



ORDINANCE COMMITTEE

COMMITTEE MEETING

~ MINUTES ~

Wednesday, April 12, 2023

5:30 PM

Sullivan Chamber
795 Massachusetts Avenue
Cambridge, MA 02139

The Ordinance Committee will hold a public meeting to continue the discussion on the proposed amendments to the Building Energy Use Disclosure Ordinance, Ordinance #2021-26

Attendee Name	Present	Absent	Late	Arrived
Burhan Azeem	<input type="checkbox"/> Remote	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Dennis J. Carlone	<input type="checkbox"/> Remote	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Alanna Mallon	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Marc C. McGovern	<input type="checkbox"/> Remote	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Patricia Nolan	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	5:34 PM
E. Denise Simmons	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Paul F. Toner	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Quinton Zondervan	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Sumbul Siddiqui	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	

A public meeting of the Cambridge City Council's Ordinance Committee was held on Wednesday, April 12, 2023. The meeting was Called to Order at 5:30 p.m. by the Chair, Councillor Zondervan. Pursuant to Chapter 2 of the Acts of 2023 adopted by Massachusetts General Court and approved by the Governor, the City is authorized to use remote participation. This public meeting was hybrid, allowing participation in person, in the Sullivan Chamber, 2nd Floor, City Hall, 795 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA and by remote participation via zoom.

At the request of the Chair, City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.

Councillor Azeem – Present/Remote
Councillor Carlone – Present/Remote
Vice Mayor Mallon – Present/In Sullivan Chamber
Councillor McGovern – Present/Remote
Councillor Nolan – Absent*
Councillor Simmons – Absent
Councillor Toner – Present/In Sullivan Chamber
Councillor Zondervan – Present/In Sullivan Chamber
Mayor Siddiqui – Present/In Sullivan Chamber

Present – 7, Absent – 2. Quorum established.

***Councillor Nolan was marked present in the Sullivan Chamber at 5:34p.m.**

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan gave opening remarks and shared that the call of the meeting was to continue the discussion on the proposed amendments to the Building Energy Use Disclosure Ordinance (BEUDO), Ordinance #2021-26. Councillor Zondervan noted that the City Manager, Yi-An Huang was present at the meeting, as well as Iram Farooq, Assistant City Manager for the Community Development Department (CDD). Joining Iram Farooq was

Susanne Rasmussen, Director of Environmental and Transportation for CDD, Seth Federspiel, Energy Planner for CDD, Nikhil Nadkarni, Energy Planner for CDD, and Nick Stoutt, Assistant Commissioner for Architectural Services for the Department of Public Works (DPW).

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized the City Manager, Yi-An Huang who offered opening remarks and shared that climate change is the fight of our generation. He noted that everyone is present at the meeting today because the City recognizes that it has not acted quickly enough with climate change goals, and globally everyone is seeing more of the impacts of extreme weather events, changes to the planet, and the impact on communities around the world. The City Manager recognized and thanked the team from CDD and their aggressive response to create a forward path for the City to follow that also provides realistic goals for property owners.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized Iram Farooq who, along with her team, gave a presentation titled “Regulating Building Emissions via BEUDO: A Critical Step Towards Net Zero Cambridge,” copy attached. Iram Farooq reviewed the executive summary, noting that the City is committed to supporting Cambridge property owners with strong assistance and connections to incentives to be able to move forward together with this challenging, but critical work. Susanne Rasmussen noted that CDD plans to share an amended proposal that is materially different from the original in four areas, which included, trajectory, carbon offsets, exemptions, and policy review. Seth Federspiel reviewed the carbon offsets proposal and shared the criteria to ensure quality when using carbon offsets. Nick Stoutt gave an overview of the forty municipal buildings that would fall under the BEUDO category, and the plans of making them more energy efficient moving forward. Nikhil Nadkarni shared and described some of the state and federal investment climate actions that were available, as well as the City’s commitment to support building decarbonization. Nikhil Nadkarni noted that on Monday, April 10, 2023, the City announced a one-year pilot partnership with BlocPower which provides building retrofits in a no upfront cost structure. Iram Farooq concluded the presentation by providing provisions and recommendations regarding the proposed amendments. Iram Farooq noted that in terms of the target trajectory, CDD is recommending staying with the 2035 target date, but property owners who have the most difficulty to meet that date would go on a 2050 trajectory timeline.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized Councillor Toner who suggested that members of the Council submit questions to CDD regarding their presentation and BEUDO to help with follow up discussions at the next BEUDO meeting.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan opened Public Comment. Each member of the public was allowed two minutes.

