

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
Preliminary Statement	1
Questions Presented	2
Statement	2
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT	12
ARGUMENT:	
POINT I—The District Court Lacks Jurisdiction Over The Proper Respondent To The Amended Habeas Petition	15
A. The Proper Respondent To The Amended Petition Is Padilla’s Immediate Custodian, Commander Marr, Not Secretary Rumsfeld . . .	15
B. The District Court’s Territorial Jurisdiction Does Not Reach Either Padilla’s Immediate Custodian Or His Ultimate Custodian	25
POINT II—Attorney Newman Lacks Standing As A “Next Friend” To Bring The Amended Petition On Padilla’s Behalf	32
POINT III—The District Court Erred In Ordering The Military To Permit A Detained Enemy Combatant To Meet And Confer With Counsel	36
A. Padilla Has No Entitlement Under Law To Meet With Counsel To Challenge The De- termination That He Is An Enemy Combat- ant	37

1. Neither The Laws Of War Nor The Constitution Grants An Enemy Combatant A Right To Counsel To Contest His War-time Detention	37
2. The Habeas Statutes Do Not Afford Padilla A Free-Standing Entitlement To Raise A Factual Challenge To His Detention	40
B. There Is No Basis For Granting Access To Counsel Under The Constitutionally Appropriate Standard Of Review	44
C. Requiring Access To Counsel Would Compromise The Military's Efforts To Obtain Vital Intelligence	50
D. The President's Determination That Padilla Is An Enemy Combatant Is Entitled To Be Given Effect In This Proceeding	53
CONCLUSION	56

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases:

<i>Able v. United States</i> , 155 F.3d 628 (2d Cir. 1998)	44
<i>Ahrens v. Clark</i> , 335 U.S. 188 (1948)	29, 30
<i>Billiteri v. United States Bd. of Parole</i> , 541 F.2d 938 (2d Cir. 1976)	12, 17-18, 20, 23-24
<i>Braden v. 30th Judicial Circuit Court</i> , 410 U.S. 484 (1973)	17, 29
<i>Burns v. Wilson</i> , 346 U.S. 137 (1953)	42
<i>CIA v. Sims</i> , 471 U.S. 159 (1985)	52
<i>Carbo v. United States</i> , 364 U.S. 611 (1961)	25
<i>Center for Nat'l Sec'y v. U.S. Dep't of Justice</i> , 331 F.3d 918 (D.C. Cir. 2003)	46
<i>Chavez v. Martinez</i> , 123 S. Ct. 1994 (2003)	40
<i>Coalition of Clergy, Lawyers, & Professors v. Bush</i> , 310 F.3d 1153 (9th Cir. 2002), cert. denied, 123 S. Ct. 2073 (2003)	32, 33
<i>In re Cockrum</i> , 867 F. Supp. 494 (E.D. Tex. 1994)	35
<i>Demjanjuk v. Meese</i> , 784 F.2d 1114 (D.C. Cir. 1986)	23

<i>Dunne v. Henman</i> , 875 F.2d 244 (9th Cir. 1989)	31
<i>Eisel v. Secretary of the Army</i> , 477 F.2d 1251 (D.C. Cir. 1973)	21
<i>Ford v. Haley</i> , 195 F.3d 603 (11th Cir. 1999)	34
<i>Guerra v. Meese</i> , 786 F.2d 414 (D.C. Cir. 1986)	24, 29
<i>Hamdi v. Rumsfeld</i> , 294 F.3d 598 (4th Cir. 2002)	32, 33, 35
<i>Hamdi v. Rumsfeld</i> , 296 F.3d 278 (4th Cir. 2002)	46, 48
<i>Hamdi v. Rumsfeld</i> , 316 F.3d 450 (4th Cir. 2003)	38, 39, 42-43, 45, 46-47, 52
<i>In re Hanserd</i> , 123 F.3d 922 (6th Cir. 1997)	17
<i>Harris v. Nelson</i> , 394 U.S. 286 (1969)	31
<i>Ex parte Hayes</i> , 414 U.S. 1327 (1973)	23
<i>In re Heidnik</i> , 112 F.3d 105 (3d Cir. 1997)	34, 44
<i>Henderson v. INS</i> , 157 F.3d 106 (2d Cir. 1998), cert. denied, 526 U.S. 1004 (1999)	19, 21-22, 23, 29
<i>Herrera v. Collins</i> , 506 U.S. 390 (1993)	40
<i>Hirota v. MacArthur</i> , 338 U.S. 197 (1949)	45
<i>Jones v. Biddle</i> , 131 F.2d 853 (8th	

