

Review of 120926_Jan Samuelsen Lindemann

By 120922_Synne Gran Østern

Is the case chosen an electronic id solution/contains electronic id?

Jan have described a logon session for a website. However this service is not described much in detail and therefore I am a little unsure whether this is an electronic ID.

Are two or more race possible conditions presented? Are these really race conditions? Do you find simultaneous operations on the same resource where the outcome depends on which operation is executed earlier/faster than the other? Does the outcome violate a security goal?

Jan have described three situations concerning race conditions:

1. Several devices tries to log on to the same service with the same user account.
2. Same user account, but several users tries to log on & change the login-credentials.
3. User account gets imitated his/her user rights to the service to read only, while log on the service.

The examples are possibly race conditions, but I would like to have more details about each case. Maybe a chart that shows the communications between the user and the service.

Are countermeasures presented? Do the countermeasures address the race conditions?

The countermeasures are described very briefly. However, I think this is a little too thin. And I would have prefer some references to articles that discuss the solutions, or a more detailed description on each of the countermeasures.

Is the overall presentation of the case specific or is it too abstract to be of value?

All in all, I find this assignment a little too abstract and does not have the essentials details for electronic ID that was chosen, the race conditions and the solutions. This is an academic assignment, and therefore I expects a more detailed description. And unfortunately I don't find that this assignment is at that level.

Bonus: Is there at least one reference that is not just a URL, but refers to a scientific article?

There is no references in this assignment. Most of the text does not require references, but Jan mentions Erik Hjelmås and his course "Operating Systems". There are no references to this, and not to the Tanenbaum book "Modern Operating Systems", that this course is based on. That is something I would have preferred.

To conclude: I thinks this assignment is a little too abstract and simple. However, the element does only need to be explained in more detail (and references where is relevant), and it will be approved.

Fail.