Margery Davies, 35 William Street, Cambridge, MA, shared that it is important to act, but to also be careful about global offsets that do not meet the criteria.

Virginia Greene, 14 Vandine Street, Cambridge, MA, shared that they were in favor of passing the Green New Deal for Cambridge exactly how it was written.

Sharon Britton, 950 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA, thanked the Councillors who listened to concerns from condominium owners and offered suggestions on how to help condominium owners help with achieving net zero goals.

John Patrick, 950 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA, thanked Councillors who listened to concerns from condominium owners and thanked CDD for recognizing the special circumstances condominium owners are facing.

Logan Patrick, 950 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA, thanked the Council for recognizing the needs and ownership structures for large condominium buildings and shared that they support finding ways to reduce emissions.

Kathy Dalton, 6 Arlington Street, Cambridge, MA, shared they would like to see the City go forward in an inclusive participatory planning process so condominium owners can help get to net zero together.

Joyce Levine, 2353 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA, shared they were happy that the City is looking at condominiums more as residential units and noted that it is important to meet the requirements in a way that is affordable for the people who live in the City.

Bridget Hanna, 12 Haskell Street, Cambridge, MA, shared that the world can look to Cambridge to see what can be built by strengthening BEUDO and taking on the challenges.

David Lawrence, 1 Aberdeen Way, Cambridge, MA, shared their strong support for the proposal to regulate condominiums together with non BEUDO properties, rather than with large institutional properties.

Phil Rinehart, 17 Otis Street, Cambridge, MA, thanked CDD for their updates and shared that they support the proposal and offered suggestions.

Anne Sa'adah, 221 Mt. Auburn Street, Cambridge, MA, thanked Councillors and CDD for listening to condominium owner concerns and hopes that going forward the process is smarter and faster.

Helen Walker, 43 Linnaean Street, Cambridge, MA, thanked Councillors who helped make the proposed amendments for condominium owners and offered suggestions on costs.

Cynthia Hibbard, 23 Ellsworth Avenue, Cambridge, MA, shared they support Cambridge achieving net zero greenhouse gas emissions from existing large building by 2035.

Nancy Kilburn, 44 Garden Street, Cambridge, MA, shared it is important to get large institutions and biotech industries to true net zero by 2035.

Arthur Berger, 1600 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA, was in favor of the proposed amendments and thanked all those who help contribute to them.

Marilee Meyer, 10 Dana Street, Cambridge, MA, thanked the Council for understanding that compliance must be realistic and practical for fixed income and elderly residents.

Anirudh Wodeyar, 15 Seagrave Road, Cambridge, MA, shared they were in favor of the strong version of BEUDO without the new amendments or something as close to that as possible.

Drew Pendergrass, 20 Oxford Street, Cambridge, MA, shared they were in support of the strong version of BEUDO.

Eric Grunebaum, 98 Montgomery Street, Cambridge, MA, offered comments on the technology and economics that is available to produce high-efficiency fully electrified buildings.

Beth O'Neill Maloney, 510 Kendall Street, Cambridge, MA, shared that the City, the business and residential community, and Eversource should all be working collectively to reduce greenhouse gas emissions.

Lee Farris, 269 Norfolk Street, Cambridge, MA, shared they were in support of passing the strongest version of BEUDO.

Yve Torrie, 14 Beacon Street, Boston, MA, shared that they support the 2035 approach that was presented by the City Manager and CDD that includes flexibility including offset exemptions and baseline options.

Heather Henriksen, 14 Story Street, Cambridge, MA, from Harvard University shared concerns that should be taken into consideration.

Sahithi Madireddy, 320 Memorial Drive, Cambridge, MA, shared they were in support of the strong BEUDO version.

Michael Nguyen-Mason, 17 Prospect Street, Cambridge, MA, shared they were in support of the strong BEUDO version and noted they were inspired by all the people who have made a commitment to bettering the world.

