

First-Order Logic

Shiwali Mohan

Computer Science and Engineering
University of Michigan

May 25, 2012

Outline

- ① Translation
- ② Unification
- ③ CNF conversion
- ④ FOL Resolution

Translate the following sentences

- Every gardener likes the sun.

Translate the following sentences

- Every gardener likes the sun.
 - $\forall x. \text{gardener}(x) \Rightarrow \text{likes}(x, \text{Sun})$

Translate the following sentences

- Every gardener likes the sun.
 - $\forall x. \text{gardener}(x) \Rightarrow \text{likes}(x, \text{Sun})$
- You can fool some of the people all of the time.

Translate the following sentences

- Every gardener likes the sun.
 - $\forall x. \text{gardener}(x) \Rightarrow \text{likes}(x, \text{Sun})$
- You can fool some of the people all of the time.
 - $\exists x. (\text{person}(x) \wedge \forall t. (\text{time}(t) \Rightarrow \text{can-fool}(x, t)))$

Translate the following sentences

- Every gardener likes the sun.
 - $\forall x. \text{gardener}(x) \Rightarrow \text{likes}(x, \text{Sun})$
- You can fool some of the people all of the time.
 - $\exists x. (\text{person}(x) \wedge \forall t. (\text{time}(t) \Rightarrow \text{can-fool}(x, t)))$
- You can fool all of the people some of the time.

Translate the following sentences

- Every gardener likes the sun.
 - $\forall x. \text{gardener}(x) \Rightarrow \text{likes}(x, \text{Sun})$
- You can fool some of the people all of the time.
 - $\exists x. (\text{person}(x) \wedge \forall t. (\text{time}(t) \Rightarrow \text{can-fool}(x, t)))$
- You can fool all of the people some of the time.
 - $\forall x. (\text{person}(x) \Rightarrow \exists t. (\text{time}(t) \wedge \text{can-fool}(x, t)))$

Translate the following sentences

- Every gardener likes the sun.
 - $\forall x. \text{gardener}(x) \Rightarrow \text{likes}(x, \text{Sun})$
- You can fool some of the people all of the time.
 - $\exists x. (\text{person}(x) \wedge \forall t. (\text{time}(t) \Rightarrow \text{can-fool}(x, t)))$
- You can fool all of the people some of the time.
 - $\forall x. (\text{person}(x) \Rightarrow \exists t. (\text{time}(t) \wedge \text{can-fool}(x, t)))$
- All purple mushrooms are poisonous.

Translate the following sentences

- Every gardener likes the sun.
 - $\forall x. \text{gardener}(x) \Rightarrow \text{likes}(x, \text{Sun})$
- You can fool some of the people all of the time.
 - $\exists x. (\text{person}(x) \wedge \forall t. (\text{time}(t) \Rightarrow \text{can-fool}(x, t)))$
- You can fool all of the people some of the time.
 - $\forall x. (\text{person}(x) \Rightarrow \exists t. (\text{time}(t) \wedge \text{can-fool}(x, t)))$
- All purple mushrooms are poisonous.
 - $\forall x. (\text{mushroom}(x) \wedge \text{purple}(x)) \Rightarrow \text{poisonous}(x)$

Translate the following sentences

- Every gardener likes the sun.
 - $\forall x. \text{gardener}(x) \Rightarrow \text{likes}(x, \text{Sun})$
- You can fool some of the people all of the time.
 - $\exists x. (\text{person}(x) \wedge \forall t. (\text{time}(t) \Rightarrow \text{can-fool}(x, t)))$
- You can fool all of the people some of the time.
 - $\forall x. (\text{person}(x) \Rightarrow \exists t. (\text{time}(t) \wedge \text{can-fool}(x, t)))$
- All purple mushrooms are poisonous.
 - $\forall x. (\text{mushroom}(x) \wedge \text{purple}(x)) \Rightarrow \text{poisonous}(x)$
- There are exactly two purple mushrooms.

