Obligatory assignment 2 review

Reviewed by: Alexander Gausdal

Solution graded: *02_121086_Parken*

Date: 2014-09-23

Review:

Is the case chosen an electronic id solution/contains electronic id?

I guess the users in the first example logs in with their electronic IDs and then starts voting. In the second example there's login sessions.

Are two or more race possible conditions presented? Are these really race conditions? Do you find simultaneous operations on the same resource where the outcome depends on which operation is executed earlier/faster than the other? Does the outcome violate a security goal?

There's a race condition concerning voting, and one concerning sessions. The first example presents a race condition because simultaneous voting operations could alter the common resource in a way that makes it display the wrong result. This is a violation of data integrity.

The second example also presents a race condition, because the end result of the sessions depends on load time. This violates with the principle of data integrity.

Are countermeasures presented? Do the countermeasures address the race conditions?

No countermeasure for the voting system. As countermeasures for sessions there is the flock() system call, SQL transaction and lock statements.

Is the overall presentation of the case specific or is it too abstract to be of value?

Very, very, very easy to understand.

Bonus: Is there at least one reference that is not just a URL, but refers to a scientific article?

There's actually no more than two references, but they're both from books which should be solid (books found on the internet :)).

Comments:

The paper is missing countermeasures for the voting system race condition. I don't know if this was intended as one of the two examples of race conditions we were supposed to present? After all it's under the headline "What is a race condition", and does not mention countermeasures. This part of the paper was rather thin. The next part about sessions is way better. As a whole it's an adequate paper.

PASS