Kendyl Maher-Trumble, 348 Walden Street, Cambridge, MA, shared they were offering comments on behalf of Harvard University and noted that Harvard has established a climate goal including fossil fuel neutral by 2026 and fossil fuel free by 2050 and offered suggestions for the Council to consider moving forward.

Emily Crawford, 3 Crawford Street, Cambridge, MA, echoed comments made for a green Cambridge urging that as many buildings as possible meet the deadline of true net zero by 2035.

Owen Leddy, 260 Harvard Street, Cambridge, MA, urged the City Council to stick with the version of this policy that they had originally proposed.

Mary Caulfield, 6 Crawford Street, Cambridge, MA, stressed the importance of having a strategy for retrofitting old buildings that are both transparent and actionable.

John McDowell, 10 Dana Street, Cambridge, MA, shared that condominium owners look forward to being a part of the process going forward.

Finley Foster, 5 Porter Park, Cambridge, MA, shared they were in support of the strongest version of BEUDO.

Gleb Bahmutov, 19 Winslow Street, Cambridge, MA, urged the Council to pass the strong BEUDO version.

David Mazumder, 500 Memorial Drive, Cambridge, MA, asked the Council to adopt the strongest version of BEUDO with net zero emissions for covered buildings by 2035.

Melanie Abrams, 1539 Cambridge Street, Cambridge, MA, offered comments on keeping the strong version of BEUDO.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized Councillor Toner who made a motion to extend the meeting by thirty minutes.

City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.

Councillor Azeem – Yes

Councillor Carlone – Yes

Vice Mayor Mallon – Yes

Councillor McGovern – Yes

Councillor Nolan – Yes

Councillor Simmons – Absent

Councillor Toner – Yes

Councillor Zondervan – Yes

Mayor Siddiqui – Yes

Yes – 8, No – 0, Absent – 1. Meeting extended to 8:00p.m.

Public Comment resumed.

Carolyn Magid, 71 Reed Street, Cambridge, MA, shared they were in favor of the strong version of BEUDO.

Aaron Shakow, 4 Newton Street, Cambridge, MA, urged the Council to reject the City Manager's attempt to create loopholes like extending the compliance window for large commercial buildings to 2050.

Patrick Barrett, 41 Pleasant Street, Cambridge, MA, asked the Council to look at the impact of BEUDO on small property owners and noted it is not about money, but about practical implications about how to implement these regulations without property owners going bankrupt.

Steve Miller, 92 Henry Street, Cambridge, MA, thanked City staff for putting together information and raised the point for the need for flexibility.

Peter Kirby, 128 Oxford Street, Cambridge, MA, shared that it is important to put these policies in place so that new and old buildings are being adjusted to the state they need to be in in the timeline that needs to happen.

Susan Murcott, 149 Atlantic Avenue, shared that they support the strong version of BEUDO.

Gail Charpentier, 19 Murdock Street, Cambridge, MA, urged the Council to pass the strongest version of BEUDO and reject the City Manager's rewrite for commercial development.

Yugi Wang, 510 Kendall Street, Cambridge, MA, asked the Council to pass a BEUDO that is practical and one that does not penalize people who are actively trying to work towards the City and State goals.

Diane Martin, 34 Madison Avenue, Cambridge, MA, asked the Council to vote in favor of the amendments to BEUDO that require buildings to reduce the greenhouse gas emissions and achieve building net zero by 2035.

Asako Severn, 395 Broadway, Cambridge, MA, shared that they supported the proposed amendments for condominium owners and thanked the Council for listening to their concerns.

Marc Truant, 32 Warren Street, Cambridge, MA, stressed that the key to getting to net zero is changing the approach to utilities in the State.

Nancy Donohue, 1 Kendall Square, Cambridge, MA, Director of Government Affairs for the Cambridge Chamber of Commerce, shared their ongoing concern that the City Council needs to ensure that there are achievable, attainable, and science-based solutions.

Sarah Gallop, 77 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA, Director of Government and Community Relations at MIT, stressed the importance of everyone working together to achieve climate goals.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized Councillor Nolan who made a motion to extend the meeting by an additional thirty minutes.

City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.