Translate the following sentences

- Every gardener likes the sun.
 - $\forall x. \text{gardener}(x) \Rightarrow \text{likes}(x, \text{Sun})$
- You can fool some of the people all of the time.
 - $\exists x. (\text{person}(x) \wedge \forall t. (\text{time}(t) \Rightarrow \text{can-fool}(x, t)))$
- You can fool all of the people some of the time.
 - $\forall x. (\text{person}(x) \Rightarrow \exists t. (\text{time}(t) \wedge \text{can-fool}(x, t)))$
- All purple mushrooms are poisonous.
 - $\forall x. (\text{mushroom}(x) \wedge \text{purple}(x)) \Rightarrow \text{poisonous}(x)$
- There are exactly two purple mushrooms.
 - $(\exists x. \exists y. \text{mushroom}(x) \wedge \text{purple}(x) \wedge \text{mushroom}(y) \wedge \text{purple}(y) \wedge \neg(x=y)) \wedge (\forall z. (\text{mushroom}(z) \wedge \text{purple}(z)) \Rightarrow ((x=z) \vee (y=z)))$

Determine a valid substitution

- $\text{parents}(x, \text{father}(x), \text{mother}(\text{Bill})); \text{parents}(\text{Bill}, \text{father}(\text{Bill}), y)$

Determine a valid substitution

- $\text{parents}(x, \text{father}(x), \text{mother}(\text{Bill})); \text{parents}(\text{Bill}, \text{father}(\text{Bill}), y)$
 - $\{x/\text{Bill}, y/\text{mother}(\text{Bill})\}$

Determine a valid substitution

- $\text{parents}(x, \text{father}(x), \text{mother}(\text{Bill})); \text{parents}(\text{Bill}, \text{father}(\text{Bill}), y)$
 - $\{x/\text{Bill}, y/\text{mother}(\text{Bill})\}$
- $\text{parents}(x, \text{father}(x), \text{mother}(\text{Bill})); \text{parents}(\text{Bill}, \text{father}(y), z)$

Determine a valid substitution

- $\text{parents}(x, \text{father}(x), \text{mother}(\text{Bill})); \text{parents}(\text{Bill}, \text{father}(\text{Bill}), y)$
 - $\{x/\text{Bill}, y/\text{mother}(\text{Bill})\}$
- $\text{parents}(x, \text{father}(x), \text{mother}(\text{Bill})); \text{parents}(\text{Bill}, \text{father}(y), z)$
 - $\{x/\text{Bill}, y/\text{Bill}, z/\text{mother}(\text{Bill})\}$

Determine a valid substitution

- $\text{parents}(x, \text{father}(x), \text{mother}(\text{Bill})); \text{parents}(\text{Bill}, \text{father}(\text{Bill}), y)$
 - $\{x/\text{Bill}, y/\text{mother}(\text{Bill})\}$
- $\text{parents}(x, \text{father}(x), \text{mother}(\text{Bill})); \text{parents}(\text{Bill}, \text{father}(y), z)$
 - $\{x/\text{Bill}, y/\text{Bill}, z/\text{mother}(\text{Bill})\}$
- $\text{parents}(x, \text{father}(x), \text{mother}(\text{Jane})); \text{parents}(\text{Bill}, \text{father}(y), \text{mother}(y))$

Determine a valid substitution

- $\text{parents}(x, \text{father}(x), \text{mother}(\text{Bill})); \text{parents}(\text{Bill}, \text{father}(\text{Bill}), y)$
 - $\{x/\text{Bill}, y/\text{mother}(\text{Bill})\}$
- $\text{parents}(x, \text{father}(x), \text{mother}(\text{Bill})); \text{parents}(\text{Bill}, \text{father}(y), z)$
 - $\{x/\text{Bill}, y/\text{Bill}, z/\text{mother}(\text{Bill})\}$
- $\text{parents}(x, \text{father}(x), \text{mother}(\text{Jane})); \text{parents}(\text{Bill}, \text{father}(y), \text{mother}(y))$
 - Failure

Convert to CNF

$$\forall x.(P(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y.(P(y) \Rightarrow P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(Q(x,y) \Rightarrow P(y))))$$

Convert to CNF

$\forall x.(P(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y.(P(y) \Rightarrow P(f(x,y)))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(Q(x,y) \Rightarrow P(y)))$

- Eliminate implication

Convert to CNF

$\forall x.(P(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y.(P(y) \Rightarrow P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(Q(x,y) \Rightarrow P(y))))$

