

System: You are being used to help researchers perform a scoping review. You are not interacting directly with a user.

A scoping review is a type of systematic review used to map the published scholarship on a topic. To gather relevant sources for a scoping review, the researchers search bibliographic databases for sources that match a selected Population, Concept, and Context (the inclusion criteria). The titles and abstracts of sources that are found in this search search are then screened against the inclusion criteria.

Your task is to screen a single source against the inclusion criteria. You will be provided with the review objective and inclusion criteria, and then you will then be provided with the source title and abstract. You will then be instructed to work step by step through the process of comparing the source against the inclusion criteria. Finally, you will instructed to make a recommendation on whether the source should be included.

The next message will be from the user, and will contain the scoping review objective and inclusion criteria.

User: OBJECTIVE: This scoping review will examine the existing primary research on the role of therapy alpacas in enhancing the mental health and emotional well-being of elderly residential aged care facility residents

POPULATION: Elderly people living in residential aged care facilities. ‘Elderly’ is defined as 65 years of age or older.

CONTEXT: Residential aged care facilities that have used therapy alpacas as part of their programme of care for residents. ‘Residential aged care facility’ is defined as a residential setting intended as a long-term place of residence for elderly people which includes provision of support for activities of daily living (e.g. meal preparation, bathing, housekeeping) and nursing support (e.g. medication management). Such facilities will also typically offer other structured programmes and facilities to provide entertainment, diversion, and wellbeing. It excludes other residential settings intended for elderly people that do not provide daily living or nursing supports (e.g. independent living villages) or that are not long-term (e.g. hospitals or hospices).

CONCEPT: The impact of therapy alpaca programmes on stress reduction, emotional well-being, mental health, overall life satisfaction, or similar outcomes for residents.

System: Let’s work step by step. First, generate a numbered list of statements that summarise the inclusion criteria for the scoping review, including the Population, Concept, and Context. The statements should be clear, comprehensive and complete. Any source for which all the statements are true is a source that meets the inclusion criteria. As a template, here are some example statements (these are a generic set of examples that are not related to the current scoping review):

1. The source reports the results of a randomised control trial
2. The source reports the results of a study in which:
 - 2a. The participants were all male; AND
 - 2b. The participants were all aged between 18 and 74 inclusive
3. The source reports the results of a study conducted in the European Union.

Aspects of the inclusion criteria with multiple elements should be broken down into separate points where possible. For example, instead of:

1. The source reports on a study of men who live in the European Union.

You should instead say:

1. The source reports on a study of people who are:
 - 1a. Male; and
 - 1b. Living in the European Union.

GPT-4:

1. The source includes primary research conducted on elderly people 1a. ‘Elderly’ is defined as 65 years or older.
2. The elderly people in the source reside in a residential aged care facilities
 - 2a. ‘Residential aged care facility’ is a long-term residence for elderly people providing support for activities of daily living and nursing support.
 - 2b. The facility offers structured programmes and facilities for entertainment, diversion, and well-being.
 - 2c. The facility does not include residential settings that do not provide daily living support or nursing support, or that are not for long-term residence.
3. The residential aged care facilities mentioned in the source have implemented therapy alpaca programs as part of their care for residents.
4. The source examines the impact of therapy alpaca programmes
 - 4a. The impact examined includes effects on stress reduction, emotional well-being, mental health, overall life satisfaction, or similar outcomes for residents.

System: The next message will be from the user, and will contain the title and abstract of a source to be compared against the inclusion criteria.

User: TITLE: Therapy Ungulate Visits Reduce Depression, Anxiety, and Stress in Australian Nursing Home Residents

ABSTRACT: Nursing home residents typically have rates of depression, anxiety, and stress (DAS) significantly higher than those of equivalent populations living independently. As well as reducing quality of life and increasing morbidity and mortality, DAS significantly increases the burden on both nursing homes and health systems in caring for the elderly. Recent pilot trials of the use of therapy ungulates (alpacas, llamas, and camels) have shown promising initial results in reducing DAS among nursing home residents. We conducted a randomised control trial involving 8,124 residents across 17 nursing homes in urban and rural Australia in which residents were randomised to either a weekly 2-hour therapy camel visit or equivalent time in a television viewing lounge. Residents receiving the intervention had significantly ($p < 0.01$) reduced levels of depression (mean DASS-21 score for depression reduction 8.2 points), anxiety (mean reduction 11 points) and stress (mean reduction 13 points) compared to the control arm. This study represents the first large-scale randomised trial of ungulate therapy for nursing home residents, and provides strong support for its effectiveness in reducing DAS.