Councillor Azeem – Yes

Councillor Carlone – Yes

Vice Mayor Mallon – Yes

Councillor McGovern – Yes

Councillor Nolan – Yes

Councillor Simmons – Absent

Councillor Toner – Yes

Councillor Zondervan – Yes

Mayor Siddiqui – Yes

Yes – 8, No – 0, Absent – 1. Meeting extended to 8:30p.m.

Public Comment resumed.

Stephen Helfer, 3 Crawford Street, Cambridge, MA, thanked the Council for listening to the concerns of condominium owners.

Reva Stein, 2 Seagrave Road, Cambridge, MA, shared they support amendments for large buildings to reach zero emissions by 2035.

Aaliya Hussain, 515 Beacon Street, Cambridge, MA, urged the Council to pass the strong version of BEUDO that will hold institutions and large buildings to the 2035 deadline.

Rick Clemenz offered comments on BEUDO, engineers, and the costs associated with going energy efficient.

Joe Higgins, 77 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA, Vice President of Campus Services for MIT, thanked the Council and CDD for the proposed amendments and noted there is more work that needs to be done together.

Michael Grill, 1035 Cambridge Street, Cambridge, MA, requested that commercial condominiums be excluded from the 2035 deadline and technical assistance be expanded to include commercial condominium buildings.

Amber Houghstow, 18 Montrose Street, Cambridge, MA, shared that they are in support of the strong version of BEUDO.

Mary Baine Campbell, 36 Linnaean Street, Cambridge, MA, shared that according to the UN it is necessary to accomplish green goals by 2030 because climate change will continue to endanger the fate of world.

Clifford Snider, 191 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, MA, shared that they oppose the proposed amendments.

Jen urged the City Council to fight those who stand in the way of net zero and to have necessary offsetting as low as possible.

Daniel Dominges shared that they feel some of the pushback is not motivated by science, but by something else.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized Councillor Toner who made a motion to recess the meeting to 3:00 p.m. on Wednesday, April 26, 2023.

City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.

Councillor Azeem – Yes

Councillor Carlone – Yes

Vice Mayor Mallon – Yes

Councillor McGovern – Yes

Councillor Nolan – Yes

Councillor Simmons – Absent

Councillor Toner – Yes

Councillor Zondervan – Yes

Mayor Siddiqui – Yes

Yes – 8, No – 0, Absent – 1. Motion passed.

The Ordinance Committee recessed at approximately 8:20 p.m.

On Wednesday, April 26, 2023, the Cambridge City Council's Ordinance Committee that recessed on April 12, 2023 was Called Back to Order at 3:00 p.m. by the Chair, Councillor Zondervan. Pursuant to Chapter 2 of the Acts of 2023 adopted by Massachusetts General Court and approved by the Governor, the City is authorized to use remote participation. This public meeting was hybrid, allowing participation in person, in the Sullivan Chamber, 2nd Floor, City Hall, 795 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA and by remote participation via zoom.

At the request of the Chair, City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.

Councillor Azeem – Present/In Sullivan Chamber

Councillor Carlone – Present/In Sullivan Chamber

Vice Mayor Mallon – Present/In Sullivan Chamber

Councillor McGovern – Absent*

Councillor Nolan – Absent*

Councillor Simmons – Absent*

Councillor Toner – Absent*

Councillor Zondervan – Present/In Sullivan Chamber

Mayor Siddiqui – Present/In Sullivan Chamber

Present – 5, Absent – 4. Quorum established.

***Councillor McGovern, Councillor Nolan, and Councillor Toner were marked present in the Sullivan Chamber at 3:04 p.m.**

***Councillor Simmons was marked present and remote at 3:20 p.m.**

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan offered opening remarks and noted that the call of the meeting was to continue the discussion on proposed amendments to the Building Energy Use Disclosure (BEUDO), Ordinance #2021-26. Present at the meeting was City Manager, Yi-An Huang, Deputy City Manager, Owen O'Riordan, and Iram Farooq, Assistant City Manager for the Community Development Department (CDD). Joining Iram Farooq was Susanne Rasmussen, Director of Environmental and Transportation for CDD, Seth Federspiel, Energy Planner for CDD, and Nick Stoutt, Assistant Commissioner for Architectural Services for the Department of Public Works (DPW).