- Eliminate implication

- $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(\neg Q(x,y) \vee P(y))))$

Convert to CNF

$$\forall x.(P(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y.(P(y) \Rightarrow P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(Q(x,y) \Rightarrow P(y))))$$

- Eliminate implication
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(\neg Q(x,y) \vee P(y))))$
- Move - inwards

Convert to CNF

$$\forall x.(P(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y.(P(y) \Rightarrow P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(Q(x,y) \Rightarrow P(y))))$$

- Eliminate implication

- $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(\neg Q(x,y) \vee P(y))))$

- Move - inwards

- $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists y.(Q(x,y) \wedge \neg P(y))))$

Convert to CNF

$$\forall x.(P(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y.(P(y) \Rightarrow P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(Q(x,y) \Rightarrow P(y))))$$

- Eliminate implication
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(\neg Q(x,y) \vee P(y))))$
- Move - inwards
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists y.(Q(x,y) \wedge \neg P(y))))$
- Standardize Variables

Convert to CNF

$$\forall x.(P(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y.(P(y) \Rightarrow P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(Q(x,y) \Rightarrow P(y))))$$

- Eliminate implication
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(\neg Q(x,y) \vee P(y))))$
- Move - inwards
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists y.(Q(x,y) \wedge \neg P(y))))$
- Standardize Variables
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists z.(Q(x,z) \wedge \neg P(z))))$

Convert to CNF

$$\forall x.(P(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y.(P(y) \Rightarrow P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(Q(x,y) \Rightarrow P(y))))$$

- Eliminate implication
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(\neg Q(x,y) \vee P(y))))$
- Move - inwards
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists y.(Q(x,y) \wedge \neg P(y))))$
- Standardize Variables
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists z.(Q(x,z) \wedge \neg P(z))))$
- Skolemize

Convert to CNF

$$\forall x.(P(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y.(P(y) \Rightarrow P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(Q(x,y) \Rightarrow P(y))))$$

- Eliminate implication
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(\neg Q(x,y) \vee P(y))))$
- Move - inwards
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists y.(Q(x,y) \wedge \neg P(y))))$
- Standardize Variables
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists z.(Q(x,z) \wedge \neg P(z))))$
- Skolemize
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (Q(x,g(x)) \wedge \neg P(g(x)))))$

Convert to CNF

$$\forall x.(P(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y.(P(y) \Rightarrow P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(Q(x,y) \Rightarrow P(y))))$$

- Eliminate implication
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(\neg Q(x,y) \vee P(y))))$
- Move - inwards
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists y.(Q(x,y) \wedge \neg P(y))))$
- Standardize Variables
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists z.(Q(x,z) \wedge \neg P(z))))$
- Skolemize
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (Q(x,g(x)) \wedge \neg P(g(x)))))$
- Drop universal

Convert to CNF

$$\forall x.(P(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y.(P(y) \Rightarrow P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(Q(x,y) \Rightarrow P(y))))$$

- Eliminate implication
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(\neg Q(x,y) \vee P(y))))$
- Move - inwards
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists y.(Q(x,y) \wedge \neg P(y))))$
- Standardize Variables
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists z.(Q(x,z) \wedge \neg P(z))))$
- Skolemize
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (Q(x,g(x)) \wedge \neg P(g(x)))))$
- Drop universal
 - $(\neg P(x) \vee ((\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (Q(x,g(x)) \wedge \neg P(g(x)))))$

Convert to CNF

$$\forall x.(P(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y.(P(y) \Rightarrow P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(Q(x,y) \Rightarrow P(y))))$$

- Eliminate implication
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(\neg Q(x,y) \vee P(y))))$
- Move - inwards
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists y.(Q(x,y) \wedge \neg P(y))))$
- Standardize Variables
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists z.(Q(x,z) \wedge \neg P(z))))$
- Skolemize
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (Q(x,g(x)) \wedge \neg P(g(x)))))$
- Drop universal
 - $(\neg P(x) \vee ((\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (Q(x,g(x)) \wedge \neg P(g(x)))))$
- Distribute 'or' over 'and'