System: Let’s continue to work step by step. Refer back to the set of statements you developed summarising the inclusion criteria. For each statement, decide whether or not the statement is true for the source described by the title and abstract. You must select from the following permitted responses: TRUE, FALSE, LIKELY TRUE, LIKELY FALSE, or NOT APPLICABLE. No other response is permitted. It is normal for the title and abstract to not have enough information to make a clear decision for every statement. There is a natural and normal amount of ambiguity in this process. For these situations, give your best guess, making use of your general knowledge, and deciding LIKELY TRUE or LIKELY FALSE. Responses like UNCLEAR or NOT ENOUGH INFORMATION are not permitted. After giving your response, give a one sentence explanation for your response.

GPT-4:

1. The source includes primary research conducted on elderly people. - LIKELY TRUE: While the age of the nursing home residents is not explicitly stated, it can be reasonably inferred that they are likely to be elderly. - Explanation: ‘Nursing home residents’ are generally senior individuals.
 - 1a. ‘Elderly’ is defined as 65 years or older. - LIKELY TRUE: Although the abstract does not explicitly define an age for “elderly”, it is common understanding that elderly often refers to individuals who are 65 years or older. - Explanation: Although not explicit, the elderly population in most research is usually referred to those aged 65 or more.
2. The elderly people in the source reside in a residential aged care facilities. - TRUE: The residents are shown to live in nursing homes, which qualifies as a type of residential aged care facility. - Explanation: Nursing homes are a type of residential aged care facility.
 - 2a. ‘Residential aged care facility’ is a long-term residence for elderly people providing support for activities of daily living and nursing support. - LIKELY TRUE: Although not specifically mentioned in the abstract, it is understood that nursing homes facilitate activities of daily living and nursing support for the elderly. - Explanation: It is widely known that nursing homes provide support for activities of daily living and nursing care.
 - 2b. The facility offers structured programmes and facilities for entertainment, diversion, and well-being. - TRUE: The abstract mentions pilot trials of therapy ungulates, suggesting the presence of structured programmes at the facility. - Explanation: The implementation of therapy ungulate trials indicates the existence of structured programs for the residents’ well-being.
 - 2c. The facility does not include residential settings that do not provide daily living support or nursing support, or that are not for long-term residence. - LIKELY TRUE: Although not explicitly stated, nursing homes generally provide both daily living support and nursing care, and are meant for long-term residence of the elderly. - Explanation: As part of their operations, nursing homes generally provide these forms of supports and cater to long-term residents.
3. The residential aged care facilities mentioned in the source have implemented therapy alpaca programmes as part of their care for residents. - TRUE: The abstract mentions the use of therapy ungulates, which includes alpacas, as part of their program. - Explanation: The abstract identifies therapy ungulates, including alpacas, being utilized in the nursing home.
4. The source examines the impact of therapy alpaca programmes. - FALSE: Although the abstract mentions the use of therapy ungulates, it specifically mentions the use of therapy camels in the trial, not alpacas. - Explanation: The abstract does not mention the specific effects of therapy alpaca programs, but rather, the therapy camel program.
 - 4a. The impact examined includes effects on stress reduction, emotional well-being, mental health, overall life satisfaction, or similar outcomes for residents. - TRUE: The study indeed examines the impact on stress, depression, and anxiety in the nursing home residents. - Explanation: The abstract mentions that the study measures impact on stress reduction, depression, and anxiety, which can be seen as elements of mental health and emotional well-being.

System: Let’s continue to work step by step. Consider your decisions on whether the title and abstract meet the conclusion criteria. Overall, is it likely true that the source meets the inclusion criteria? Reply with a single word, either INCLUDE or EXCLUDE, representing your recommendation on whether the source is likely to meet the inclusion criteria. You must reply with a single word only and it must be one of these two words; any other reply will cause the automatic parsing of your response to fail, which will be troublesome for the user.

GPT-4: EXCLUDE