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized Mayor Siddiqui who offered opening remarks.

Mayor Siddiqui acknowledged that there has been a lot of work and time put into BEUDO.

Mayor Siddiqui's Remarks: I want to recognize that there has been a lot of work and time put into BEUDO since 2021. We are lucky to have so many climate advocates and stakeholders in Cambridge who helped get these amendments to where they are today. Work on these specific amendments has been ongoing since spring of 2022 when I convened stakeholders impacted by this ordinance, which Councillors had asked that I do. The stakeholders included Harvard, MIT, the Cambridge Chamber, Kendall Square Association, a few others, along with Councillor Nolan and Councillor Zondervan. I want to take a minute to recognize Harvard and MIT and specifically Tom and Sarah, for all their work on this and for being partners throughout this

process. They are committed to this work and have listened. As the process unfolded, I will be honest, we had a challenging time reaching consensus and there was oversight in the initial conversations that did not include condominium owners and some of the smaller/mid-sized building owners. I apologize for that oversight. In late 2022, we asked CDD to come back to us with an updated framework, and we saw that table and presentation a few weeks ago. This version includes input from several key stakeholders, and the amendments offered today build on that and make the ordinance slightly stronger, while retaining the feedback that has been offered. **Councillor Zondervan and Councilor Nolan and I worked on amendments shown on the chart presented today (copy attached) and I am grateful for the work they have done to get this compromise to where it is, and even they have had to compromise on this.** Before we get to the amendments, we have a few presenters specifically on offsets and the current CDD proposal. I recognize there are questions that CDD spent time on that, and I thank the Councillors who sent questions beforehand, we will also have time to discuss. First, we will hear from presenters, then Councillor Nolan, and then we will do a Q&A.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized panelist Susan Murcott, who was joined remotely, and gave a presentation titled “Comment on Community Development Department (CDD) Amendment,” copy attached.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized panelists Sahithi Madireddy and Allesandre Santos who gave a presentation titled “Emissions Analysis,” copy attached, which reviewed building emissions permitted by 2050 and showed examples with and without offsets. Allesandre Santos shared thoughts on climate justice from an international perspective and noted that not all carbon credits are good and that a lot of injustice is done with money sent overseas, especially impacting indigenous people negatively.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized Councillor Nolan who offered remarks and reviewed amendments being offered by Mayor Siddiqui, Councillor Zondervan, and herself.

Councillor Nolan’s Remarks: First, thank you to everyone in this room - it is an exciting moment worthy of celebration. I want to state it is exciting to be considering this - assuming we pass something along the lines of the proposal before us, we can be proud that we are climate leaders. It will take the whole community to make this work. We know that. We also recognize as the Mayor said, it has taken a long time to get here. Yet the world is demanding of us to be bold, to try, to aspire, to require the reductions we have been hoping/planning/studying for a decade. We also recognize two important points: we may try things that do not work - we will learn a lot. That is expected, and it will contribute to the field when we succeed. AND when we fail. We embrace the role of innovators and experimenters. Second, we do not have all the answers. That does not mean we cannot and should not pass something. The classic example is the Kennedy moonshot. We had no idea how to do it. We did it, and the covid vaccine - we had no idea, and it was crazy to think we could develop the vaccine and administer millions, then billions of doses.

Changes Proposed - Mayor Siddiqui, Councillor Zondervan and I are proposing four changes to the framework of amendments before us from CDD:

Changing the Threshold to 50k sq ft. Threshold of 50K is used in several other city building related ordinances, including the Green Building and embodied emissions - so it makes sense to use from that perspective. Note that while it is “only” 160 buildings, we need every possible addition to our emissions reduction possible. We are supposed to lower our emissions by 50% by 2030. State law requires that. BEUDO commercial buildings represent only 52% of all citywide

emissions. So if only 100K buildings and above are subject to the 2035 timeline, that translates into a reduction of about 23% in citywide emissions by 2030 - only half of goal of 50% citywide. By including the 160 50K SF buildings, that percentage goes up by about 5%, and we need every bit we can get.