Convert to CNF

$$\forall x.(P(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y.(P(y) \Rightarrow P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(Q(x,y) \Rightarrow P(y))))$$

- Eliminate implication
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(\neg Q(x,y) \vee P(y))))$
- Move - inwards
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists y.(Q(x,y) \wedge \neg P(y))))$
- Standardize Variables
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists z.(Q(x,z) \wedge \neg P(z))))$
- Skolemize
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (Q(x,g(x)) \wedge \neg P(g(x)))))$
- Drop universal
 - $(\neg P(x) \vee ((\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (Q(x,g(x)) \wedge \neg P(g(x)))))$
- Distribute 'or' over 'and'
 - $(\neg P(x) \vee \neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (\neg P(x) \vee Q(x,g(x))) \wedge (\neg P(x) \vee \neg P(g(x)))$

Convert to CNF

$$\forall x.(P(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y.(P(y) \Rightarrow P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(Q(x,y) \Rightarrow P(y))))$$

- Eliminate implication
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(\neg Q(x,y) \vee P(y))))$
- Move - inwards
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists y.(Q(x,y) \wedge \neg P(y))))$
- Standardize Variables
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists z.(Q(x,z) \wedge \neg P(z))))$
- Skolemize
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (Q(x,g(x)) \wedge \neg P(g(x)))))$
- Drop universal
 - $(\neg P(x) \vee ((\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (Q(x,g(x)) \wedge \neg P(g(x)))))$
- Distribute 'or' over 'and'
 - $(\neg P(x) \vee \neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (\neg P(x) \vee Q(x,g(x))) \wedge (\neg P(x) \vee \neg P(g(x)))$
- Create separate clauses

Convert to CNF

$$\forall x.(P(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y.(P(y) \Rightarrow P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(Q(x,y) \Rightarrow P(y))))$$

- Eliminate implication
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(\neg Q(x,y) \vee P(y))))$
- Move - inwards
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists y.(Q(x,y) \wedge \neg P(y))))$
- Standardize Variables
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists z.(Q(x,z) \wedge \neg P(z))))$
- Skolemize
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (Q(x,g(x)) \wedge \neg P(g(x)))))$
- Drop universal
 - $(\neg P(x) \vee ((\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (Q(x,g(x)) \wedge \neg P(g(x)))))$
- Distribute 'or' over 'and'
 - $(\neg P(x) \vee \neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (\neg P(x) \vee Q(x,g(x))) \wedge (\neg P(x) \vee \neg P(g(x)))$
- Create separate clauses
 - $\neg P(x) \vee \neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))$
 - $\neg P(x) \vee Q(x,g(x))$
 - $\neg P(x) \vee \neg P(g(x))$

Convert to CNF

$$\forall x.(P(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y.(P(y) \Rightarrow P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(Q(x,y) \Rightarrow P(y))))$$

- Eliminate implication
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \neg \forall y.(\neg Q(x,y) \vee P(y))))$
- Move - inwards
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists y.(Q(x,y) \wedge \neg P(y))))$
- Standardize Variables
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge \exists z.(Q(x,z) \wedge \neg P(z))))$
- Skolemize
 - $\forall x.(\neg P(x) \vee (\forall y.(\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (Q(x,g(x)) \wedge \neg P(g(x)))))$
- Drop universal
 - $(\neg P(x) \vee ((\neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (Q(x,g(x)) \wedge \neg P(g(x)))))$
- Distribute 'or' over 'and'
 - $(\neg P(x) \vee \neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))) \wedge (\neg P(x) \vee Q(x,g(x))) \wedge (\neg P(x) \vee \neg P(g(x)))$
- Create separate clauses
 - $\neg P(x) \vee \neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))$
 - $\neg P(x) \vee Q(x,g(x))$
 - $\neg P(x) \vee \neg P(g(x))$
- Standardize variables
 - $\neg P(x) \vee \neg P(y) \vee P(f(x,y))$
 - $\neg P(z) \vee Q(z,g(z))$
 - $\neg P(w) \vee \neg P(g(w))$

Resolution by Refutation

Knowledge Base:

Tony, Sam and Ellen belong to the Activity Club. Every member of the Activity Club is either a skier or a mountain climber or both. No mountain climber likes rain, and all skiers like snow. Ellen dislikes whatever Tony likes and likes everything that Tony dislikes. Tony likes rain and snow.