Cir. 1942)	16, 17, 24
<i>Lee v. United States</i> , 501 F.2d 494 (8th Cir. 1974)	30
<i>Ludecke v. Watkins</i> , 335 U.S. 160 (1948)	54
<i>Malone v. Calderon</i> , 165 F.3d 1234 (9th Cir. 1999)	25
<i>Middendorf v. Henry</i> , 425 U.S. 25 (1976)	39
<i>Miller v. Stewart</i> , 231 F.3d 1248 (9th Cir.), stay vacated, 531 U.S. 986 (2000)	34
<i>Miranda v. Arizona</i> , 384 U.S. 436 (1966)	39
<i>Monk v. Secretary of the Navy</i> , 793 F.2d 364 (D.C. Cir. 1986)	18-19, 25-26
<i>Moyer v. Peabody</i> , 212 U.S. 78 (1909)	48
<i>Padilla v. Bush</i> , 233 F. Supp. 2d 564 (S.D.N.Y. 2002)	<i>passim</i>
<i>Padilla v. Rumsfeld</i> , 243 F. Supp. 2d 42 (S.D.N.Y. 2003)	1, 10, 46, 47, 48, 49, 52
<i>Padilla v. Rumsfeld</i> , 256 F. Supp. 2d 218 (S.D.N.Y. 2003)	1, 11, 33
<i>Ex parte Quirin</i> , 317 U.S. 1 (1942)	40
<i>Samirah v. O'Connell</i> , No. 03-1786, 2003 WL 21507968 (7th Cir. July 2, 2003)	23
<i>Sanders v. Bennett</i> , 148 F.2d 19 (D.C. Cir. 1945)	17

<i>Schlanger v. Seamans</i> , 401 U.S. 487 (1971)	13, 26, 29, 31
<i>Schornhorst v. Anderson</i> , 77 F. Supp. 2d 944 (S.D. Ind. 1999)	34
<i>Smith v. Armontrout</i> , 812 F.2d 1050 (8th Cir.), cert. denied, 483 U.S. 1033 (1987)	34
<i>Snepp v. United States</i> , 444 U.S. 507 (1980)	50
<i>State v. Miller</i> , 921 P.2d 1151 (Ariz. 1996), cert. denied, 519 U.S. 1152 (1997)	34
<i>Steel Co. v. Citizens for a Better Env't</i> , 523 U.S. 83 (1998)	32
<i>Strait v. Laird</i> , 406 U.S. 341 (1972)	21, 30
<i>Superintendent v. Hill</i> , 472 U.S. 445 (1985)	47-48
<i>In re Territo</i> , 156 F.2d 142 (9th Cir. 1946)	39
<i>Texas v. Cobb</i> , 532 U.S. 162 (2001)	39
<i>United States ex rel. Sero v. Preiser</i> , 506 F.2d 1115 (2d Cir. 1974), cert. denied, 421 U.S. 921 (1975)	28, 29
<i>United States v. International Bhd. of Teamsters</i> , 266 F.3d 45 (2d Cir. 2001)	41
<i>United States v. Marchetti</i> , 466 F.2d 1309 (4th Cir.), cert. denied, 409 U.S. 1063 (1972)	50
<i>United States v. Salerno</i> , 481 U.S. 739 (1987)	48

<i>United States v. Verdugo-Urquidez</i> , 494 U.S. 259 (1990)	40
<i>Vargas v. Lambert</i> , 159 F.3d 1161 (9th Cir.), stay vacated, 525 U.S. 925 (1998)	34
<i>Vasquez v. Reno</i> , 233 F.3d 688 (1st Cir. 2000), cert. denied, 534 U.S. 816 (2001)	16, 17, 21, 22, 24, 30
<i>Wales v. Whitney</i> , 114 U.S. 564 (1885)	16, 24
<i>Walker v. Johnston</i> , 312 U.S. 275 (1941)	41
<i>Whitmore v. Arkansas</i> , 495 U.S. 149 (1990)	13, 32, 33, 44
<i>Wright v. United States Bd. of Parole</i> , 557 F.2d 74 (6th Cir. 1977)	26
<i>Yamaha Motor Corp. v. Calhoun</i> , 516 U.S. 199 (1996)	33
<i>Yi v. Maugans</i> , 24 F.3d 500 (3d Cir. 1994)	17
<i>Statutes and Rules:</i>	
18 U.S.C. § 1385	7
28 U.S.C. § 1292(b)	2, 10
28 U.S.C. § 1391(e)	31
28 U.S.C. § 1404(a)	28
28 U.S.C. § 1651(a)	9, 41, 45

28 U.S.C. § 2241	1, 13, 25, 27, 28, 30
28 U.S.C. § 2242	16, 27, 32
28 U.S.C. § 2243	16, 24, 41
28 U.S.C. § 2246	41
Authorization for Use of Military Force, Pub. L. No. 107-40, 115 Stat. 224 (2001)	3
Fed. R. App. P. 22(a)	28
Fed. R. Civ. P. 4(e)(1), 4(k)(1)(A)	31
Fed. R. Civ. P. 82	31
U.S. Const. amend. VI	39
75 Cong. Globe, 39th Cong., 2d Sess. 790 (1867) (Sen. Trumbull)	25, 27