Exemptions – Charge the Review Board with approving all decarbonization plans and carbon offsets. Codify that there shall be no less than 50% representation from climate advocates and climate scientists on the Review Board, including all 5 technical experts. Local Offsets Required if available - PAVERE /AVID+ requirement / Creating local offsets. Within BEUDO, to ensure that we are having true emissions reductions, we must prioritize offsets within Cambridge, and locally, too, could be useful in helping both our property owners subject to BEUDO and those facing new demands from a yet-to-be-designed transaction-point upgrade policy. The first group will need offsets on an interim basis and the second will need financial support, both of which can be made possible through a well-designed system of offsets. By incentivizing local projects, we are creating economic incentives for larger building owners to fund retrofit projects for smaller buildings in the future.

Policy Review - Change completion date of initial review from 2032 to 2028. A five year review is appropriate for several reasons. The existing BEUDO included a review after 5 years, so five years is consistent with our city's practices. In addition, the world of climate adaptation will have changed by then. We will know a lot from our own BlocPower pilot, we will have two years of data from the ordinance for large owners. And know more about offsets, about developments with technical possibilities for emissions reductions. A review would be to understand the effectiveness of the ordinance and reassess the technological and environmental landscape at the time. Further, these amendments only cover a small segment of our building stock, so we will need to come back to the table with a proposal to reduce emissions in all our buildings, including multifamily units and condominiums - and combine that with technical and financial assistance, which I think is appropriate before the proposed first review not until 2032. We can also build in a review in 2032. I hope we will all vote for these four amendments since it will make the ordinance even stronger.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized Iram Farooq and the team from CDD and DPW to give a review of the questions they received from Councillors, copy attached.

Representatives from CDD and DPW responded to questions and concerns raised by Councillors.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized Councillor Toner who had follow up questions from the Q&A, one being on residential properties and if they were still following the 2050 timeline criteria. Seth Federspiel confirmed that the only distinction in residential properties in the CDD proposal is condominium residential buildings being excluded from the emission reduction requirements and all the remaining residential building with fifty or more units would be subject to the 2050 trajectory. Councillor Toner's second question was on carbon offsets being used to reach net zero in the forty municipal buildings. Nick Stoutt shared that there are currently two parallel master plans in place which will look at phased improvements. Nick Stoutt noted that logistically and with costs it would be hard to reach the goal of having municipal buildings fall into the 2035 trajectory without using carbon offsets. Councillor Zondervan shared that he was deeply opposed to that (using carbon offsets for municipal buildings).

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized Councillor Carlone who asked CDD if the City is not currently going to be including condominiums in the 2035 trajectory, when is the plan to

start approaching condominiums. Iram Farooq responded by noting that based on the net zero action plan, CDD is looking at how to eliminate greenhouse gas emissions from all buildings, and by eliminating condominiums from the BEUDO emissions reductions, CDD plans on thinking about condominiums at the same time they are thinking about one, two, and three family type smaller buildings. Iram Farooq noted that CDD will be looking to create strategies that would help benefit those sites during the transition.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized Councillor McGovern who asked for clarity on if condominium buildings with 50 units will be on the 2050 schedule. Seth Federspiel noted that only rental multi-family buildings over 50 units would be covered by the BEUDO amendments, and condominium buildings would be exempt from the current proposal, as well as single family homes. Councillor McGovern asked if there was a difference in emissions between 50,000 square foot buildings versus 100,000 square foot buildings, to which Seth Federspiel noted that CDD had looked to see if there were any inflection points and found that there was not one clear point where over a certain square footage there was a big jump in emissions (for individual buildings) but that of course the larger the building, the greater the emissions, generally speaking, and that the majority of total building emissions were produced by the largest (commercial) buildings. City Manager Huang shared that when moving the timeline from 2050 to 2035, a lot of what the team has been focusing on is the larger buildings because they have more resources and ability to meet the aggressive timeline. Councillor McGovern stressed the importance of conducting reviews every few years so everyone stays up to date as BEUDO continues to move forward.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized Vice Mayor Mallon who offered comments on commercial condominium buildings and their owners and emphasized the importance of unintentionally providing consequences for smaller commercial condominium buildings and putting them together in the same category. Vice Mayor Mallon suggested if there was a way to think about commercial condominium buildings who have three or more owners versus just one owner and putting them in a different category when looking at the 2035 and 2050 trajectory. Vice Mayor Mallon asked for clarity on commercial buildings having access to the City's Community Aggregation Program and what the plan is for the next contract and when that would begin. Susanne Rasmussen shared that CDD is looking to develop a new approach that would allow large commercial owners to enroll in the Aggregation Program. Susanne Rasmussen noted that there is an upcoming Aggregation renewal which will start in January. Iram Farooq noted that the Aggregation Program was originally developed for small property owners and CDD understands that this is something that many people will be relying on and are planning to build the system so in the future they are able to provide a better service for everyone to access.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized the City Manager and Iram Farooq who reviewed the proposed amendments with Committee members and were available for discussion regarding any concerns or comments. The City Manager noted that the more clarity the City Staff have the closer they will be able to get to the Committee's vision when the final amendments are brought forward.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized Seth Federspiel who gave a review of CDD's Carbon Offset Memo, copy attached. Seth Federspiel shared that the memo outlines the rational for including carbon offsets for the accelerated timeline for large buildings and the need for certain mechanisms that come with the accelerated timeline. City Manager Huang offered comments on carbon offsets and shared it would be helpful for Committee members to be clear from their legislative standpoint about the distance in carbon offsets and decarbonization efforts