Question:

Which member of the Activity Club is a mountain climber but not a skier?

Translate to FOL Sentences

member(x) means x is a member of activity club, $S(x)$ means x is a skier, $M(x)$ means x is a mountain climber, and $L(x,y)$ means x likes y

- Every member of the Activity Club is either a skier or a mountain climber or both.
- No mountain climber likes rain
- All skiers like snow.
- Tony, Sam and Ellen belong to the Activity Club.
- Ellen dislikes whatever Tony likes and likes everything that Tony dislikes.
- Tony likes rain and snow.
- Which member of the Activity Club who is a mountain climber but not a skier?

Translate to FOL Sentences

member(x) means x is a member of activity club, S(x) means x is a skier, M(x) means x is a mountain climber, and L(x,y) means x likes y

- Every member of the Activity Club is either a skier or a mountain climber or both.
 - $\forall x. \text{member}(x) \Rightarrow (S(x) \vee M(x))$
- No mountain climber likes rain
- All skiers like snow.
- Tony, Sam and Ellen belong to the Activity Club.
- Ellen dislikes whatever Tony likes and likes everything that Tony dislikes.
- Tony likes rain and snow.
- Which member of the Activity Club who is a mountain climber but not a skier?

Translate to FOL Sentences

member(x) means x is a member of activity club, S(x) means x is a skier, M(x) means x is a mountain climber, and L(x,y) means x likes y

- Every member of the Activity Club is either a skier or a mountain climber or both.
 - $\forall x. \text{member}(x) \Rightarrow (S(x) \vee M(x))$
- No mountain climber likes rain
 - $\neg \exists x. M(x) \wedge L(x, \text{Rain})$
- All skiers like snow.
- Tony, Sam and Ellen belong to the Activity Club.
- Ellen dislikes whatever Tony likes and likes everything that Tony dislikes.
- Tony likes rain and snow.
- Which member of the Activity Club who is a mountain climber but not a skier?

Translate to FOL Sentences

member(x) means x is a member of activity club, S(x) means x is a skier, M(x) means x is a mountain climber, and L(x,y) means x likes y

- Every member of the Activity Club is either a skier or a mountain climber or both.
 - $\forall x. \text{member}(x) \Rightarrow (S(x) \vee M(x))$
- No mountain climber likes rain
 - $\neg \exists x. M(x) \wedge L(x, \text{Rain})$
- All skiers like snow.
 - $\forall x. S(x) \Rightarrow L(x, \text{Snow})$
- Tony, Sam and Ellen belong to the Activity Club.

- Ellen dislikes whatever Tony likes and likes everything that Tony dislikes.

- Tony likes rain and snow.

- Which member of the Activity Club who is a mountain climber but not a skier?

Translate to FOL Sentences

member(x) means x is a member of activity club, S(x) means x is a skier, M(x) means x is a mountain climber, and L(x,y) means x likes y

- Every member of the Activity Club is either a skier or a mountain climber or both.
 - $\forall x. \text{member}(x) \Rightarrow (S(x) \vee M(x))$
- No mountain climber likes rain
 - $\neg \exists x. M(x) \wedge L(x, \text{Rain})$
- All skiers like snow.
 - $\forall x. S(x) \Rightarrow L(x, \text{Snow})$
- Tony, Sam and Ellen belong to the Activity Club.
 - member(Tony)
 - member(Sam)
 - member(Ellen)
- Ellen dislikes whatever Tony likes and likes everything that Tony dislikes.
- Tony likes rain and snow.
- Which member of the Activity Club who is a mountain climber but not a skier?

Translate to FOL Sentences

member(x) means x is a member of activity club, S(x) means x is a skier, M(x) means x is a mountain climber, and L(x,y) means x likes y

- Every member of the Activity Club is either a skier or a mountain climber or both.
 - $\forall x. \text{member}(x) \Rightarrow (S(x) \vee M(x))$
- No mountain climber likes rain
 - $\neg \exists x. M(x) \wedge L(x, \text{Rain})$
- All skiers like snow.
 - $\forall x. S(x) \Rightarrow L(x, \text{Snow})$
- Tony, Sam and Ellen belong to the Activity Club.
 - member(Tony)
 - member(Sam)
 - member(Ellen)
- Ellen dislikes whatever Tony likes and likes everything that Tony dislikes.
 - $\forall y. L(\text{Ellen}, y) \Leftrightarrow \neg L(\text{Tony}, y)$
- Tony likes rain and snow.

