which lines up with the front wall of the residence and clad in board and batten. The 1955 building permit also included the addition of a new

front porch entry. In 1971, building permits were issued to add a dining room nook to the side of the house. Both alterations are visible exterior building changes. Other alterations include the addition of stucco and board batten to exterior wall surfaces, window shutters, brick veneer, and porch and roof modifications. Previous floor area additions to the building have modified the traditional rectangular building footprint with modifications to the front porch area and the kitchen addition. Non-period aluminum windows and security bars have also been added throughout the house.

The neighborhood context includes a variety of architectural styles with most structures constructed between the late 1800s and the 1920s. Abutting properties include a 1906 two-story Victorian style building to the north and a 1914 two-story Craftsman style building to the south. Other buildings in the surrounding neighborhood are designed in Transitional, Craftsman, and Spanish Colonial styles.

### **ANALYSIS**

The applicant's project consists of remodeling the building interior and exterior, and exterior alterations to the garage. The project includes a 41 square foot reduction of living area in order to widen the front porch. No new interior square footage is being added to the building. This application is subject to Cultural Heritage Commission review because the front façade improvements are visible from the public right-of-way (Exhibit B- Plans and Photographs).

The applicant intends to reverse prior building alterations and provide a building design that is more architecturally compatible with the overall character of the district. The most substantially visible alterations proposed in this project include removal of the stucco, board and batten, and brick veneer from the exterior building walls and installation of new wood siding to both the house and garage. Another substantial exterior change involves reconstruction of the front roof to construct in a new cross gable roof with a smaller porch roof line both at a 6:12 pitch. This alteration is consistent with the traditional dual front-facing gable roof line associated with the Craftsman Bungalow architectural style. The plan also includes removal of all non-period aluminum windows and security bars, and replacement with new wood windows primarily in a double-hung style with some casement windows. Lastly, the project also includes the removal of the carport and security bars from windows and security gates from doors.

The standard of review for properties with non-contributing structures is to maintain a visual cohesion with the district as a whole. Any new improvements to a building should be compatible with the district as a whole since non-contributing buildings do not contribute to the district either because they were built out of a district's period of significance or they have been significantly altered. In this case, the building is a non-contributing structure due to the alteration of the front façade and the footprint along the front of the building. District cohesion can typically be achieved by building size and scale that are compatible with other buildings in the district and by the use of exterior building materials found in the district. In addition, the proposed alterations must comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation of Historic Structures (Guidelines).

## CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

November 14, 2016

Page 3 of 9

The proposed modifications to this non-contributing structure will re-establish its visual cohesion with the district and maintain general compatibility in terms of massing and scale to other buildings in the district. The proposed one-story cross gable roofline, and the 6:12 roof pitch are compatible with the variety of architectural styles and the period of significance (1898-1923) for the Carroll Park Historic District. The proposed roof design and materials are generally compatible in scale with surrounding buildings in the district.

Structures that are considered non-contributing due to alterations, but from the same period of significance as the district are encouraged to reverse inappropriate alterations where feasible. In this case, staff finds that the proposed improvements will largely reverse past alterations. Replacing the inappropriate stucco finish and with new wood siding would bring it closer to resembling its original architectural style, likely Craftsman Bungalow. In addition, the proposed triangular knee braces, wood corner boards, exposed rafters, tapered porch columns shown in the plans are consistent with the Craftsman Bungalow style found throughout the Carroll Park Historic District.

### **RECOMMENDATION**

In compliance with Section 2.63.070 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, and the Carroll Park Historic District design guidelines, staff has analyzed the proposed project and believes the project meets these requirements and those of the City's zoning codes and is recommending approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness subject to the conditions of approval (Exhibit C – Findings and Conditions of Approval).

### **PUBLIC HEARING NOTICE**

Public notices were distributed on October 24, 2016, and a notice was also mailed to the Carroll Park Community Watch. No responses were received as of the date of preparation of this report.

### **ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**

In accordance with Section 15303(a) of the Guidelines for Implementation of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), environmental review is not required for new construction of small structures including single-family homes.

CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

November 14, 2016

Page 4 of 9

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Christopher Koontz".

CHRISTOPHER KOONTZ, AICP  
ADVANCE PLANNING OFFICER

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Linda F. Tatum".

LINDA F. TATUM, AICP  
PLANNING BUREAU MANAGER

LFT:CK:ap

Attachments: Exhibit A – Location Map  
Exhibit B – Plans & Photographs  
Exhibit C – Conditions of Approval, Findings & Analysis