they will be looking for. Councillor Zondervan noted that the closer to Cambridge the offset was being implemented, the better it would be both from a verifiability aspect, and in terms of local economic impact.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized Mayor Siddiqui who shared the chart that was presented by themselves, Councillor Zondervan and Councillor Nolan was to bring opportunity to have CDD and other City Staff work from their ideas and language to help guide CDD with the correct language that should be proposed at a future date to the City Council. Mayor Siddiqui noted that there will be challenges, but it is important to figure out a way to be creative with partners moving forward.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan, made a motion to extend the meeting by thirty minutes. City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.

Councillor Azeem – Yes

Councillor Carlone – Yes

Vice Mayor Mallon -Yes

Councillor McGovern – Yes

Councillor Nolan – Yes

Councillor Simmons – Absent

Councillor Toner – Yes

Councillor Zondervan – Yes

Mayor Siddiqui – Yes

Yes – 8, No – 0, Absent – 1. Motion passed.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan opened discussion to the proposed amendments that were brought forward in the chart. Committee members shared that it has been a challenging conversation, and offered comments and concerns on the amendments, with many of them noting that what Cambridge is trying to accomplish by 2035 will be groundbreaking.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized Councillor Azeem who shared that he had an amendment to the amendments that were brought forward by Councillor Nolan, Councillor Zondervan, and Mayor Siddiqui, copy attached.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan made a motion to adopt amendment #1 on the table of proposed amendments regarding changing the threshold for commercial buildings.

City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.

Councillor Azeem – No

Councillor Carlone – Yes

Vice Mayor Mallon – No

Councillor McGovern – No

Councilor Nolan – Yes

Councillor Simmons – Absent

Councillor Toner – No

Councillor Zondervan – Yes

Mayor Siddiqui – Yes

Yes – 4, No – 4, Absent – 1. Motion failed.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized Councillor Azeem who made a motion to amend the proposed language for amendment #2 on the chart, copy attached.

City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.

Councillor Azeem – Yes
Councillor Carlone – Yes
Vice Mayor Mallon – Yes
Councillor McGovern – Yes
Councillor Nolan – Yes
Councillor Simmons – Absent
Councillor Toner – Yes
Councillor Zondervan – Yes
Mayor Siddiqui – Yes

Yes – 8, No – 0, Absent – 1. Motion passed.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan made a motion to adopt amendment #2 on the chart as amended.

City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.

Councillor Azeem – Yes
Councillor Carlone – Yes
Vice Mayor Mallon – Yes
Councillor McGovern – Yes
Councillor Nolan – Yes
Councillor Simmons – Absent
Councillor Toner – Yes
Councillor Zondervan – Yes
Mayor Siddiqui – Yes

Yes – 8, No – 0, Absent – 1. Motion passed.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan made a motion to adopt amendments #3A, #3B, and #4 on the chart.

City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.