- Which member of the Activity Club who is a mountain climber but not a skier?

Translate to FOL Sentences

member(x) means x is a member of activity club, S(x) means x is a skier, M(x) means x is a mountain climber, and L(x,y) means x likes y

- Every member of the Activity Club is either a skier or a mountain climber or both.
 - $\forall x. \text{member}(x) \Rightarrow (S(x) \vee M(x))$
- No mountain climber likes rain
 - $\neg \exists x. M(x) \wedge L(x, \text{Rain})$
- All skiers like snow.
 - $\forall x. S(x) \Rightarrow L(x, \text{Snow})$
- Tony, Sam and Ellen belong to the Activity Club.
 - member(Tony)
 - member(Sam)
 - member(Ellen)
- Ellen dislikes whatever Tony likes and likes everything that Tony dislikes.
 - $\forall y. L(\text{Ellen}, y) \Leftrightarrow \neg L(\text{Tony}, y)$
- Tony likes rain and snow.
 - L(Tony, Rain)
 - L(Tony, Snow)
- Which member of the Activity Club who is a mountain climber but not a skier?

Translate to FOL Sentences

member(x) means x is a member of activity club, S(x) means x is a skier, M(x) means x is a mountain climber, and L(x,y) means x likes y

- Every member of the Activity Club is either a skier or a mountain climber or both.
 - $\forall x. \text{member}(x) \Rightarrow (S(x) \vee M(x))$
- No mountain climber likes rain
 - $\neg \exists x. M(x) \wedge L(x, \text{Rain})$
- All skiers like snow.
 - $\forall x. S(x) \Rightarrow L(x, \text{Snow})$
- Tony, Sam and Ellen belong to the Activity Club.
 - member(Tony)
 - member(Sam)
 - member(Ellen)
- Ellen dislikes whatever Tony likes and likes everything that Tony dislikes.
 - $\forall y. L(\text{Ellen}, y) \Leftrightarrow \neg L(\text{Tony}, y)$
- Tony likes rain and snow.
 - L(Tony, Rain)
 - L(Tony, Snow)
- Which member of the Activity Club who is a mountain climber but not a skier?
 - Query $(\exists x. \text{member}(x) \wedge M(x) \wedge \neg S(x))$
 - Negation of the Query or Answer literal $(\neg \exists x. \text{member}(x) \wedge M(x) \wedge \neg S(x)) \vee \text{Ans}(x)$

CNF

$$\forall x. \text{member}(x) \Rightarrow S(x) \vee M(x)$$

$$\neg \exists x. M(x) \wedge L(x, \text{Rain})$$

$$\forall x. S(x) \Rightarrow L(x, \text{Snow})$$

$$\text{member}(\text{Tony})$$

$$\text{member}(\text{Sam})$$

$$\text{member}(\text{Ellen})$$

$$\forall y. L(\text{Ellen}, y) \Leftrightarrow \neg L(\text{Tony}, y)$$

$$L(\text{Tony}, \text{Rain})$$

$$L(\text{Tony}, \text{Snow})$$

$$(\neg \exists x. \text{member}(x) \wedge M(x) \wedge \neg S(x)) \vee \text{Ans}(x)$$

$$1. \neg \text{member}(x_1) \vee S(x_1) \vee M(x_1)$$

$$2. \neg M(x_2) \vee \neg L(x_2, \text{Rain})$$

$$3. \neg S(x_3) \vee L(x_3, \text{Snow})$$

$$4. \text{member}(\text{Tony})$$

$$5. \text{member}(\text{Sam})$$

$$6. \text{member}(\text{Ellen})$$

$$7. \neg L(\text{Tony}, x_4) \vee \neg L(\text{Ellen}, x_4)$$

$$8. L(\text{Tony}, x_5) \vee L(\text{Ellen}, x_5)$$

$$9. L(\text{Tony}, \text{Rain})$$

$$10. L(\text{Tony}, \text{Snow})$$

$$11. (\neg \text{member}(x_7) \vee \neg M(x_7)$$

$$\vee S(x_7) \vee \text{Ans}(x_7))$$

Resolution

- ① $\text{-member}(x1) \vee S(x1) \vee M(x1)$
- ② $\text{-M}(x2) \vee \text{-L}(x2, \text{Rain})$
- ③ $\text{-S}(x3) \vee L(x3, \text{Snow})$
- ④ $\text{member}(\text{Tony})$
- ⑤ $\text{member}(\text{Sam})$
- ⑥ $\text{member}(\text{Ellen})$
- ⑦ $\text{-L}(\text{Tony}, x4) \vee \text{-L}(\text{Ellen}, x4)$
- ⑧ $L(\text{Tony}, x5) \vee L(\text{Ellen}, x5)$
- ⑨ $L(\text{Tony}, \text{Rain})$
- ⑩ $L(\text{Tony}, \text{Snow})$
- ⑪ $(\text{-member}(x7) \vee \text{-M}(x7) \vee S(x7)) \vee \text{Ans}(x7)$

Resolution

- ① $\neg \text{member}(x1) \vee S(x1) \vee M(x1)$
- ② $\neg M(x2) \vee \neg L(x2, \text{Rain})$
- ③ $\neg S(x3) \vee L(x3, \text{Snow})$
- ④ $\text{member}(\text{Tony})$
- ⑤ $\text{member}(\text{Sam})$
- ⑥ $\text{member}(\text{Ellen})$
- ⑦ $\neg L(\text{Tony}, x4) \vee \neg L(\text{Ellen}, x4)$
- ⑧ $L(\text{Tony}, x5) \vee L(\text{Ellen}, x5)$
- ⑨ $L(\text{Tony}, \text{Rain})$
- ⑩ $L(\text{Tony}, \text{Snow})$
- ⑪ $(\neg \text{member}(x7) \vee \neg M(x7) \vee S(x7)) \vee \text{Ans}(x7)$
- ⑫ $S(x1) \vee (\neg \text{member}(x1) \vee \text{Ans}(x1))$ [11,1] {x7/x1}

Resolution

- ❶ $\text{-member}(x1) \vee S(x1) \vee M(x1)$
- ❷ $\text{-M}(x2) \vee \text{-L}(x2, \text{Rain})$
- ❸ $\text{-S}(x3) \vee L(x3, \text{Snow})$
- ❹ $\text{member}(\text{Tony})$
- ❺ $\text{member}(\text{Sam})$
- ❻ $\text{member}(\text{Ellen})$
- ❼ $\text{-L}(\text{Tony}, x4) \vee \text{-L}(\text{Ellen}, x4)$
- ❽ $L(\text{Tony}, x5) \vee L(\text{Ellen}, x5)$
- ❾ $L(\text{Tony}, \text{Rain})$
- ❿ $L(\text{Tony}, \text{Snow})$
- ⓫ $(\text{-member}(x7) \vee \text{-M}(x7) \vee S(x7)) \vee \text{Ans}(x7)$
- ⓬ $S(x1) \vee (\text{-member}(x1) \vee \text{Ans}(x1))$ [11,1] $\{x7/x1\}$
- ⓭ $L(x1, \text{Snow}) \vee (\text{-member}(x1) \vee \text{Ans}(x1))$ [12,3] $\{x3/x1\}$