Councillor Azeem – Yes
Councillor Carlone – Yes
Vice Mayor Mallon – Yes
Councillor McGovern – Yes
Councillor Nolan – Yes
Councillor Simmons – Absent
Councillor Toner – Yes
Councillor Zondervan – Yes
Mayor Siddiqui – Yes

Yes – 8, No – 0, Absent – 1. Motion passed.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan recognized Vice Mayor Mallon who made a motion to amend the CDD recommendation with language for amendment #1 regarding threshold, copy attached.

City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.

Councillor Azeem – Yes
Councillor Carlone – Present
Vice Mayor Mallon – Yes

Councillor McGovern – Yes
Councillor Nolan – Present
Councillor Simmons – Absent
Councillor Toner – Yes
Councillor Zondervan – Yes
Mayor Siddiqui – Yes

Yes – 6, No – 0, Present – 2, Absent – 1. Motion passed.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan made a motion That the City Manager is requested to work with CDD, Law Department, the Assessor's Office, and any other relevant departments to produce final draft ordinance language for the BEUDO amendments based on the CDD proposal as amended by the Ordinance Committee at its April 26, 2023 hearing; and that the City Manager report back on this matter, including presenting final draft language to the City Council no later than May 31, 2023.

City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.

Councillor Azeem – Yes
Councillor Carlone – Yes
Vice Mayor Mallon – Yes
Councillor McGovern – Yes
Councillor Nolan – Yes
Councillor Simmons – Absent
Councillor Toner – Yes
Councillor Zondervan – Yes
Mayor Siddiqui – Yes

Yes – 8, No – 0, Absent – 1. Motion passed.

ORDERED: That the City Manager is requested to work with CDD, Law Department, The Assessors Office, and any other relevant departments to produce final draft ordinance language for the BEUDO amendments based on the CDD proposal as amended by the Ordinance Committee at its April 26, 2023 hearing; and

ORDERED: That the City Manager report back on this matter, including presenting final draft language to the City Council no later than May 31, 2023.

The Chair, Councillor Zondervan made a motion to adjourn the meeting.

City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.

Councillor Azeem – Yes
Councillor Carlone – Yes
Vice Mayor Mallon – Yes
Councillor McGovern – Yes
Councillor Nolan – Yes
Councillor Simmons – Absent
Councillor Toner – Yes
Councillor Zondervan – Yes
Mayor Siddiqui – Yes

Yes – 8, No – 0, Absent – 1. Motion passed.

Attachments: Can be view on the finalized April 26, 2023 minutes

Presentation titled “Regulating Building Emissions via BEUDO: A Critical Step Towards Net Zero Cambridge.”

Proposed Amendments from Mayor Siddiqui, Councillor Zondervan, and Councillor Nolan.

Presentation titled “Comment on Community Development Department (CDD) Amendment.”

Presentation titled “Emissions Analysis.”

Q&A from CDD following April 12, 2023 Ordinance Committee Hearing

Memorandum from CDD on Carbon Offsets

Amendment to proposed Amendment #2, Councillor Azeem, Adopted

Amendment to proposed Amendment #1, Vice Mayor Mallon, Adopted

Amendments/Chart, Adopted as Amended

The City Clerk’s Office received one hundred and twelve written communications for the meeting on April 12, 2023 and an additional sixty two communications for the continuation on April 26, 2023.

Clerk’s Note: The City of Cambridge/22 City View records every City Council meeting and every City Council Committee meeting. This is a permanent record.

The meeting held and recessed on April 12, 2023 can be viewed at:

https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/482?view_id=1&redirect=true&h=cdb092347a4b11ac7f47d1cbd146345f

The meeting continuation held on April 26, 2023 can be viewed at:

https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/490?view_id=1&redirect=true&h=30fc90777cafb81cee5c5275d01f3c50

Ordinance #2021-26 A communication transmitted from Louis A. DePasquale, City Manager, relative to Awaiting Report Item Number 21-84 regarding BEUDO (Building Energy Use Disclosure Ordinance) proposed amendments.

A communication was received from Assistant City Manager for Community Development, Community Development Iram Farooq, transmitting a presentation regarding Regulating Building Emissions via BEUDO: A Critical Step Towards Net Zero Cambridge.

A communication was received from Assistant City Manager for Community Development, Community Development Iram Farooq, transmitting a presentation regarding BUEDO Options Summary Proposed April 12, 2023.