Resolution

- ❶ $\neg \text{member}(x1) \vee S(x1) \vee M(x1)$
- ❷ $\neg M(x2) \vee \neg L(x2, \text{Rain})$
- ❸ $\neg S(x3) \vee L(x3, \text{Snow})$
- ❹ $\text{member}(\text{Tony})$
- ❺ $\text{member}(\text{Sam})$
- ❻ $\text{member}(\text{Ellen})$
- ❼ $\neg L(\text{Tony}, x4) \vee \neg L(\text{Ellen}, x4)$
- ❽ $L(\text{Tony}, x5) \vee L(\text{Ellen}, x5)$
- ❾ $L(\text{Tony}, \text{Rain})$
- ❿ $L(\text{Tony}, \text{Snow})$
- ⓫ $(\neg \text{member}(x7) \vee \neg M(x7) \vee S(x7)) \vee \text{Ans}(x7)$
- ⓬ $S(x1) \vee (\neg \text{member}(x1) \vee \text{Ans}(x1))$ [11,1] $\{x7/x1\}$
- ⓭ $L(x1, \text{Snow}) \vee (\neg \text{member}(x1) \vee \text{Ans}(x1))$ [12,3] $\{x3/x1\}$
- ⓮ $\neg L(\text{Tony}, \text{Snow}) \vee (\neg \text{member}(\text{Ellen}) \vee \text{Ans}(\text{Ellen}))$ [13,7] $\{x4/\text{Snow}, x1/\text{Ellen}\}$

Resolution

- ① $\text{-member}(x1) \vee S(x1) \vee M(x1)$
- ② $\text{-M}(x2) \vee \text{-L}(x2, \text{Rain})$
- ③ $\text{-S}(x3) \vee L(x3, \text{Snow})$
- ④ $\text{member}(\text{Tony})$
- ⑤ $\text{member}(\text{Sam})$
- ⑥ $\text{member}(\text{Ellen})$
- ⑦ $\text{-L}(\text{Tony}, x4) \vee \text{-L}(\text{Ellen}, x4)$
- ⑧ $L(\text{Tony}, x5) \vee L(\text{Ellen}, x5)$
- ⑨ $L(\text{Tony}, \text{Rain})$
- ⑩ $L(\text{Tony}, \text{Snow})$
- ⑪ $(\text{-member}(x7) \vee \text{-M}(x7) \vee S(x7)) \vee \text{Ans}(x7)$
- ⑫ $S(x1) \vee (\text{-member}(x1) \vee \text{Ans}(x1)) [11,1] \{x7/x1\}$
- ⑬ $L(x1, \text{Snow}) \vee (\text{-member}(x1) \vee \text{Ans}(x1)) [12,3] \{x3/x1\}$
- ⑭ $\text{-L}(\text{Tony}, \text{Snow}) \vee (\text{-member}(\text{Ellen}) \vee \text{Ans}(\text{Ellen})) [13,7] \{x4/\text{Snow}, x1/\text{Ellen}\}$
- ⑮ $\text{-member}(\text{Ellen}) \vee \text{Ans}(\text{Ellen}) [14,7] \{\}$

Resolution

- ① $\text{-member}(x1) \vee S(x1) \vee M(x1)$
- ② $\text{-M}(x2) \vee \text{-L}(x2, \text{Rain})$
- ③ $\text{-S}(x3) \vee L(x3, \text{Snow})$
- ④ $\text{member}(\text{Tony})$
- ⑤ $\text{member}(\text{Sam})$
- ⑥ $\text{member}(\text{Ellen})$
- ⑦ $\text{-L}(\text{Tony}, x4) \vee \text{-L}(\text{Ellen}, x4)$
- ⑧ $L(\text{Tony}, x5) \vee L(\text{Ellen}, x5)$
- ⑨ $L(\text{Tony}, \text{Rain})$
- ⑩ $L(\text{Tony}, \text{Snow})$
- ⑪ $(\text{-member}(x7) \vee \text{-M}(x7) \vee S(x7)) \vee \text{Ans}(x7)$
- ⑫ $S(x1) \vee (\text{-member}(x1) \vee \text{Ans}(x1))$ [11,1] $\{x7/x1\}$
- ⑬ $L(x1, \text{Snow}) \vee (\text{-member}(x1) \vee \text{Ans}(x1))$ [12,3] $\{x3/x1\}$
- ⑭ $\text{-L}(\text{Tony}, \text{Snow}) \vee (\text{-member}(\text{Ellen}) \vee \text{Ans}(\text{Ellen}))$ [13,7] $\{x4/\text{Snow}, x1/\text{Ellen}\}$
- ⑮ $\text{-member}(\text{Ellen}) \vee \text{Ans}(\text{Ellen})$ [14,7] $\{\}$
- ⑯ $\text{Ans}(\text{Ellen})$ [15,6] $\{\}$